



DRAFT

MINORITY CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE Minutes – July 10, 2007

Bill Dodd, Chair
Napa County and Cities

Scott Haggerty, Vice Chair
Alameda County

Tom Ammiano
City and County of San Francisco

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Bob Blanchard
Sonoma County and Cities

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Amy Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director,
Bay Area Toll Authority

Therese W. McMillan
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Attendance

Those in attendance were Chair Raphael Durr and Charles Rivasplata of Marin County; Jacquee Castain and Frank Gallo of Alameda County; Candy Gayles of Contra Costa County; Gerald Rico of Napa County; Alejandro Castillo, Harvey Louie and James McGhee of San Francisco; Asok Mukhopadhyay of San Mateo County; Cedric Martin and Martin Nguyen of Santa Clara County; and Dawn Love, Low-Income Representative. Michael Rubiano of Contra Costa County participated via teleconference.

MTC employees in attendance were Catalina Alvarado, James Corless, Pam Grove, Raymond Kan, Therese Knudsen, Georgia Lambert, Therese McMillan, Chuck Purvis, Ashley Nguyen and Anne Richman. Dave Burch with the Bay Area Air Quality Management District was also present.

Additional attendees included Richard Hedges and Marshall Loring, EDAC members; Lindsay Imai of Urban Habitat; and Bob Planthold of MTC's Advisory Council.

Meeting Minutes

The minutes from the June 12, 2007 meeting were approved.

Chairperson's Report

The Chair thanked the members who are completing their MCAC terms and will not be returning as committee members — Frank Gallo, Cedric Martin, Asok Mukhopadhyay and Candy Gayles — for all of their work over the years.

Equity Targets for the Transportation 2035 Plan & Transportation 2030 Equity Analysis Review

MTC Senior Planner James Corless reminded the committee that the development of the Transportation 2035 Plan is starting with a "visioning phase" with various targets, including equity, and that the financially constrained "equity analysis phase" will begin in 2008. He explained that the meeting would begin with a review of the goals, followed by discussion and feedback on the equity targets for the visioning phase. A presentation and review of the equity analysis for the Transportation 2030 Plan was to follow the "equity target" discussion. [However, the goals and equity target discussion continued for the entire meeting, and the review of the equity analysis done for the financially constrained 2030 Plan will be rescheduled.]

- over -

Equity Targets for the Transportation 2035 Plan & Transportation 2030 Equity Analysis Review *(continued)*

MTC Senior Planner Ashley Nguyen reviewed the Transportation 2035 goals presented at the May MCAC meeting, and now set under the framework of the “Three E” Principles (Economy, Environment and Equity); and introduced the Scenario Performance Assessment and the accompanying targets for congestion, vehicle miles traveled and emissions. She noted that the Equity targets being considered are around access, cost and health.

Ms. Nguyen reported on several priority objectives heard via agency consultation and public outreach:

- “Fix It First” policy is a priority objective
- Safety of bicyclists and pedestrians is critical
- Particulate matter is a serious public health concern
- Aging population needs more attention
- Smart-growth land uses should be advanced, but not at a cost of diverting funds from maintenance

Frank Gallo, MCAC member, queried how to apply the “Fix It First” policy to agencies such as BART with its lack of maintenance (elevators not working, for instance). There needs to be a way to tie the fixes to future funding in order to correct the deficiencies.

Vice chair McGhee commented that people of color and low-income must be considered in the transit plan since they are the primary riders of the transit system, and how the plan will impact these communities must be taken into account.

Harvey Louie, MCAC member, expressed concern that no funding had been set aside for private sector transit operators – and yet they could probably assist with issues of congestion and moving people out of their cars.

Alejandro Castillo, MCAC member, would like to see equity defined as an equal subsidy for low-income bus riders, since the subsidy per rider is much higher for Caltrain and BART riders as compared to the subsidy for individual bus riders. Mr. Castillo also expressed concern about creating equity in ride experience. He suggested guideposts of prioritizing public transit over private autos and Lifeline over BART, and having MTC follow through on recommendations made by MCAC.

Asok Mukhopadhyay, MCAC member, inquired how MTC could achieve “lofty goals” such as reducing VMT by 10%. He reported that in India use of individual jitneys has improved congestion, and he would like to see MTC support small, local innovative ideas.

Regarding previously mentioned funding shortfalls for BART maintenance, Chair Durr asked how BART suddenly found \$40 million in May to fund two capital projects. MCAC has consistently suggested a “Fix It First” policy, and the funding should have gone toward maintenance and/or accessibility. He further commented that some of the biggest flaws in the transportation system are operations in low income and areas of color and meeting the needs of the disabled.

