

Metropolitan Transportation Commission Programming and Allocations Committee

November 14, 2012

Item Number 2c

Resolution No. 4073

Subject: FY2012-13 MTC Productivity Improvement Program (PIP)

Background: In accordance with the Transportation Development Act (TDA), MTC annually adopts a PIP, a set of projects to be undertaken by transit operators in the region during the fiscal year to improve productivity and lower operating costs. Historically, projects have been derived from recommendations made in the operators' most recently completed Triennial Performance Audits (presented in item 3d). A finding that an operator has made a reasonable effort in implementing its PIP project(s) is required before allocating the TDA or State Transit Assistance (STA) funds to the operator. The findings relative to FY2012-13 PIP projects will pertain to the allocation of FY2013-14 funds. In future cycles, PIP projects may be derived from service and institutional recommendations or strategic plans developed by the largest seven operators to achieve targets set forth in MTC's Transit Sustainability Program (MTC Resolution 4060).

Attachment 1 summarizes the status of the current PIP projects. Operators are not included in the PIP if they have already completed all of the projects recommended in their most recently completed Triennial Performance Audits or if they choose to implement a performance audit recommendation in the second or third year following the audit. All audit recommendations must be addressed by each operator prior to their next audit.

Attachment A to Resolution No. 4073 lists each FY2012-13 PIP project, including project description, goals and milestones. In several cases, operators have commenced a project prior to adoption of the PIP, and certain milestones for such projects will be shown in the project listing as "completed". Recommendations for FY2012-13 include projects for AC Transit, BART, ECCTA, CCCTA, Fairfield and Suisun Transit, Golden Gate, NCTPA, the City of Petaluma, the City of Rio Vista, the City of Union City, SFMTA, SCVTA, SamTrans, and the City of Santa Rosa.

Issues: None.

Recommendation: Refer MTC Resolution No. 4073 to the Commission for approval

Attachments: Attachment 1 – List of Operators and Audit Recommendations
MTC Resolution No. 4073

**2010 - Most Recent Audit Report (FY2006-07, FY2007-08, and FY2008-09)
FY2012-13 - Last Year Recommendations are Expected to be Addressed**

AGENCY	RECOMMENDATION	STATUS
FAST	1 Examine the Inconsistency Between Paratransit Vehicle Service Hours and Vehicle Service Miles in FY2008 to Determine if There is a Data Collection or Reporting Error	Completed
	2 Continue to Improve Procedures for Routine Performance Monitoring and Assessing Performance against Standards	In Progress
	3 Continue to Monitor Reporting and Trends in ADA Paratransit Service Denials to Ensure Compliance with the ADA Standards	Completed
	4 Develop Service Plan for Improving the Local Fixed Route System (Excludes Intercity Routes) *	In Progress
LAVTA	1 Continue Efforts to Monitor Casualty/Liability Costs by Mode to Ensure More Accurate Recording and Reporting	Completed
	2 Increase Efforts to Improve On-Time Performance for the Bus Service	Completed
SFMTA	1 Provide MTC with Documentation of the Resources Expended in Recent Years Toward Improving the Quality of the Motor Coach Customer Experience.	Completed
	2 Coordinate With MTC to Resolve Clipper Issues Impacting the SB602 Revenue Sharing Agreements Required with Connecting Operators	In Progress
	3 Continue Efforts Toward Achievement of All Proposition E Service Standards	In Progress
	4 Expand the Use of Maintenance Reporting to Improve Service Reliability	In Progress
	5 Incorporate the Set Of Goals, Objectives, Measures and Standards that Address Paratransit Performance into the Primary Performance Monitoring Process	Completed
Union City	1 Modify the Performance Standard for ADA Paratransit Service Denials to Ensure Compliance with the Federal ADA Guidelines	In Progress
	2 Continue to Address Declines in Fixed Route Vehicle Maintenance Performance and Improve Contractor Maintenance Activities	In Progress
	3 Add Permanent School Tripper Service for School Bell Times on Existing Scheduled Runs to Accomodate a Large Increase in Student Ridership *	Completed
VTA	1 Increase Efforts to Improve On-Time Performance in the Bus and Light Rail Systems	Completed
	2 Achieve Transit Sustainability Project (TSP) Performance Targets *	In Progress

