



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov

Programming and Allocations Committee

December 10, 2014

Minutes

Chair Glover called the meeting to order at approximately 9:46 a.m. Committee members present were: Commissioners Bates, Campos, Quan, Tissier, and Wiener. Commission Chair Worth and Vice Chair Cortese were present as ex-officio voting members of the Committee. Other Commissioners present as ad hoc non-voting members of the Committee were: Baker, Giacopini, Haggerty, Halsted, Luce, Mackenzie, and Spering.

Consent Calendar

The Committee unanimously approved the following consent items after a motion by Commissioner Bates and a second by Commissioner Tissier:

- Minutes of the November 12, 2014 meeting;
- 2015 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Amendment 2015-02. MTC Resolution No. 4175, Revised;
- Revision to the Surface Transportation Program/Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (STP/CMAQ) Cycle 1 and 2 programs to redirect funding within the Freeway Performance Initiative (FPI) Program and make revisions to the Priority Conservation Area and Climate Initiatives Programs. MTC Resolution Nos. 3925, Revised and 4035, Revised;
- Revision to the FY2014-15 Fund Estimate. MTC Resolution No. 4133, Revised;
- Allocation of \$6.3 million in Regional Measure 2 funds to the City of Vallejo for the Vallejo Station project. MTC Resolution No. 3819, Revised;
- Proposition 1B – Transit: FY2014-15 Population-based Funds Allocation Request for approximately \$573,000 for one project in the Small Operator/Northern County category. MTC Resolution No. 3880, Revised;
- Revisions to the FY2014-15 FTA Rural Area Formula (Section 5311) Program. MTC Resolution No. 4125, Revised;
- 2014 State Transportation Improvement Program (STIP) Amendment Concurrence for Contra Costa County for the San Pablo Dam Road project;
- Allocation of \$17.6 million in State Transit Assistance (STA) funds to BART for transit operations. MTC Resolution No. 4145, Revised; and
- Programming and allocation of \$500,000 in AB1171 Bridge Toll funds to BART for the eBART project. MTC Resolution No. 3914, Revised.

Federal

- ***Recommendation of Car Sharing Projects for Cycle 2 Climate Initiatives Funds. MTC Resolution No. 4035, Revised.***

Stefanie Hom, Planning Section, presented recommendations for approximately \$2 million of CMAQ Cycle 2 funds for projects that support car sharing.

Amy Rein Worth, Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Dave Cortese, Vice Chair
Santa Clara County

Alicia C. Aguirre
Cities of San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Jason Baker
Cities of Santa Clara County

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
San Jose Mayor's Appointee

Mark Luce
Napa County and Cities

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Julie Pierce
Association of Bay Area Governments

Bijan Sartipi
California State
Transportation Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Vacant
Oakland Mayor's Appointee

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Alix Bockelman
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Commissioner Haggerty asked if TransForm will be working with the suburbs to develop car sharing or if it will only work with the City of Oakland. Carolyn Clevenger, Planning Section, explained that the TransForm project is a partnership with the City of Oakland and the cities of Hayward and San Mateo, which were two of the more suburban communities that applied for the grant application will be funded.

Commissioner Haggerty also asked if outreach was made to the Congestion Management Agencies (CMA) and what the period of funding is for the program. Ms. Clevenger confirmed that information was sent to all of the CMA's and staff offered to present at their Technical Advisory Committee meetings. Alix Bockelman, Deputy Executive Director, explained that the funding is part of the OneBayArea Grant program and all of the money has been programmed for this round which is a part of a four year cycle.

Commissioner Bates commented that this is an excellent program that should be funded in a much more robust manner because it provides an opportunity for people in the suburbs, without a car, to get around town.

Iris Starr, City of Oakland, commented that their staff is in the process of writing a policy report that will go to City Council and that a car sharing firm has expressed interest in developing a point to point car sharing agreement with the City of Oakland.

Commissioner Haggerty asked Ms. Starr to clarify if the funding that MTC approves will be used to establish policies or the implementation of car sharing. Ms. Starr explained that City of Oakland staff will develop policy and the funding is being used for the implementation of car sharing.

He further asked if outreach was made to business parks in Pleasanton and Ms. Clevenger confirmed that yes, they were included in the CCTA projects including Car Share at Bishop Ranch and Hacienda Business Parks as potential car sharing pods.

