



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Agenda Item 2a

Joseph
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov

Amy Rein Worth, Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Dave Cortese, Vice Chair
Santa Clara County

Alicia C. Aguirre
Cities of San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
San Jose Mayor's Appointee

Mark Luce
Association of Bay Area Governments

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Joe Pirzynski
Cities of Santa Clara County

Jean Quan
Oakland Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Programming and Allocations Committee
December 11, 2013
Minutes

Chair Glover called the meeting to order at approximately 9:52 a.m. Committee members present were: Vice Chair Campos, Commissioners Dodd, Pirzynski, Quan, Tissier, and Wiener. Commission Chair Worth and Vice Chair Cortese were present as ex-officio voting members of the Committee. Other Commissioners present as ad hoc non-voting members of the Committee were: Giacopini, Haggerty, Halsted, Mackenzie, and Spering.

Consent Calendar

The Committee unanimously approved the following consent items after a motion by Commissioner Dodd and a second by Commissioner Tissier:

- Minutes of the November 13, 2013 meeting;
- Approval of \$5.7 million in allocation requests for Proposition 1B – Transit Security Population-Based Funds. MTC Resolution No. 3882, Revised;
- Revisions to the Third Cycle Lifeline Transportation Program of Projects. MTC Resolution Nos. 4053, Revised and 3880, Revised;
- Revisions to BART Car Replacement Funding Policy Commitment and BART Car Replacement Funding Exchange Agreement. MTC Resolution Nos. 3738, Revised and 4126;
- FY2013-14 and FY2014-15 FTA Nonurbanized Area Formula (Section 5311) Program of Projects. MTC Resolution No. 4125;
- Allocation of \$74,535 in RM2 funds for the LAVTA Automatic Vehicle Location project. MTC Resolution Nos. 3708, Revised and 4050, Revised; and
- Allocation of \$4 million in RM2 funds for WETA Transbay Commute Ferry Service vessels. MTC Resolution No. 3909, Revised.

Regional

- ***Plan Bay Area Investment Implementation.***

Ken Kirkey, MTC Planning Section, presented a proposed regional program architecture for investing Cap and Trade revenues and a process for developing guidelines for individual investment categories.

Alix Bockelman, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented a staff proposal for a policy commitment of approximately \$7.5 billion in federal, state, regional and local funds to high-priority transit capital projects that will improve the capacity and state of good repair of transit services in the region's urban core.

Commissioner Pirzynski provided the Committee an alternative framework for the distribution of the Transit Operating and Efficiency category of the Cap and Trade revenues and requested discussion on how to move forward with this alternative. He further suggested that the reduction of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions should be the primary purpose for the allocation of Cap and Trade revenues.

Public Comments:

Pilar Lorenzana-Campo (Non-Profit Housing Association) suggested a set-aside of at least twenty percent of the region's Cap and Trade funds for affordable housing.

Clarissa Cabansagan (Transform) commented that the current framework remains inadequate with respect to affordable housing and also suggested that the Core Capacity program be reviewed more frequently than every five years.

Claire Jahns (The Nature Conservancy) suggested that a portion of the Cap and Trade funds be directed to conservation of Bay Area agricultural open space and habitat lands.

David Schonbrunn (Transdef) commented that the Cap and Trade framework needs more operating funds to accomplish the plan goals of increasing transit ridership.

Louise Auerhohn (Working Partnership USA) commented that the draft framework is a good starting point but still needs to address jobs co-benefits and affordable housing.

Marybelle Nzegwu (Public Advocates) commented that there is a need to prioritize funding for operations and funding for capital services and that transit needs to be made more affordable and accessible.

Daryl Halls (STA), Maria Lombardo (SF County Transportation Authority), and Monique Webster (San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency) spoke in support of the draft framework.

Jill Rater (Rose Foundation for Communities and the Environment) supports adding funding specifically for affordable housing.

Andre Corpieux expressed concern about how the Cap and Trade framework is structured.

Adina Levin (Friends of Caltrain) recommends that there be a focus on creating affordable housing and achieving mode shift objectives.

Jane Kramer recommends that the Commission focus on creating sustainable communities and start by defining what that means.

Belen Seara (San Mateo County Union Community Alliance) offered recommendations to ensure that the Cap and Trade framework fulfills the goals of the Cap and Trade program to reduce GHG emissions and benefit the most disadvantaged communities.