* Additional Project Added by Operator

**2011 - Most Recent Audit Report (FY2007-08, FY2008-09, and FY2009-10
FY2013-14 - Last Year Recommendations are Expected to be Addressed**

AGENCY	RECOMMENDATION	STATUS
AC Transit	1 Continue to Take Steps to Complete All Preventive Maintenance Inspections On Schedule	In Progress
	2	
	3 Configure The District's New Performance Monitoring Program to Maximize Its Utility as a Management Decision-Making Tool	
	4 Continue Efforts to Improve Schedule Adherence and Other Service Delivery Performance	
	5 Address the Continuing Increase in the Rate of Calls for Protective Services Assistance	In Progress
	6 Continue Working to Improve the Maintenance Processes That Drive the Road Call Trends	In Progress
	7 Monitor Current Call Center Operations to Ensure a Minimal Call Abandonment Rate	
BART	1 Review and Address Fringe Benefit Costs *	In Progress
	2	
CCCTA	1 Continue Efforts to Maintain Recent Levels of Rail Car Fleet Reliability	
	2 Continue to Address the Perception Among Passengers that Police Presence is Substandard	In Progress
	3	
	4	
CCCTA	1 Evaluate On-Time Performance Standards for the Fixed Route and Paratransit Services	Completed
	2 Take Steps to Control Increasing Fixed Route and Paratransit Accident Rates	In Progress
	3 Continue to Work with the LINK Contractor to Reduce the Turnover Rate of Contractor Employees	In Progress
	4 Reduce the Spare Ratio of the Fixed Route Fleet *	Completed
Petaluma	1 Take Steps to Examine the Reporting of Performance Data by Operations Contractors to Ensure Data is Collected Timely and Accurately	Completed
	2 Continue Efforts to Improve Cost Efficiency, Cost Effectiveness and Passenger Productivity for Both the City's Bus and Paratransit Services	Completed
	3 Take Steps to Ensure that Operations Contractors are Reporting Required Performance Indicator Data	In Progress
	4 Make Efforts to Improve Performance to the Fixed Route Miles Between Preventable Accidents Area	
Santa Rosa	1 Initiate Efforts to Improve Cost Efficiency and Cost Effectiveness for the City's Paratransit Service	
	2 Fixed Route System Evaluation and Service Improvements *	In Progress
	3 Enhanced Automated Vehicle Locator System *	In Progress
Sonoma	1	
	2 Continue Efforts to Improve Passenger Productivity for the Paratransit Service	
	3 Evaluate the Paratransit Reservation Process and Develop Strategies to Improve Performance	
	1 Continue Reporting to MTC on the Progress Towards Meeting the Fixed Route Farebox Recovery Ratio Standard	

* Additional Project Added by Operator

**2012 - Most Recent Audit Report (FY2008-09, FY2009-10, and FY2010-11)
FY2014-15- Last Year Recommendations are Expected to be Addressed**

