



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Bill Dodd, Chair
Napa County and Cities

Scott Haggerty, Vice Chair
Alameda County

Tom Ammiano
City and County of San Francisco

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Bob Blanchard
Sonoma County and Cities

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Sperring
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Amy Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director,
Bay Area Toll Authority

Therese W. McMillan
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

MINORITY CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Minutes – January 8, 2008

Attendance

The meeting was called to order at 3:40 p.m. by Vice Chair Michael Rubiano. Those in attendance were Vice Chair Michael Rubiano and Darnell Turner of Contra Costa County; Vice Chair James McGhee and Harvey Louie of San Francisco; Jacquee Castain, Carlos Castellanos and Homira Shafaq of Alameda County; Charles Rivasplata of Marin County; Gerald Rico of Napa County; Michael Lopez and Eric Shaw of Santa Clara County; William Allen and Carlos Romero of San Mateo County; Marla Harvey of Solano County; Michael D'Augelli, Native American Representative; and Randi Kinman and Dawn Love, Low-Income Representatives. Chair Raphael Durr of Marin County was excused.

MTC employees in attendance were Catalina Alvarado, Alix Bockelman, Pam Grove, Georgia Lambert, Vince Petrites, Theresa Romell and Jamila Williams, along with MTC Commissioner Dorene Giacopini.

Stuart Cohen of TALC, Lindsay Imai of Urban Habitat and Victor Rubin of PolicyLink were also in attendance.

Meeting Minutes

The minutes from the December 11, 2007 meeting were approved with one abstention.

Chair's Report

In Chair Durr's absence, Vice Chair Rubiano reminded everyone to take the Transportation 2035 online survey if they had not done so already (deadline was extended to Jan. 18) and called for subcommittee reports.

MCAC Member Reports

Jacquee Castain reported two meetings of the High School Internship Subcommittee that met in December and today. She said that applications for the program will be available in March and mentioned that Jamila Williams, a college intern who will assist Ann Macaulay in coordinating the 2008 program, was introduced at today's meeting. In addition, the subcommittee elected officers; Michael D'Augelli was nominated and agreed to be Vice Chair and Ms. Castain will serve as Chair. Letters to agencies that could potentially hire interns were mailed out by MTC, and a half-hour television interview with MTC staff and an MCAC representative is planned by MCAC member Darnell Turner to assist in soliciting potential interns and employers.

- over -

MCAC Member Reports (Continued)

The television program will be taped on Jan. 24 and DVDs will be available for distribution. Mr. Turner's program runs five nights a week on various Comcast public access stations throughout the Bay Area. Ms. Alvarado and Ms. Grove will discuss MTC's programs during the interview.

Ms. Grove introduced Jamila Williams, the college intern for the High School Internship Program, and Vice Chair Rubiano asked her to say a few words. Vice Chair Rubiano also welcomed and introduced Commissioner Dorene Giacomini.

Vice Chair McGhee reported on the DBE Subcommittee. The December 12 MTC- and MCAC-sponsored Procurement Workshop had about 80 firms confirmed, but only 30 attended. He said the workshop will probably be offered again, but marketed differently, perhaps mentioning the total dollar amount available in contracting opportunities.

Distribution Proposals for the SB717 Augmentation to State Transit Assistance (STA) Population Based Funding

On behalf of MCAC, Vice Chair Rubiano stated the Committee was pleased the Programming and Allocations Committee postponed the decision regarding distribution of the approximately \$90M in additional STA funds expected over the next ten years. Theresa Romell, funding analyst for MTC's Programming & Allocations section, provided follow-up information and a recap, noting that there are two options going before the Commission for distribution of said funds. Ms. Romell gave background on the four categories of programs that would be recipients of the funds, and provided demographic information compiled from the 2007 Transit Demographic Survey and 2000 Census data. Information about low income and minority percentage overlap was not available, nor was there information about the percentage of paratransit riders that are low income and/or minority. She stated that members of the Elderly and Disabled Advisory Committee had selected Option 2 at their meeting on Jan. 3..

Vice Chair Rubiano recapped Ms. Romell's report, stating that U.S. Census data was used as a proxy for the Bay Area and the likelihood that the data mirrors paratransit is really a "best guess." Bill Allen inquired if Darlene Rutkowski, district administrator of the California Department of Rehabilitation, San Francisco, had been consulted for statistics in both San Francisco and San Mateo Counties. Ms. Romell said she had not, and Mr. Allen volunteered to see if further data is available from her office. Discussion regarding Lifeline's funding and paratransit ridership followed, and Ms. Romell commented that any new data would need to be available prior to the meeting the next day at 10 a.m.

Carlos Romero said he received an email from Urban Habitat attempting to explain some of the issues around allocation of these funds. It was suggested that there is no "net new" increment to the Lifeline category – that it is a timing issue, not an issue of additional increments. Ms. Bockelman, director of Programming & Allocations, said an amount was set aside through an action taken in June increasing the amount to Lifeline.