Commissioner Comments:

Commissioner Pirzynski commented that reducing wait time on public transit is one important way to encourage people to change from driving to public transit in order to reduce GHG emissions, and that it is important for smaller systems as well as the three largest systems.

Commissioner Quan commented that some of the points that members of the public made were valid and she would like to see continued discussions. She further commented that she would

like to have more discussion about the trade-off between operations and capital expenditures because AC Transit ridership is declining due to the elimination of the feeder routes.

MTC Executive Director Steve Heminger explained the origins of the chart Commissioner Pirzynski provided and the development of options on how this operating program could be based on some type of formula.

Commissioner Wiener commented that it is important that a policy-based approach be taken. He noted that the proposal Commissioner Pirzynski has suggested is rather extreme but he is open to further discussion.

Commissioner Tissier commented that she is not sure whether or not the distribution formula for transit operating is the right formula but there are other things that have not been taken into consideration such as Priority Development Areas (PDAs) and transit capacity.

Vice Chair Campos commented that he is supportive of the additional \$100 million for BART to San Jose and he does see this as a beginning of a discussion on the transit operating and efficiency program, which does not necessarily need to be tied to ridership because all of the systems need to be supported.

Commissioner Mackenzie commented that if GHG emissions reductions are the major objective for the Cap and Trade revenues, it would seem that conservation should be directly addressed as one area for funding. He further commented that the Priority Conservation Area (PCA) OneBayArea grants are in the pilot phase and worth continuing.

Commissioner Pirzynski commented that he appreciates the comments made by fellow Commissioners in the start of the discussion. He further commented that this is the opportunity, given the appropriate funding and planning for smaller operators, to begin to approach the levels of transit ridership that San Francisco, AC Transit, and BART have achieved.

Commissioner Sprong asked what would happen if the state does not distribute Cap and Trade funding to the region. Mr. Heminger explained that Cap and Trade is an important feature but it is only about 10-20% of the total funding for the Transit Core Capacity Program and those funds have been assigned to projects to be funded in later years. He further explained that the projects in the Core Capacity category with funding from other sources will get funded in the near term and a solution for any shortfall will have to be developed later.

Commissioner Sprong further commented that the Commission will need to be very transparent about the Cap and Trade allocation and all of the Commissioners need to understand that these funds are being front-loaded. He also asked how Santa Clara was planning to pay for BART cars before this proposal. Mr. Heminger explained that Santa Clara has an agreement with BART that covers a range of obligations for this extension and they are obligated to buy these cars and sales tax measure funds would likely be used for the purchase, if Cap and Trade revenue is not available.

Commissioner Pirzynski made a motion that staff modify the current proposal to include additional options including the small operators and return with options to reflect the discussions

that have already taken place today. Commissioner Tissier seconded the motion, which after further discussion passed unanimously.

- ***Allocation of \$30.2 million in AB 1171, Regional Measure 1 (RM1), and Two Percent Capital funds to the eBART and SMART projects. MTC Resolution Nos. 3833, Revised, 3914, Revised, and 4022, Revised.***

Craig Bosman, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented an allocation request of \$13.5 million in AB 1171 and Regional Measure 1 (RM1) to BART for construction activities on the eBART project, and an allocation request of \$16.7 million in AB 1171 and Two Percent Capital funds for the track, system and station costs for the Sonoma County Airport segment of the SMART project.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Tissier with a second by Commissioner Pirzynski, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution Nos. 3833, Revised, 3914, Revised, and 4022, Revised to the Commission for approval.

State

- ***2014 Regional Transportation Improvement Program of Projects Adoption. MTC Resolution No. 4128.***

Ross McKeown, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented the 2014 RTIP proposal for spending the regional portion of the 2014 State Transportation Improvement Program (STIP).

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Pirzynski with a second by Commissioner Tissier, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution No. 4128 to the Commission for approval.

Federal

- ***Freeway Performance Initiatives (FPI) Programming Revision and Agreement with the Contra Costa Transportation Authority (CCTA) to exchange Regional Discretionary Funds for Measure J funds. MTC Resolution Nos. 3925, Revised, 4035, Revised and 4124.***

Ross McKeown, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented a revision to the FPI program to align funding availability with project timelines and to expand the local flexibility exchange program.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Tissier with a second by Commissioner Pirzynski, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution Nos. 3925, Revised, 4035, Revised and 4124 to the Commission for approval.

Public Comment/ Information

Chair Glover adjourned the meeting at approximately 11:53 a.m.