AGENCY	RECOMMENDATION	STATUS
Dixon	1 Develop a Formal Process for Evaluating Passenger Needs, Building on the Current Informal Process	
Golden Gate	1 Develop and Implement Mode-specific Plans for Improving its Cost Efficiency	
	2 Evaluate Bus Operator Absences in Order to Formulate and Implement a Plan that will Reduce Absences and Meet the Performance Standard	
	3 Evaluate Ferry Crew and Mechanic Absences in Order to Formulate and Implement a Plan that will Reduce Absences and Meet the Performance Standard	
	4 Continue to Evaluate Ferry On-time Performance and Develop Strategies to Improve Schedule Adherence	In Progress
	5 Keep MTC Apprised of the Efforts to Finalize the Development of Performance Standards and to Incorporate these into the District's Routine Performance Monitoring Program	
NCTPA	1 Expedite Completion of Joint Fare Revenue Sharing Agreements with all Connecting Operators in Order to be in Compliance with the Requirements of SB 602	In Progress
	2 Continue Strategies to Address the Declining Passenger Productivity and Cost Effectiveness of NCTPA's Bus Service	In Progress
	3 Develop a Plan to Improve Fixed Route On-time Performance	
	4 Develop a Plan to Improve Performance in Miles Between Preventable Accidents	
	5 Develop a Plan to Improve Performance in Miles Between Road Calls	
	6 Continue the Process to Ensure that NCTPA's Routine Performance Monitoring is Consistent with Established Measures and Standards	In Progress
	7 Continue the Process to Control Passenger Cancellations on the Paratransit Service	Completed
	8 New Fare Collection System for VINE Transit System *	In Progress
Rio Vista	1 Investigate the Uncharacteristic Differences between the Rates of Change in Reported Vehicle Service Hours and Vehicle Service Miles in FY2010 and FY2011 in Order to Determine the Reasons for the Deviations and Correct any Reporting Deficiencies if Found	Completed
	2 Examine the Causes of the Worsening Trend in On-time Performance and Determine what Steps Need to be Taken in Order to Improve it	
	3 Continue to Report to MTC on the Status of the Adoption of Performance Measures and Standards, and their Incorporation into the SRTP Document	Completed
SamTrans	1 Develop a Plan to Improve the Performance in Miles between Preventable Accidents for SamTrans' Fixed Route Services	
	2 Continue Efforts to Revise the Long Term Performance Standards and Measures Contained in the SRTP	In Progress
Tri Delta	1 Examine Potential Strategies for Addressing the Declining Passenger Productivity and Cost Effectiveness of the Paratransit Service	In Progress
	2 Continue to Monitor Fixed Route Farebox Recovery Ratio and Develop Strategies to Improve Performance	
	3 Develop an Action Plan to Improve Performance in On-time Pickups for Tri Delta Transit's Paratransit Service	Completed
	4 Continue the Evaluation of Performance Standards to Meet Goals and Objectives	
	5 Continue Efforts to Evaluate the Increased Rate of Lost Calls for the Fixed Route Service and Take Steps to Improve Performance	
Vacaville	1 Continue to Monitor Paratransit Farebox Recovery Ratio and Develop Strategies to Improve Performance	
WestCAT	1 Develop a Plan to Identify the Cause(s) and Correct the Declining Performance in Miles between Preventable Accidents for WestCAT's Paratransit Services	
	2 Review the Performance Standards and Measures in all WestCAT Performance Reporting Materials and Procedures to Ensure	

* Additional Project Added by Operator

Date: November 28, 2012
W.I.: 1514
Referred By: PAC

ABSTRACT

Resolution No. 4073

This resolution adopts MTC's FY2012-13 Productivity Improvement Program (PIP).

Further discussion of this action is contained in the Programming and Allocation's Summary Sheet for November 14, 2012.

Date: November 28, 2012
W.I.: 1514
Referred By: PAC

Re: MTC Productivity Improvement Program

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
RESOLUTION NO. 4073

WHEREAS, Public Utilities Code (PUC) section 99244 provides that each transportation planning agency shall annually identify, analyze, and recommend potential productivity improvements which could lower the operating costs of transit operators within the area under its jurisdiction; and

WHEREAS, as provided for in Government Code sections 66500 et seq., the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) is the regional transportation planning agency for the San Francisco Bay Area; and

WHEREAS, PUC section 99244 provides that recommendations for improvements and productivity shall include, but not be limited to, those recommendations related to productivity made in the triennial performance audits of transit operators conducted pursuant to PUC section 99246; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99244, MTC is required each fiscal year, to make a finding that a transit operator has made a reasonable effort in implementing productivity improvement recommendations prior to approving the allocation of Transportation Development Act funds in an amount greater than was allocated to the operator in the preceding fiscal year; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99314.7, MTC is required each fiscal year, to make a finding that a transit operator has made reasonable effort in implementing productivity improvements pursuant to PUC section 99244, prior to approving the allocation of State Transit Assistance funds to the operator for operating purposes; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99233.2, MTC may support the regional transportation planning process by providing technical assistance funding to transit operators or other entities to implement transit productivity improvements; and

WHEREAS, MTC adopted Resolution No. 3617, which describes MTC's statutory responsibilities related to the identification, development and recommendation of transit productivity improvements through the MTC Productivity Improvement Program, and which reference MTC's administrative procedures attendant to these programs; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that MTC adopts the performance audit-based projects, and other productivity improvement projects, as the case may be, set forth in Attachment A to this resolution, and incorporated herein by reference.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair

The above resolution was adopted by the
Metropolitan Transportation Commission
at a regular meeting of the Commission held in
Oakland, California, on November 28, 2012.