Equity Targets for the Transportation 2035 Plan & Transportation 2030 Equity Analysis Review *(continued)*

Jacquie Castain, MCAC member, said BART elevators can be out of service for months at a time and the disabled cannot access the cars. When is BART going to make repairs? She also emphasized the need to make the tunnel under the Bay safe and secure.

On the discussion of equity targets, Ms. Nguyen identified three equity targets:

- Proximity and Access (Reduction of travel time to retail and essential services; reduction of average commute time by mode)
- Public Health (Reduction of particulate matter emissions in communities adjacent to transportation hot spots)
- Affordability and Cost (Reduction of consumer out-of-pocket costs; increase of benefits to users; reduction of private and public costs)

MCAC member Candy Gayles said she sees a lot of tragic, unacceptable instances of breakdown of public transit regarding service for the disabled. She feels that transfer fares are too complicated and a hardship on people who don't have the money.

Mr. Castillo commented that buses should have priority with dedicated bus lanes.

Mr. Gallo wondered how riders can get from Point A to Point B in a reliable, affordable, seamless way. He said that coordinated signals are needed and that MTC should be the leader in working with other municipal agencies to show what could be achieved during the visioning process for a better transportation system.

Ms. McMillan summarized that what she is hearing is the need to find a way to get the broad questions of what is wanted in place – i.e., a shorter ride, accessibility for the disabled, making the streets work better for the buses we have.

Mr. Gallo seeks better communication between the transit provider and the end-user regarding actual use of the service.

Mr. Mukhopadhyay asked how MCAC could actually make goals such as BART's maintenance of elevators enforceable at the transit district level before using \$40M for extension projects.

Lindsay Imai of Urban Habitat expressed concern about the basic levels of service to meet the needs of transit riders. Standards were proposed as basic levels of service in the Lifeline Plan of 2001. She said full funding is needed for community-based transportation. MCAC's Environmental Justice principles seek to ensure equitable investments per rider, equitable service level output, and equitable outcomes.

Dave Burch with the Bay Area Air Quality Management District discussed the target of reduction of particulate emissions. Diesel particulate matter is responsible for approximately 80% of the cancer toxicity risk associated with air pollution in this region, he said. The Air District is coordinating with MTC to address air quality issues and reduce particulate matter.

Equity Targets for the Transportation 2035 Plan & Transportation 2030 Equity Analysis Review *(continued)*

Chair Durr and Vice chair McGhee queried Mr. Burch about areas of air quality studies. Mr. Burch said he didn't have the maps available today, but areas such as Richmond and West Oakland, as well as areas in proximity to ports, refineries and freeway corridors, were key areas of emissions exposures.

Mr. Gallo mentioned that locomotives were regarded as a primary source of particulate matter and asked what is being done about it. Mr. Burch said the railroads and the State Air Resources Board had a Memo of Understanding, and the Air Quality District is looking at what the alternatives are for cleaner locomotives.

Ms. Nguyen said MTC's goal is to have the equity target identified by early August. The technical work on the Scenario Performance Assessment will begin in August with preliminary evaluation results available in September. The ultimate goal is to bring evaluation results to the joint MTC/ABAG Fall Forum on October 26.

During the discussion, Ms. McMillan noted that the task of dissecting the equity analysis completed for the Transportation 2030 Plan isn't immediately pressing, since the equity analysis for the 2035 Plan will be geared toward the financially constrained assessment and will be done in the Spring of 2008. Additionally, MTC may learn something from the target-setting exercise that would inform how MTC might want to change the equity analysis applied to the financially constrained plan in the next phase. The review was to be rescheduled for another meeting.

MCAC Work Plan for 2007-2008

Ms. Alvarado stated that MTC staff will work with MCAC to craft their 2007-2008 work plan with narrower topics for agenda items. Vice chair Michael Rubiano suggested that MCAC needs actionable, deliverable items to delineate what needs to be accomplished, as well as a strategic planning session to agree on the path going forward. It was agreed that a small group would meet in August to develop a list of potential agenda item deliverables that could be presented to MCAC in September. Mr. Rubiano requested that, prior to the subcommittee meeting, Ms. Alvarado prepare a list of topics that MTC will be working on the coming year, and ask members to review it and add other topics of interest, including what deliverable or action would be associated with each item.

Public Comment/Adjournment

There was no additional public comment. The meeting was adjourned. The next meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, September 11, 2007.