



Amy Rein Worth, Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Dave Cortese, Vice Chair
Santa Clara County

Alicia C. Aguirre
Cities of San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Jason Baker
Cities of Santa Clara County

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
San Jose Mayor's Appointee

Mark Luce
Napa County and Cities

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Julie Pierce
Association of Bay Area Governments

Bijan Sartipi
California State
Transportation Agency

Libby Schaaf
Oakland Mayor's Appointee

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Alix Bockelman
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

OPERATIONS COMMITTEE MINUTES
March 13, 2015

ATTENDANCE:

Chair Mackenzie called the MTC Operations Committee meeting to order at 11:08 a.m. Other Committee members in attendance were Commissioners Aguirre, Azumbrado, Giacopini, Haggerty, Liccardo, Pierce, and Spering. Commissioners Bates, Luce, Tissier, and Rein Worth were present as ad hoc non-voting members. Commission Chair Cortese was present in his ex-officio voting member capacity.

CONSENT CALENDAR:

Upon the motion of Commissioner Liccardo, which was seconded by Commissioner Pierce, the Committee unanimously approved the consent calendar, which included the following items:

- a) Minutes of January 9, 2015 meeting
- b) Minutes of February 13, 2015 meeting
- c) Clipper® Program Contract Actions – Contract Change Order – San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Central Subway: Cubic Transportation Systems, Inc. (\$3,560,000) (Brian Gebhardt)

Contract: Next Generation Clipper® System Consultant Support: IBI Group (\$5,000,000)

Jason Weinstein, MTC staff, presented this item requesting approval of a contract award to the IBI Group to support the next generation Clipper® system procurement process. He described the evaluation process and reviewed the evaluation results and criteria used to evaluate the proposals.

Commissioner Pierce expressed concern about the investment required to replace the incumbent, (CH2MHill) and train a new team. Commissioner Spering asked why the IBI Group's proposal was found to be superior to CH2MHill's. Mr. Weinstein responded that many factors were considered in the evaluation process. He explained that the evaluation panel ranked the thought leadership and industry expertise of the IBI Group highly. Their proposed approach was also very well regarded by the panel.

MARCH MINUTES

Commissioner Azumbrado asked whether evaluators had the benefit of client feedback for both teams. Mr. Weinstein replied that references were checked for all proposers.

Commissioner Liccardo asked about the proposed project's scope of work, and requested a breakdown of budget by task. He also asked whether the work could be conducted by MTC staff rather than consultants. Steve Heminger, MTC Executive Director, said that the historical approach to delivering Clipper® has been to keep staff small and to leverage the assistance of consultants. Commissioners Azumbrado and Liccardo requested that staff report back on the possibility of developing the additional in-house expertise to support the Clipper® program.

Brin Owen, CH2MHill staff, indicated that CH2MHill sent a letter to Committee members outlining apparent inconsistencies identified by CH2MHill in the scoring of the proposals. He stated his concern that the proposals may have been evaluated based on criteria not listed in the Request for Proposal (RFP). He requested that the Committee direct staff to re-evaluate the proposals based strictly on the criteria outlined in the RFP. Dina Potter and Anthony DeVito also spoke to support Mr. Owen's request.

Upon motion of Commissioner Spring, which was seconded by Commissioner Liccardo, the Committee unanimously moved to refer this item to the full Commission and asked staff to provide additional information in answer to questions raised by Commissioners in the meeting.

Public Comment/Other Business/Next Meeting/Adjournment:

There being no further business, Chair Mackenzie adjourned the meeting at 11:37 a.m. The next meeting of the Operations Committee is scheduled for Friday, April 10, 2015 at 9:30 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.