



Amy Rein Worth, Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Dave Cortese, Vice Chair
Santa Clara County

Alicia C. Aguirre
Cities of San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Jason Baker
Cities of Santa Clara County

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
San Jose Mayor's Appointee

Mark Luce
Napa County and Cities

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Julie Pierce
Association of Bay Area Governments

Bijan Sartipi
California State
Transportation Agency

James P. Spring
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Vacant
Oakland Mayor's Appointee

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Alix Bockelman
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Policy Advisory Council
December 10, 2014
Minutes

Chair Cathleen Baker called the meeting to order at 1:33 p.m. Policy Advisory Council members in attendance were: Naomi Armenta, Richard Burnett, Carlos Castellanos, Wilbert Din, Veda Florez, Sandi Galvez, Bob Glover, Richard Hedges, Charles Kaufman, Randi Kinman, Jerry Levine, Shireen Malekafzali, Mark Nicholson, Mike Pechner, Gerald Rico, Linda Jeffery Sailors, Alan Talansky and Harriet Wolf. **Excused:** Caroline Bañuelos and Jim Blacksten. **Absent:** JoAnn Busenbark, Elizabeth Clary, Timothy Reeder and Benjamin Schweng.

Meeting Minutes

The minutes of the November 12, 2014 meeting were approved after a motion by Richard Hedges and a second by Veda Florez. Naomi Armenta, Charles Kaufman, Shireen Malekafzali, and Harriet Wolf abstained, as they were not present at the November meeting.

Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

Cathleen Baker welcomed newly-appointed advisors Charles Kaufman, Shireen Malekafzali, and Harriet Wolf to the Policy Advisory Council.

Mr. Ken Bukowski informed the Council of an update to his regional video website: <http://regional-video.com/>.

Subcommittee Report

Equity and Access Subcommittee Chair Naomi Armenta reported that the subcommittee did not meet this month. Richard Hedges mentioned a report he gave to the Commission about 10 years ago regarding access to transit and transit-oriented development. He suggested a review of that report by the Equity and Access Subcommittee at a future meeting to see what improvements have been accomplished and what are still outstanding.

Vital Signs Performance Monitoring Initiative

MTC Senior Transportation Planner/Analyst Dave Vautin provided an overview of MTC's new monitoring initiative to track regional trends in transportation, land use, economy and the environment. The Council asked clarifying questions and had the following comments:

Vital Signs Performance Monitoring Initiative *(continued)*

- In response to a question about where the equity indicators are in this program, Mr. Vautin noted that the equity indicators are included in multiple categories, but mostly within the economy category.
- Interest was expressed in having transit ridership disaggregated and compared by several factors including race, availability of transit by mode, by time of day, the price of gas versus transit ridership, and income, as well as focusing on how those changes in ridership reflect low-income communities and communities of color.
- It is good that staff has included rent burden in the metrics.
- Consider a disaggregation of retail sales at a local level.
- In response to a comment about the varied congestion at the local level and the need to determine whether a majority of a commute centers in a particular area, Mr. Vautin stated that individuals will be able to view congestion on a localized level via the website.
- A request was made to overlap the graph that shows the number of riders with the one that shows the population percentage.
- During the environment phase, investigate the possibility of a “brownfield” measurement in order to look at the land available (and unavailable) from a development standpoint: has this increased/decreased over time?
- In response to a concern regarding MTC’s use of Google translate to translate the website for non-English language speakers, Ellen Griffin of Legislation and Public Affairs commented that in addition to using Google Translate and in-house staff to translate documents, MTC has a contract with a translation firm who normally does quality control work on the MTC website.
- In response to a question of whether staff has considered the effect the private bus systems has on transit ridership, Mr. Vautin stated that for bus networks of companies such as Google or Facebook, comparable ridership data is not available in the same way as it exists for public transportation systems, since they are not required to report on some data points. Mr. Vautin did also note that the transit share data does include both public and private busses.

