



DRAFT

MINORITY CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE Minutes – September 11, 2007

Bill Dodd, Chair
Napa County and Cities

Scott Haggerty, Vice Chair
Alameda County

Tom Ammiano
City and County of San Francisco

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Bob Blanchard
Sonoma County and Cities

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Sperring
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Amy Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director,
Bay Area Toll Authority

Therese W. McMillan
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Attendance

Those in attendance were Chair Raphael Durr and Charles Rivasplata of Marin County; Jacquee Castain, Carlos Castellanos and Homira Shafaq of Alameda County; Michael Rubiano of Contra Costa County; Gerald Rico of Napa County; James McGhee of San Francisco; Sheri Lad and Carlos Romero of San Mateo County; Michael Lopez of Santa Clara County; Michael Daugelli, Native American Representative; and Randi Kinman and Dawn Love, Low-Income Representatives. Martin Nguyen of Santa Clara County participated via teleconference, and Harvey Louie of San Francisco was excused.

MTC employees in attendance were Catalina Alvarado, James Corless, Nate Gilbertson, Pam Grove, Raymond Kan, Ann Macaulay, and Ashley Nguyen. Alea Gage, MTC's Coro Fellow, was also present.

Additional attendees included Lindsay Imai of Urban Habitat and Surinder Sikand of Caltrans.

Meeting Minutes

The minutes from the July 10, 2007 meeting were approved, with Carlos Romero abstaining.

Chairperson's Report

The Chair welcomed new members, and called for introductions. He then suggested a training session for new members regarding MCAC history and key projects before the committee. He also suggested Urban Habitat might assist in such a session.

MCAC 2007-2008 Work Plan

Vice Chair Michael Rubiano reported on the August 30 meeting of the Work Plan Subcommittee, whose task it is to assist MCAC in identifying work plan items and goals for the upcoming year. Mr. Rubiano also stated the committee would suggest how best to communicate the goals to the Commission. He reminded everyone that a survey on work plan items and goals was distributed last month, and he encouraged members who had not yet taken the survey to do so as soon as possible.

The packet memo listed the survey results to date; a second subcommittee meeting is planned in order to further develop potential goals for consideration by the full committee.

- over -

TransLink® Update

MTC Planner Nate Gilbertson gave an update on the progress to date on implementation of the TransLink® fare card program stating that AC Transit and Golden Gate Transit will publicly launch the system next week. The cards will be offered for purchase at local vendors, with Walgreens as the first one on board to carry the card for consumer purchase at a cost of \$5. In addition, incentives such as offering the card free to those using the autoload feature will hopefully attract riders to sign up for the program.

MCAC members asked about the process if the TransLink® equipment fails to work; when and on which systems TransLink® will be available, whether the \$5 card fee might be prohibitive to low-income users, whether thought has been given to linking the program to EBT (electronic benefit transfer), and if there would be more incentives in the future to use the card. Mr. Gilbertson responded that it is best to have alternative forms of fare along with your TransLink® card (even though AC Transit has a 6% failure rate and Golden Gate has only a 1% failure rate). BART, Caltrain and Muni are expected to begin use of the system in March of 2008, and Santa Clara VTA should be on board by Spring 2009.

In terms of low-income users, Mr. Gilbertson did state that while \$5 is the actual cost of the card, the operators do have free cards to distribute at their discretion that could be made available to low-income transit riders. He agreed that autoload might not be the best incentive for low-income users and those without computers, commenting that there are add value machines at key transit locations. For technical reasons, some operators like AC Transit have decided to offer the use of the card only to adult riders in the initial phases. At a later date the operators will be able to issue youth passes and senior passes.

MCAC members Carlos Romero and Randi Kinman expressed interest in how the free cards are to be distributed, and Chair Durr requested a report back to MCAC on the strategy of how these cards will be distributed to low-income users.

MCAC member Charles Rivasplata commented that perhaps staff should consider outreach to medium and smaller employers in inner city and community colleges.

Report on 2007 MTC High School Internship Program

MTC Human Resources Specialist Ann Macaulay gave a final report on the 2007 high school internship program, including a little background for the benefit of new members. Twenty-seven students were hired this summer, and a breakdown of jobs and students is included in the packet.

112 applications were received, 85 were considered complete and forwarded to the agencies. Students who did not complete their application were offered assistance to complete the forms. Most were missing letters of recommendation and did not respond when they were called or sent e-mail. MCAC member Randi Kinman suggested perhaps the wording could be altered so students understand the letters could come from a minister, neighbor or someone they baby-sit for.