Commissioner Bates commented that the planning phase is equally as important as the implementation phase to ensure that details such as parking are taken into consideration.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Campos and a second by Commissioner Bates, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution No. 4035, Revised to the Commission for approval.

- ***FY2014-15 Transit Capital Priorities (TCP) and AB 664 Bridge Toll Revenues Preliminary Programs, and Revisions to FY2012-13 and FY2013-14 TCP Programs. MTC Resolution Nos. 4035, Revised, 4084, Revised, 4162, 4163, and 4165.***

Shruti Hari, Programming and Allocations Section, presented requests to program approximately \$404 million in Federal Transit Administration Sections 5307, 5337, and 5339 funds, Cycle 2 Surface Transportation Program funds, and AB 664 Net Bridge Toll Revenues to support transit capital replacement and rehabilitation projects and operating costs in FY2014-15; and to program \$11 million in FY2012-13 and FY2013-14 FTA funds that were previously reserved for Caltrain Electrification to a Caltrain bridge replacement project and SFMTA's GPS project.

Commissioner Campos asked if there is any possibility of finding additional resources to cover some of the improvements that will address the FY2016 shortfall because deferring some of the purchases could end up costing more in the long run. Mr. Heminger explained that other resources are being looked at but there are very limited new funding options.

Commissioner Campos further asked if maintenance plans are required of agencies that are requesting funding for the purchase of new vehicles because this would assist in ensuring that the investment is maximized. Anne Richman, Programming and Allocations Section, explained that there are specific questions included in the call for project regarding the fleet; however, information about long term maintenance is not typically included because ongoing maintenance is considered a local responsibility. Commissioner Campos expressed concern about this because if a maintenance plan is not in place it could mean that the agency will come back in a very short period of time relative to how long it would take if they actually maximize the life of the vehicles. Mr. Heminger commented that maintenance plans do likely exist but are not as transparent as they need to be and most agencies are getting a lot of life out of the vehicles they purchase.

Commissioner Baker directed the Committee's attention to the letter from the General Manager of the Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA) pointing out that the issue with reprogramming of the \$10.5 million is that the money is already in the VTA's adopted budget and he urged the Committee to consider allowing a couple of months to address how the money could be programmed and how to address losing the money. Mr. Heminger explained that this piece of programming could be deferred as suggested in the letter and an alternative option would be to proceed with programming with a condition that the money would not be placed in the federal TIP which is the document that really spends the money which would have the same effect as deferring the decision.

Commissioner Tissier commented on the importance of the bridge replacement projects and stated she is comfortable with continuing this item to further discussions but it will be important to adhere to the funding schedule plan to avoid falling further behind in the schedule for Caltrain.

Commissioner Cortese asked if the discussions could take place before the item comes to Commission or if it would be better to bring it back in January or February. Mr. Heminger explained that the discussions would not likely happen within a couple of weeks; however, Caltrain is hopeful of advertising contracts early in the new-year but cannot do this without funding.

Commissioner Cortese agreed with Commissioner Tissier that continuing the item to allow for further discussions is a good idea and encouraged moving everything else forward to avoid going back to the drawing board to develop a plan.

Commissioner Wiener made a motion to continue the item two months with a default position being staff's recommendation. He further commented on the importance for Caltrain vehicles to be compatible with High Speed Rail vehicles in terms of level boarding.

Commissioner Tissier seconded the motion and further commented that the Joint Powers Board is looking very seriously at the level boarding issue.

Commissioner Bates asked if it is necessary to continue the entire item over two months. Mr. Heminger explained that the whole item would move forward but the Caltrain piece would have a condition in place that would not place it into the TIP for two months allowing an opportunity for discussions before bringing it back before the Commission.

Commissioner Wiener clarified that his motion was to move everything forward today but to delay the Caltrain piece for two months.

Commissioner Bates asked if the Cap and Trade money could be used to assist with some of the Caltrain Electrification funding dilemmas. Mr. Heminger explained that based on what we're seeing in the applicable program of Cap and Trade funding that money is likely to be focused on expansion and not on replacing existing fleets because the core purpose is to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

Commissioner Spring asked how MTC will deal with competing projects in the region for Cap and Trade money. Mr. Heminger explained that draft guidelines are being reviewed to assist in this process.