Date: November 28, 2012
W.I.: 1514
Referred By: PAC

Attachment A
Resolution No. 4073
Page 1 of 25

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: AC Transit

Project Title: Continue to Take Steps to Complete All Preventive Maintenance Inspections on Schedule

Project Goal: Ensure that all preventive maintenance inspections are scheduled and implemented on time.

Project Description: Develop State of Good Repair-funded maintenance practices, upgrade asset management and service scheduling program, implement protocols to ensure proper use and scheduling. Assess vehicle condition and schedule improvements.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Assess asset management database and scheduling software options.	10%
2	November 2012	Update maintenance manual/practices.	20%
3	December 2012	Implement new software.	20%
4	March 2013	Implement new maintenance protocols.	25%
5	June 2013	Assess vehicle condition and schedule improvements.	25%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **AC Transit**

Project Title: Address the Continuing Increase in the Rate of Calls for Protective Services Assistance

Project Goal: Augment Baseline Security Enforcement to reduce the calls for protective services assistance.

Project Description: AC Transit receives monthly statistics from the Law Enforcement agencies contracted to provide security for AC Transit properties, buses and bus stops. These statistics reflect all major incidences on or around district property, including passenger and operator assaults. AC Transit will focus additional resources in areas when the data indicates that there is an apparent spike in assaults or other serious crime, such as robberies. The District will augment baseline security enforcement with teams of uniformed deputies who will ride the bus lines in the affected area during the usual time frame when the crimes occur.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Procure and install and maintain bus cameras on all buses to reduce crime and false reporting.	50%
2	Completed	Add up to four new sheriffs.	25%
3	December 2012	Increase number of buses ridden by Sheriffs to 10 buses per month per agency (Alameda and Contra Costa Sheriffs' Departments).	25%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **AC Transit**

Project Title: Continue Working to Improve the Maintenance Processes That Drive the Road Call Trends

Project Goal: Implement the State of Good Repair Program to reduce road calls.

Project Description: AC Transit is seeking grant funding from FTA to hire a consultant to review current practices and update them to industry standards and also make sure the condition of the buses are all updated to a state of good repair.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Solicit consultant services and conduct needs assessment.	10%
2	Completed	Procurement process for asset management system.	10%
3	November 2012	Create and implement a State of Good Repair process (asset management system; vehicle condition assessment).	75%
4	December 2012	Document best practices/lessons learned from State of Good Repair Program.	5%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **AC Transit**

Project Title: Review and Address Fringe Benefit Costs

Project Goal: Reduce fringe benefit costs.

Project Description: Conduct an analysis of fringe benefit costs and implement cost-cutting measures.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Review medical insurance options.	15%
2	Completed	Review history of costs and relationship to other employers.	10%
3	Completed	Review pension benefits.	15%
4	Completed	Review pension history, unfunded liability, comparison to other retirement benefits.	10%
5	December 2012	Identify cost cutting measures.	20%
6	July 2013	Implement changes.	30%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **BART**

Project Title: Continue to Address the Perception among Passengers That Police Presence is Substandard

Project Goal: Improve customer perception of police presence on trains and in stations and parking facilities.

Project Description: Strengthen police services to our customers and employees through more effective and efficient high visibility patrols.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Provide a minimum of two (2) random train sweep inspections per patrol officer per shift during revenue hours.	20%
2	Completed	Deploy Critical Asset Corridor Patrol Team to patrol Downtown Oakland and San Francisco BART Stations during the weekday high commute morning and evening hours.	20%
3	Completed	Develop a new deployment strategy where personnel are highly visible on our busiest platforms during the weekday morning and evening commute hours.	20%
4	Completed	Redesign zones and beat structure to deploy personnel where they are most needed.	20%
6	December 2013	Use crime analysis and deploy bike patrols to parking structures and around stations where there are high incidents of bike thefts and vehicle burglaries.	20%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Central Contra Costa Transit Authority**

Project Title: Take Steps to Control Increasing Fixed Route and Paratransit Accident Rates

Project Goals: Increase Focus on Driver Safety and Reducing Chargeable Accidents. Reduce chargeable accidents through increased driver training and other accident prevention strategies.

