



Policy Advisory Council
March 11, 2015
Minutes

Dave Cortese, Chair
Santa Clara County

Alicia C. Aguirre
Cities of San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Jason Baker
Cities of Santa Clara County

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
San Jose Mayor's Appointee

Mark Luce
Napa County and Cities

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Julie Pierce
Association of Bay Area Governments

Bijan Sartipi
California State
Transportation Agency

Libby Schaaf
Oakland Mayor's Appointee

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Amy Rein Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Alix Bockelman
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Chair Randi Kinman called the meeting to order at 1:33 p.m. Policy Advisory Council members in attendance were: Naomi Armenta, Jim Blacksten, Richard Burnett, JoAnn Busenbark, Carlos Castellanos, Wilbert Din, Veda Florez, Sandi Galvez, Bob Glover, Richard Hedges, Charles Kaufman, Jerry Levine, Shireen Malekafzali, Mark Nicholson, Mike Pechner, Gerald Rico, Linda Jeffery Sailors, Benjamin Schweng, Alan Talansky, and Harriet Wolf. **Excused:** Cathleen Baker, Caroline Bañuelos, and Elizabeth Clary.

Meeting Minutes

The minutes of the February 11, 2015 meeting were approved after a motion by Linda Jeffery Sailors and a second by Veda Florez. Shireen Malekafzali, Gerald Rico, and Benjamin Schweng abstained, as they were not present at the February meeting.

Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

There was no public comment.

Subcommittee Report

Equity and Access Subcommittee

Former Equity and Access Subcommittee Chair Naomi Armenta reported that the subcommittee met earlier in the day and held elections for a new chair and vice chair. Jim Blacksten and Carlos Castellanos were elected, respectively. The subcommittee then received an update on the Regional Means-Based (Low-Income) Transit Fare Pricing Study from Kristen Mazur in MTC's Programming and Allocations Section.

Fuel Extraction Tax Subcommittee

Alan Talansky announced the Fuel Extraction Tax Subcommittee will hold its first meeting on April 8, 2015. Mr. Talansky requested the Council email any comments on his report from last January to him in advance of that meeting.

– more –

State of the Region Report and Vital Signs Initiative (Phase 2: Land, People, and Economy)

Cynthia Kroll of ABAG and Kristen Carnarius of MTC gave an overview of ABAG's upcoming State of the Region report and previewed the new webpages included in the next phase of MTC's Vital Signs performance monitoring initiative.

During public comment, Mr. Ken Bukowski suggested a chart about displacement be added to the Vital Signs website.

The Council asked clarifying questions and had the following comments:

- Richard Hedges expressed concern about the lack of housing development, considering the fact that six of the top employment counties are in the Bay Area.
- Mike Pechner stated he would like to see a chart showing job growth, especially in places where there is an in-commute like in the North Bay.
- Several members of the Council commented the media has not focused on Vital Signs and perhaps MTC and ABAG should send more information to various media outlets.
- In response to Shireen Malekafzali's comments about ways to include demographic, wage, health, housing trends and other societal changes in future updates and her continued desire to see equity listed as a separate indicator (as opposed to embedded within the categories), MTC Planner Dave Vautin stated that as Vital Signs moves forward there will be opportunities to add in and swap out indicators. In terms of equity being included as its own indicator, Mr. Vautin stated that staff felt that since equity is a crosscutting issue it was more appropriate to capture it throughout the process. However, with new funding available in a new budget year, MTC can see what funding is available and whether a different approach should be taken in the future. Ms. Malekafzali suggested the link to the equity aspect in each indicator be identified to draw it out for those who have that interest.
- In response to Sandi Galvez's question for definitions of low-tier and high-tier housing prices, Cynthia Kroll stated she would get her those specifics.
- As a way to communicate better with local groups, Veda Florez suggested an intersecting graph showing housing, transportation and jobs.
- In response to a question from Ms. Galvez, Mr. Vautin went over the vetting process for the indicators, mentioning that lack of regularly available data makes it hard to include a health indicator with a direct transportation nexus. Ms. Galvez suggested partnering with Bay Area health departments in the future.

Mr. Vautin stated any desired indicators should be sent to him within the next few weeks, so he can look at how they might fit it into the available budget.