**Distribution Proposals for the SB717 Augmentation to State Transit Assistance (STA)
Population Based Funding (Continued)**

Eric Shaw said he felt increasing the funding for MTC Regional Coordination would create greater efficiencies within the system as a whole, in terms of the need for funding of TransLink® and 511, thus also benefiting small operators, Lifeline and Paratransit riders.

Vice Chair Rubiano asked for an argument in favor of Option 2, and Ms. Romell said that, from EDAC's perspective, the Regional Paratransit program was the only category that didn't receive an augmentation from Proposition 1B regional funds. The projected growth in paratransit needs shows that costs are increasing at a high rate and paratransit is underfunded. Ms. Bockelman stated that MTC staff has not taken a position on the two options, but the Bay Area Partnership Board and EDAC both supported Option 2.

Vice Chair McGhee said it seems there are never enough resources for those who need to use paratransit services and paratransit agencies are committed and would use allocations wisely. Randi Kinman agreed and said that the increase of housing for senior, low-income and disabled groups indicates that needs are growing and paratransit needs must be developed for the future.

Lindsay Imai of Urban Habitat said it is not clear to her what the overall impact is going to be on Lifeline and paratransit. She asked if the distribution was going to make an overall material difference in the total net amount that Lifeline receives over the next 25 years. Ms. Bockelman said Option 1 would add approximately \$30 million in the first ten years and Option 2 would add an additional \$15 million over the first ten years to Lifeline, but the other fund sources approved as part of the Prop. 1B program in June and as part of Transportation 2030 are still committed to Lifeline. She reiterated that all of the figures presented in the summary of options are percentages based on conservative projections rather than real numbers.

Vice Chair Rubiano called for a recommendation from MCAC to send to the Programming & Allocations Committee. Michael Lopez made a motion to support Option 2; it was seconded.. Mr. Shaw said he firmly believes in the need for regional connectivity for all residents and is concerned about the cut of proportions, especially because of BART expansion and increased transit efforts in the Peninsula and South Bay. Option 1 would be a better solution for those projects, he stated.

The motion to support Option 2 was put to a vote, with 10 members in favor and 7 opposed. The motion was carried. It was determined that MTC staff would prepare a letter to the Programming & Allocations Committee on behalf of MCAC with the Option 2 recommendation along with points of dissension noted. Dissenting MCAC members expressed a preference for a larger increase for Lifeline and paratransit, and some believed that Option 1 could potentially benefit more riders because of the larger shares for Lifeline and the Regional Coordination.

Overview of Community Organizations that Work on Social Justice Issues

In the second of three advocacy group presentations (with Urban Habitat having presented in December), Stuart Cohen, executive director of the Transportation and Land Use Coalition

Overview of Community Organizations that Work on Social Justice Issues (Continued)

(TALC), presented information about TALC's background and accomplishments. Formed in 1997, TALC has approximately 110 groups around the region as part of its coalition, about 55 actively involved. Those include environmental, social justice, housing and community organizations whose purpose is to work together to ensure that regional and county transportation investments and land-use policies are promoting an agenda that finds a "sweet spot" between environmental sustainability and social justice. Mr. Cohen passed out a TALC pamphlet, *Access Now: A Guide to Winning the Transportation Your Community Needs*.

The third presentation was given by Victor Rubin, vice president of research for PolicyLink, a national research and action institute focused on advancing economic and social equity. Founded in 2000, PolicyLink has a common interest in regional equity and strives to ensure that every community is a community of equitable opportunity for low income and communities of color. He also commented that PolicyLink will be particularly focusing on development without displacement (gentrification) in the Bay Area, as a result of a Caltrans grant just awarded to the Association of Bay Area Governments and PolicyLink.

Nominations for 2008 Committee Officers

Vice Chair Rubiano called for nominations for MCAC's 2008 Chair and Vice Chair positions. Chair Durr will not be running again for chair, and Ms. Alvarado noted that regular rotation is encouraged. Vice Chairs McGhee and Rubiano were nominated for the Chair position and Mr. Romero, Ms. Kinman and Mr. Turner were nominated as Vice Chairs. The election will be held at the beginning of the February meeting, at which time further nominations will also be accepted.

Community Liaison Officer's Report

Ms. Grove said her report is in the packet, but she outlined the highlights. She stated the MCAC Work Plan will be presented to the Legislation Committee on Jan. 11, and the Transportation 2035 Call for Projects workshop took place on the morning of Jan. 8 (more information is available on MTC's Web site).

Other Business/Public Comment

Mr. Allen mentioned that last month he requested information about a San Mateo County shuttle service, and noted that staff reported the research results would be available shortly and will be part of the committee's agenda next month.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:27 p.m. The next meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, February 12, 2008, and will be held in MTC's Claremont Conference Room.