Project Description: Use new on-board camera systems to analyze accident causes. Educate and train drivers to anticipate hazardous situations. Meet the agency's performance goals of 1 chargeable accident per 100,000 miles for fixed route and 0.3 chargeable accidents for paratransit services.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	January 2013	Installation of upgraded on-board camera systems.	33%
2	June 2013	Review and update driver training program to further emphasize accident prevention.	33%
3	June 2013	Review and update First Transit's driver training program to further emphasize accident prevention.	34%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Central Contra Costa Transit Authority**

Project Title: Continue to Work with the LINK Contractor to Reduce the Turnover Rate of Contractor Employees

Project Goals: Work with First Transit to keep employee turnover down.

Project Description: Measure First Transit's employee turnover rate against the agency goal of 5%. Work to keep turnover low by paying competitive wages by ensuring reasonable work hours and fringe benefits. Encourage employee appreciation efforts undertaken by the contractor. Replace equipment and provide drivers with the necessary resources to perform their jobs with the least amount of stress.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	June 2013	Monitor First Transit employee turnover.	33%
2	June 2013	Review and update First transit's driver wages and benefits.	33%
3	June 2013	Improve on-board tools for wayfinding and trip reporting to ease workload.	34%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Eastern Contra Costa Transit Authority (Tri-Delta)**

Project Title: Examine Potential Strategies for Addressing the Declining Passenger Productivity and Cost Effectiveness of the Paratransit Service

Project Goals: Improve the on-time performance of the demand-response (DR) service.

Project Description: Work closely with contractor to improve the on-time performance of the demand-response system so that paratransit passengers will receive more dependable service. Scheduling and software issues will be addressed.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Work with contractor to ensure understanding of goal and discuss methods to achieve it.	25%
2	Completed	Contract Trapeze expert to evaluate scheduling software and suggest and implement improvements.	25%
3	March 2013	Provide necessary training to schedulers to effectively utilize enhancements in software scheduling program.	25%
4	June 2013	Continue to evaluate DR on-time performance monthly to ensure improvement to stated standard.	25%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Fairfield and Suisun Transit (FAST)**

Project Title: Continue to Improve Procedures for Routine Performance Monitoring and Assessing Performance against Standards

Project Goals: To ensure staff understands the strengths and weaknesses of its fixed route system on a continual basis to allow for sound business decisions that will ensure the long-term stability of its system.

Project Description: Fairfield and Suisun Transit (FAST) will revise its performance standards, procedures, and monthly reports for monitoring performance against these standards to gauge productivity, efficiency and farebox recovery, and reliability on a continual basis.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Establish sound data collection procedures through the use of the GFI Farebox and Trapeze scheduling systems.	25%
2	November 2011	Work with consultant (Solutions for Transit) to maximize reporting options that will provide readily available performance monitoring information.	15%
3	April 2012	Develop planning reports that specifically identify performance goals and standards, as well as the monthly and historical performance data that assess performance against goals and standards.	20%
4	April 2012	Develop internal staff procedures/processes for ensuring that staff is monitoring and assessing performance.	20%
5	June 2012	Develop plan for addressing poor performance.	20%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Fairfield And Suisun Transit (FAST)**

Project Title: Develop Service Plan for Improving the Local Fixed Route System (Excludes Intercity Routes)

Project Goals: To increase the farebox recovery ratio and efficiency of the local (non-intercity) fixed route system.

Project Description: The local fixed route system includes all routes that operate within the city limits of the City of Fairfield. Staff plans to implement service changes that would result in improvements to the efficiency, productivity, and farebox recovery ratio of the local system to allow for long-term stability.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Develop a new service plan/design for the local fixed route system.	25%
2	Completed	Develop outreach plan for obtaining public input on new service plan/design.	10%
3	Completed	Implement outreach plan and obtain public input on new service plan/design.	15%
4	Completed	Revise (as needed) the new service plan/design per public comments.	15%
5	Completed	Obtain City Council approval of the changes.	5%
6	December 2012	Implement new service plan/design.	30%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Golden Gate Bridge Highway Transportation District**

Project Title: Continue to Evaluate Ferry On-Time Performance and Develop Strategies to Improve Schedule Adherence

Project Goals: Improve overall ferry service reliability.