Brainstorming Session: Incentives for Developers and Local Governments

Therese Trivedi, MTC Senior Planner, gave a brief presentation in preparation for a brainstorming session on incentives for transit-oriented development and affordable housing. The Council broke into small groups, reconvened, and had the following initial items to report:

Brainstorming Session: Incentives for Developers and Local Governments (continued)

- Focus on local jurisdictions: how can MTC incentivize local jurisdictions (not just developers)
- MTC should dialogue with the affordable housing community in the context of cap and trade funds
- Repurpose/reuse existing buildings
- Encourage local jurisdictions to dialogue with developers (have them speak to city councils, modify rules, grandmother units)
- San Jose:
 - Needs more businesses
 - Expand the idea of campuses with housing (not just worker housing)
 - Value-added tax incentives
- Data sharing – correlation between affordable housing and reductions in VMT – incentives for area/street design
- Transit-Oriented Affordable Housing (TOAH) – argue for expanding length/scope of program; get buy-in from local jurisdictions
- Encourage employers who can bring in employees for housing; workers for housing
- More incentives for employer-employee housing within PDAs
- Local governments: include public spaces/meeting rooms – useful to the community as a whole
- More/better education to local communities (including transit agencies) as to why smart growth housing is important
- Ongoing (possibly online) education of city councils/planning commissions on PDAs
- Consider tax reform (at the state level) that would encourage homes instead of more retail development
- Public benefits should include space for carsharing, electric vehicles and bicycles
- MTC should advocate for further EIR reform
- Fix the conflict between Air District and NEPA regulations
- Tax the problems that NOT building affordable housing cause
- Find an equitable way to share the costs of lack of housing
- Find a way to fund affordable housing in the long term
- If developers get tax breaks, they must up the percentage of affordable housing provided
- Have more of a hard requirement in OBAG funds
- Density bonus laws
- Prevent housing moratoriums after adopting the housing element
- How well are we doing now? Assessment re: affordable housing in TODs; What has actually been constructed? (Dismal amounts in PDAs; supply problem); What can we do?

Brainstorming Session: Incentives for Developers and Local Governments (continued)

- Smart Growth America/LOCUS, a national network of smart growth real estate developers and investors.
 - Include TOD developers
 - June conference
 - Connect with them
- Broaden who can spread the message (i.e., allow Policy Advisory Council members to speak at local community events; develop a PowerPoint presentation/tool kit for Council members)

The Council requested a future brainstorming on this topic be scheduled in order to continue the discussion.

Staff Liaison Report

Pam Grove went over the highlights of the staff liaison report, mentioning that Santa Clara County Supervisor Dave Cortese was appointed Chair of the MTC Commission. Ms. Grove noted the deadline for applications for MTC's High School Internship Program has been extended to March 22, 2015. She also notified the council that the April 8, 2015 meeting of the Policy Advisory Council has been cancelled. Instead, there will be two Policy Advisory Council meetings held in May: the first will be a regular meeting on May 13, 2015, and the second will be the Council's annual work plan meeting with the Commission on May 27, 2015.

Council Member Reports

- Rich Hedges stated while former Policy Advisory Council member Marshall Loring is currently not able to check his email, his continued recovery is going well.
- Benjamin Schweng announced he is cohosting the Downtown Hayward Loop Bicycle Awareness Ride on Saturday, May 16, 2015 at 8 a.m. Members of the Hayward city council and their staff will be in attendance. More information about the ride can be found at: <http://www.cyclepathhayward.com/loop.html>
- Linda Jeffery Sailors gave an update on BART to the Tri-Valley extension, stating that the Altamont Corridor Express (ACE) Train is seeking special funding to extend the project further than what is planned and is willing to work with state and federal government to find a solution.
- Veda Florez reported that the North Bay Leadership Council is hosting a North Bay Housing Summit on May 8, 2015. More information can be found at: <http://northbayleadership.org/events/detail/North-Bay-Housing-Summit>
- Sandi Galvez mentioned Caltrans will be hosting a public input session on the California Transportation Plan 2040 (CTP 2040) at MTC on March 26, 2015. More information on the CTP 2040 can be found at: <http://www.dot.ca.gov/hq/tpp/californiatransportationplan2040/index.shtml>

New Business

There was no new business.

Adjournment/Next Meeting

The meeting adjourned at 3:51 p.m. The next meeting of the Policy Advisory Council is scheduled for May 13, 2015 at 1:30 p.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, 101 8th Street, Oakland, California.