MCAC member Carlos Romero commented that recruitment and retention are key elements, and MCAC should work to bring in more African American and Latino applications.

Report on 2007 MTC High School Internship Program *(continued)*

MCAC member Jacquee Castain suggested committee members go to church youth groups to find applicants, and stated that school bulletins worked best in getting the word out.

Ms. Macaulay thanked the subcommittee, in particular, for its work on the program, and reminded the committee they are key in getting the word out to the students.

Transportation 2035 Update

MTC Senior Planners James Corless and Ashley Nguyen gave an update on the environment and equity targets for the Transportation 2035 Vision component of the plan. MTC staff will present these goals to the Planning Committee this Friday for recommendation to the full Commission.

In consultation with the Air District, MTC is considering changing its particulate matter (PM) target from the current 10% reduction to a 10% reduction for PM 2.5 (i.e., the finer particulate matter that comes from tailpipe emissions, for instance), and a 45% reduction for the coarser particulate matter (from road dust,) by the year 2035.

On the equity target, staff has had discussions over the past few months with MTC advisors and other stakeholders. Staff recommends the inclusion of a target that would decrease by 10% the share of household income consumed by both housing and transportation costs for low-income households. The foundation of this target comes from a national study that shows Bay Area working families spend a larger proportion of their income on transportation and housing than other parts of the country. Mr. Corless stated it has been challenging to identify an equity target that addresses the concerns of all stakeholders. He noted that in addition to this target for the visioning process, staff also would complete a separate equity analysis in 2008 on the proposed Transportation 2035 investment packages.

Staff hopes to share preliminary results of this technical evaluation with MCAC next month, and will have full results for the joint MTC-ABAG “Bay Area *on the move*” forum on October 26.

Ms. Castain stated she is happy to hear more work has been done in this area, and Vice Chair McGhee expressed his appreciation to staff for being open to new ideas.

Mr. Romero asked how realistic a 10% decrease is, given the fact that the major factors in the equity target equation are jobs, housing and transportation, and transportation is most likely not going to decrease. Ms. Nguyen replied that staff is hoping to not only look at the supply and how it impacts the targets, but also to do a second layer of analysis that involves changing our land-use assumptions (What if we grew smarter than what has already been assumed? What if we did more of a jobs-housing balance? What if we moved housing closer to transit?). Perhaps these assumptions would help us to move the needle to reach the target, and these are questions staff hopes to answer as part of the analysis. Mr. Corless added this is an experimental measure; MTC is trying to respond to concerns about affordability. There are also things that could be done that, while they might take decades to accomplish, would get jobs and housing closer to the transit network and allow households to have fewer vehicles and thus a lower transportation cost.

MCAC Minutes — Page 4
September 11, 2007

Transportation 2035 Update *(continued)*

Lindsay Imai commented that one exciting factor about the TransLink® program is the ability to implement a different fare for low-income riders, and MTC should look into that possibility.

Chair Durr commented that there needs to be a discussion of infill housing and how transit-oriented development creates displacement of low-income people and possible gentrification, as well as accessibility issues. Mr. Corless responded that gentrification displacement is a very important issue, and staff hopes – through the targets – to explore what a mixed-income community would look like, how much housing can be afforded, what would the housing cost look like, and how does that compare to the rest of the market.

Ms. Castain commented that ABAG needs to provide real statistics and facts as to where the jobs will come from, and Ms. Kinman agreed that this type of development will fail without the jobs (real jobs) to support it. Mr. Romero commented that inclusionary housing is important, and he suggested the possibility of a subcommittee to discuss the equity issues and the technical aspects.

MCAC Member Reports

This item was tabled due to lack of time.

Community Liaison Officer's Report

Catalina Alvarado reminded the committee that the MTC-ABAG Transportation 2035 Forum will be held on October 26th at the Oakland Marriott Hotel, and MCAC members have been registered for the event. Members need to RSVP to staff to unregister or to make their meal selection for the event.

Members were reminded they can receive their packets electronically or access them via the MTC Web site if they would prefer not to receive a paper copy.

Other Business/Public Comment

Vice Chair Rubiano suggested the following operational changes for future discussion:

- Align advisor terms with the Commissioners' terms
- Align MCAC work plan with the Commissioners' terms
- Shift chair/vice chair elections to whatever new year/term might be adopted
- Stagger terms of advisors on the committee (so as not to lose continuity and history)

There was no additional public comment.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned. The next meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, October 9, 2007.