Project Description: This project will address issues identified in the Performance Audit including scheduling adherence, trip cancelations and mechanical failures. The response will center on planned fleet improvements including vessel acquisition and rehabilitation.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Put first newly acquired high-speed Ferry into Service.	33%
2	Completed	Repower Del Norte Vessel.	33%
3	Completed	Refurbish and put into service second newly acquired high-speed ferry.	34%
4	June 2013	Continue ongoing Ferry overhaul and refurbishment program.	100%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Napa County Transportation and Planning Agency (NCTPA)**

Project Title: Expedite Completion of Joint Fare Revenue Sharing Agreements with all Connecting Operators in Order to be in Compliance with the Requirements of SB 602

Project Goal: Compliance with the requirements of SB602. Formulate Joint Fare Revenue Sharing Agreements with BART and the Baylink Ferry in Order to be in Compliance with the Requirements of SB 602

Project Description: NCTPA introduced an express route, VINE Route 29, that connects with the BART El Cerrito Del Norte station and the Baylink Ferry. NCTPA's existing joint revenue sharing agreements do not extend to either of these two services. NCTPA will formulate joint fare revenue sharing agreements with BART and Baylink Ferry in order to be in compliance with the requirements of SB602.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	February 2013	Revenue Sharing Agreement- Soltrans, FAST, Rio Vista.	20%
2	August 2013	Revenue Sharing Agreement- Baylink Ferry.	40%
3	August 2013	Revenue Sharing Agreement- BART.	40%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Napa County Transportation and Planning Agency (NCTPA)**

Project Title: Continue Strategies for Addressing the Declining Passenger Productivity and Cost Effectiveness of NCTPA's Bus Service

Project Goal: NCTPA will examine strategies for aligning its service levels to more closely match demand.

Project Description: NCTPA's bus service experienced increases in service levels over the six year period, particularly in FY2009. At the same time, ridership has declined. As a result, NCTPA's passenger productivity declined sharply, which has further resulted in a worsening trend in cost effectiveness. NCTPA will look at strategies to align its service levels to more closely match demand.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Completion of Route Revision analysis.	30%
2	Completed	Implementation of Route Revision analysis.	40%
3	December 2014	Farebox procurement and installation with customer reporting functionality.	30%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Napa County Transportation and Planning Agency (NCTPA)**

Project Title: Continue the Process to Ensure that NCTPA’s Routine Performance Monitoring is Consistent with Established Measures and Standards

Project Goal: Improve the completeness and accuracy of NCTPA’s performance monitoring efforts.

Project Description: NCTPA establishes and revises its goals, objectives and performance measures through its SRTP development process. NCTPA then monitors its transit performance through monthly reports from its contractors and internal monitoring spreadsheets developed and updated by NCTPA staff. NCTPA needs to review its established measures, standards and performance monitoring procedures to ensure consistency between the stated measures and standards and actual monitoring of those measures. This will help improve the completeness and accuracy of NCTPA’s performance monitoring efforts.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	In 2009 NCTPA established a Transit Efficiency sub-Committee of the Board of Directors to monitor performance standards on an on-going, quarterly basis.	20%
2	Completed	Implement GPS software system to monitor on-time performance.	25%
3	December 2012	Supervisors to conduct physical time and point checks.	15%
4	December 2012	Addition behind the wheel and safety training with follow through by purchase transportation provider management.	15%
5	December 2012	Monitor on-time performance and accident reports from purchased transportation provider.	25%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Napa County Transportation and Planning Agency (NCTPA)**

Project Title: New Fare Collection System for VINE Transit System

Project Goal: The procurement and installation of a new fare collections system will support the VINE transit line's complex requirement of fare collection, reporting, and new fare media to better serve our customers who ride the VINE system.

Project Description: The VINE transit service currently utilizes an antiquated fare box collection system that is obsolete. The fare collection system has difficulty generating accurate reports and data needed to forecast the transit line revenues and reconcile money received. The procurement of a new farebox collection system will greatly enhance the public transit experience for our customers by allowing the customer the ability to pay for their respective fare with several different options such as currency, credit card, or electronically.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Request for Proposal (RFP) for Farebox Analysis.	15%
2	Completed	Report of needs analysis of products/technologies available to serve the VINE transit system.	20%
3	November 2012	Create RFP for new collection system. Submit RFP to public, review, and select vendor.	20%
4	February 2013	Award contract.	15%
5	December 2013	Delivery and installation of new fare boxes and installation into VINE buses.	30%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **City of Petaluma**

Project Title: Operations Contractor Reporting of Performance Indicator Data

Project Goal: Ensure that the City's operations contractors are reporting the required performance data in a complete, timely, and accurate way.