Mr. Vautin commented that one of the reasons MTC is doing the Vital Signs project is to have a solid foundation for the Plan Bay Area update. The website will allow people to explore local jurisdictions where they live to gain an understanding what’s happening where they live. MTC has been and will continue to work with regional partners to conduct analyses, the results of which will be taken before the Joint MTC-ABAG Committee and shared with other agencies and jurisdictions. In addition, all of the data will be downloadable from the website.

MTC's Draft 2015 Public Participation Plan

Legislation and Public Affairs Principal Ellen Griffin presented MTC's Draft 2015 Public Participation Plan, which was released November 7 for a 45-day public comment period. The Council asked clarifying questions and had the following comments:

- Concern was expressed that a regional equity working group is not planned for this next phase/update of Plan Bay Area. The separation of the equity work from the Regional Advisory Working Group allows for a more manageable discussion around complex topics, and gives an opportunity for organizations that work with and represent the needs of low-income communities and communities of color to be able to delve deeper into and fully understand the equity issues related to Plan Bay Area.
- A suggestion was made that MTC add live video streaming of its public hearings as part of the Public Participation Plan, as well as the possibility of a “call-in” conference setup to allow individuals to type their questions in from their computers remotely to be answered by the presenters at a hearing or workshop.

Chair Baker urged the Council to read MTC's Draft 2015 Public Participation Plan thoroughly, if they have not yet had a chance to do so. She also highlighted Appendix A as a key component of the Plan because it lays out a clear work plan with benchmarks that will be brought back before the Council for input.

Ms. Griffin informed the Council that MTC has done several rounds of public participation plans and has evaluated and learned from the process. She mentioned that she will pass along the Council's comments for consideration.

During public comment, Mr. Bukowski offered to share a transcript from MTC's 2002 Public Involvement Process with the Council as a way to see what recommendations were followed in the past and for what reasons.

Nominations for 2015 Policy Advisory Council Chair and Vice Chair

Staff liaison Pam Grove went over the elections process, and Chair Baker opened the nomination period for the Policy Advisory Council's 2015 elections for chair and vice chair. Cathleen Baker and Richard Hedges both stated they would not seek nominations.

Richard Hedges nominated Carlos Castellanos for Chair and Alan Talansky for Vice Chair. Naomi Armenta nominated Randi Kinman for Chair. Cathleen Baker nominated Carlos Castellanos for Vice Chair. All of the individuals accepted their nomination.

Ms. Grove reminded the Council that nominations will remain open until the election, which is scheduled for the beginning of the January 14, 2015 meeting.

Staff Liaison Report

Pam Grove went over the highlights of the staff liaison report. Ms. Grove noted Bena Chang has resigned from the Council due to a change in her work assignment; as a result, MTC will open recruitment in January 2015 for two at large vacancies on the Council.

Council Member Reports

- Randi Kinman emphasized how important it is for the Council to give feedback regarding the next generation of Clipper. She suggested advisors contact their elected officials and ask them to add the Clipper survey to their enewsletter. Ms. Kinman also reported on Senator Beall's Town Hall meeting, which included a senate hearing on transportation funding, and she will forward a link to a video of the hearing to the Council. She also requested staff to provide the Council a list of new bills being introduced by the legislature.
- Alan Talansky reported that he received feedback from MTC staff on the fuel extraction tax paper that he has drafted. He would like to present the information to the Council at a future meeting; staff agreed the item could be agendized for January or February.
- Cathleen Baker requested the Equity and Access Subcommittee and/or the Council look into the Federal Transit Administration's 5310 funds to ensure that the agencies receiving funds are meeting accessibility standards and providing services that do not exclude accessibility necessities (such as service dogs).
- Bob Glover mentioned that the Building Industry Association Bay Area has launched a blog on the Bay Area's ability to meet its regional housing needs. It contrasts job growth with the housing needs that we're facing and how we're doing on a local and regional basis. He encouraged the Council to explore the website at <http://www.housing4allbayarea.com/>.

New Business

There was no new business.

Adjournment/Next Meeting

The meeting was adjourned at 2:57 p.m. The next meeting of the Policy Advisory Council is scheduled for January 14, 2015 at 1:30 p.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, 101 8th Street, Oakland, California.