



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
EMAIL info@mtc.ca.gov  
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

*Amy Rein Worth, Chair*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Dave Cortese, Vice Chair*  
Santa Clara County

*Alicia C. Aguirre*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*David Campos*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacomini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Scott Haggerty*  
Alameda County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sam Liccardo*  
San Jose Mayor's Appointee

*Mark Luce*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Joe Pirzynski*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Jean Quan*  
Oakland Mayor's Appointee

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Adrienne J. Tissier*  
San Marco County

*Scott Wiener*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Policy Advisory Council  
November 13, 2013  
**Minutes**

Acting Chair Naomi Armenta called the meeting to order at 1:37 p.m. Other members in attendance were Cathleen Baker, Jim Blacksten, Richard Burnett, Carlos Castellanos, Chris Coursey, Wilbert Din, Veda Florez, Sandi Galvez, Bob Glover, Jack Gray, Richard Hedges, Randi Kinman, Jerry Levine, Mark Nicholson, Timothy Reeder, Gerald Rico, Benjamin Schweng, and Mordechai Winter. **Excused:** Caroline Banuelos, JoAnn Busenbark, Bena Chang, Elizabeth Clary, Linda Jeffery Sailors, Mike Pechner, and Alan Talansky

**Approval of Meeting Minutes**

The minutes of the October 9, 2013 meeting were approved after a motion by Richard Hedges and a second by Jerry Levine. Mordechai Winter abstained from the vote, as he was absent from the October meeting.

**Public Comment**

There was no public comment.

**Subcommittee Reports**

Ms. Armenta reported that the Equity & Access Subcommittee did not meet this month and the date and time for the next meeting will be determined based on agenda items.

**Plan Bay Area Implementation**

Ken Kirkey, Planning Director, presented an overview of proposed regional program architecture for investing Cap and Trade revenues. Following Mr. Kirkey's presentation, Alix Bockelman, Director of Programming and Allocations, described a proposed new program to target federal, state and regional funds to high-priority transit capital projects that will improve the capacity and state of good repair of transit services in the urban core of the region. The Council asked clarifying questions and had the following comments:

- Several members stated they support the proposed 25% set-aside for disadvantaged communities across funding categories.
- Some members were cautious about tying these funds to PDA growth areas until we know how they are performing.

– more –

### **Plan Bay Area Implementation (continued)**

- Several members felt the terms “workforce” housing and “affordable” housing should not be used interchangeably. The focus should be on affordable housing; MTC should use the term affordable housing, clearly define the term and not leave the definition up to local entities.
- It is important to see operator results on the third Transit Sustainability Project (TSP) performance metric (% change in operating cost per passenger miles) before making a final determination on this proposal.
- Some members were interested in seeing the percentage of transit-dependent ridership for each operator – this may be a more important metric for determining need than total percent of ridership for the region.
- One advisor expressed concern about the impact of increased growth on communities of concern outside the area of the three major transit agencies.
- MTC should lay out a best practices model for improving performance. Allowing operators to close routes to save money is not a sustainable model. If an operator “cuts costs,” what does that mean to the community?
- A long-term solution to the problem of transit operations costs should be created, instead of a quick bailout.
- MTC should ensure that all funds allocated to operators for fleet replacement are actually used in that way. Operators should not use these funds as part of their ongoing operations budget and should not be allowed to move these funds to cover other expenses.
- While the proposals allow for flexibility, there should not be so much flexibility that CMAAs are able to put all the funds into pavement vs. funding affordable housing.
- With this, or any proposal, don’t lose sight of those counties who have been paying into their transportation system for many years via tax measures.

Ms. Armenta agreed to make the presentation to the Commission at the November 20<sup>th</sup> meeting on behalf of the Council.

### **Council Orientation**

Senior Legislative Analyst Rebecca Long presented an overview of the role and responsibilities of the Legislation and Public Affairs Section. The Council made comments, asked clarifying questions and received responses from staff.

### **MTC 2014 Draft Advocacy Program**

Ms. Long also presented MTC’s 2014 Draft Advocacy Program. The Council had clarifying questions and a few comments, and Ms. Long reminded the advisors that she will continue to take their comments until the program is adopted by the Commission in December.

### **Nominations for 2013-2014 Policy Advisory Council Chair and Vice Chair**

Staff liaison Pam Grove opened the nomination period for the Policy Advisory Council's 2013-2014 elections for chair and vice chair.

Speaking on behalf of JoAnn Busenbark, Naomi Armenta nominated Cathleen Baker for Chair and Randi Kinman for Vice Chair. Sandi Galvez nominated Randi Kinman for Chair and Cathleen Baker for Vice Chair. Wilbert Din nominated Randi Kinman for Chair and Carlos Castellanos for Vice Chair. All of the individuals accepted their nomination.

Ms. Grove reminded the Council that nominations will remain open until the election, which is scheduled for the beginning of the December 11, 2013 meeting.

### **Staff Liaison Report**

The Council received the staff liaison report from Ms. Grove, who gave additional housekeeping reminders. Ms. Grove also commented that Wil Din and MTC Commissioner Anne Halstead were honored by Chinatown CDC for their long-term contributions to communities in San Francisco.

### **Council Member Reports**

Jim Blacksten gave a brief report on the Youth for the Environment and Sustainability (YES) Conference held on November 2, 2013.

### **New Business**

Randi Kinman requested the Council receive a six-month report of the Free Muni for Youth Pilot Program offered by SFMTA.

### **Adjournment/Next Meeting**

The meeting was adjourned at 3:47 p.m. The next Policy Advisory Council meeting is scheduled for December 11, 2013 in the Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, California.