Commissioner Quan asked if there is a sense of what formulas will be used for the Cap and Trade funds and if they would put the Bay Area at a greater disadvantage. Mr. Heminger explained that the smallest program on the table is a formula program for transit operating purposes and that formula favors the region. However, the other two programs are discretionary which means they are not based on formula.

Commissioner Quan also asked if there are standards that are used to look at matching or is funding based on which agency has the greatest need. Mr. Heminger explained that the draft guidelines have a series of factors that the agencies are considering but there are very disparate approaches among the various cap and trade programs.

Commissioner Quan asked what the proportion of roads versus vehicles have been funded and what percentage has been funded on freeways in the region. Mr. Heminger explained that there is a lot more capital need than this program can fund and as a result over the years a priority system has been used that focuses the investment on replacing vehicles, buses and rail cars and rehabilitating the roads that those rail cars run on. He further explained that in the MTC region less money is spent on freeways than almost any metropolitan area in the country.

Commissioner Wiener restated the motion which is to approve the item with the exception of continuing the one Caltrain item by two months.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Wiener and a second by Commissioner Tissier, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution Nos. 4035, Revised, 4084, Revised, 4162, 4163, and 4165 to the Commission for approval with the exception of continuing the one Caltrain item by two months.

- ***Financial Status of OneBayArea Grant (OBAG) Program and Revisions to Local OBAG Policies. MTC Resolution No. 4035, Revised.***

Craig Goldblatt, Programming and Allocations Section, presented a request to add a fifth year to OBAG 1 to address a funding shortfall in the program and a recommendation to change an upcoming deadline that local jurisdictions need to meet with respect to bicycle/pedestrian and housing policies in their general plans.

Commissioner Haggerty asked if there will be a point when additional funding could be added to Priority Conservation areas. Mr. Goldblatt explained that during FY2016-17 only critical operations and planning programs are proposed to be funded; however, when staff returns to the Committee with the proposal for OBAG 2, all programs in the current cycle will be reported along with recommendations for all of the programs in the next cycle.

Commissioner Worth commented that it is a huge responsibility and obligation for local jurisdictions to comply consistent with the state requirements regarding Housing and Community Development (HCD) and expressed concern about small jurisdictions that are amending their general plan. She asked if technical assistance is being provided to those jurisdictions, particularly for the complete streets revisions. Mr. Goldblatt explained that the office of Planning and Research in Sacramento does offer guidance on how to meet requirements.

Public comments:

Marty Martinez, Safe Routes to Schools National Partnership, expressed concern regarding the shortfall of funding in the new fifth year extension of the OneBayArea Grant program for the Safe Routes to School program and requested that something be done to address this issue.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Wiener and a second by Commissioner Campos, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution No. 4035, Revised to the Commission for approval.

- ***Transit Performance Initiative (TPI) Investment Semi-Annual Report.***

Craig Bosman, Programming and Allocations Section, presented an update on projects in the first round of the TPI Investment program.

Commissioner Spring asked if a report will be provided to the Commission once the projects are completed to outline accomplishment or any performance reviews. Mr. Bosman explained that staff will ask project sponsors to provide information on what travel time savings have developed and advised that San Francisco has already reported preliminary results on transit signal priority and colorized lanes with a 10-20% increase on reliability on routes.

This item was presented as information only and no action was required by the Committee.

California Transportation Commission Update

Anne Richman, Programming and Allocations Section, provided the Committee a brief update on the California Transportation Commission (CTC) meeting held on November 12 in Sacramento, CA, including the State's approval of the Active Transportation Program (ATP),

discussions of the next round of ATP funding, and the retirement announcement of Andre Boutros later this month.

Public Comment/ Information

Roland Lebrun suggested an overlay using Capital Corridor tracks to address the increase of population and traffic congestions near Northbound 85 and Northbound 87 from San Francisco. He also expressed concerns regarding grade separations at the Hillsdale Station project in San Mateo County.

Ken Bukowski advised that he has created a new section on his website called “People” that could be used to search for individuals that are recognized at public meetings and the creation of separate videos for each agenda item presented at public meetings.

Commissioner Glover adjourned the meeting at approximately 11:15 a.m. and noted that the next meeting will be January 14, 2015 at 9:40 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, First Floor, 101 Eighth Street, Oakland, CA.