Project Description: The City's contract with MV Transportation includes a list of performance indicators that they are required to report in writing each month to the City. During the Triennial TDA Audit, it was discovered that performance data for several of the indicators were not included in the monthly reports submitted by the contractors. This project aims to correct this and ensure that the operators are reporting complete, timely, and accurate data.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Award new operations contract.	25%
2	Completed	Begin new operations contract.	5%
3	Completed	Meet with operations contractor to define format for periodic reporting.	15%
4	Completed	Review contractor performance reports for first six months of contract.	15%
5	November 2012	Revisit reporting procedures to ensure selected method is effective.	15%
6	<i>On-going</i>	Monitor contractor performance reports.	25%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)**

Project Title: Coordinate With MTC to Resolve Clipper Issues Impacting the SB602 Revenue Sharing Agreements Required with Connecting Operators

Project Goal: SFMTA indicated that it plans to work with the other operators and to update all agreements in the next year. This should be accomplished in conjunction with MTC, in order to accommodate the various interagency fare models with Clipper, and bring SFMTA into full compliance with the statute.

Project Description: SFMTA is in compliance with most of the sections of the state PUC that were reviewed as part of this performance audit. However, in the revenue sharing area, SFMTA is only in partial compliance. The SB602 mandated revenue sharing agreement with AC Transit is not supported by existing Clipper functionality, and components of the agreement with SamTrans have expired as well.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	June 2013	Obtain all requisite approvals for streamlined and consistent cash fare transfer policy for all customers transferring to Muni from connecting service, including Title VI analysis, MTA Board resolution and requisite public hearings.	50%
2	TBD	Develop and implement new transfer fares on Clipper (the timeline for this action is dependent on MTC prioritization).	50%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)**

Project Title: Continue Efforts toward Achievement of All Proposition E Service Standards

Project Goal: Improve transit service reliability, including improving on-time performance and reducing missed service, breakdowns and pass-ups.

Project Description: Muni transit customers consistently identify reliability as the most important issue that SFMTA needs to address in the provision of transit service. The Transit Effectiveness Project (TEP) had identified a series of initiatives which have been adopted by the agency as a roadmap to improve on-time performance, including (1) providing more realistic schedules, (2) reducing missed service, most importantly by achieving full operator availability, (3) improving vehicle and infrastructure reliability, (4) improving service delivery management, and (5) congestion management. The milestones listed below summarize key efforts underway to achieve these goals.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	March 2013	Improve service reliability by reducing not-outs (missed service). This action will also reduce overcrowding and increase on-time performance.	30%
2	March 2013	Implement portions of the TEP - (1) Provide realistic schedules, (2) Ensure there are an adequate number of available operators based on service demands, (3) Improve service management, (4) reduce traffic congestion.	30%
3	June 2013	Achieve Prop E goal of 98.5% of all Scheduled Service Hours and 85% On-Time Performance (OTP).	40%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)**

Project Title: Expand the Use of Maintenance Reporting to Improve Service Reliability

Project Goal: SFMTA should use the maintenance data collected for routine performance reporting as input toward a more formal action plan to improve service reliability.

Project Description: The prior performance audit identified the need for a comprehensive evaluation of SFMTA’s maintenance standards and practices. This was in an effort to improve substandard service reliability and to determine if resources were being used efficiently, particularly for the trolley coach and light rail services. SFMTA reported that during the current audit period, Transit Operations continues to produce a Service Delivery Daily Report, and a Service Performance Report on a weekly basis. The reports cover key elements related to service performance including maintenance standards such as mean distance between failures (MDBF), preventive maintenance inspections and vehicle availability. However it is not clear what actions are taken based on the results, and there does not appear to be a definitive improving trend in service reliability, especially for trolley coach and light rail.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
2	Completed	The FY13 and FY 14 budgets allow us to hire over 100 new maintenance personnel in order to fleet reliability.	20%
2	July 2014	The Board has approved the purchase of 45 new hybrid buses (2013) and we are aggressively pursuing replacement of 60 trolley coaches (2014).	30%
3	June 2015	SFMTA is starting a period of major fleet investment. Rehabilitation programs are currently underway for the LRV fleet, historic streetcar fleet, and motor coach fleet. Rehabilitation programs were planned using system failure data and identifying the systems causing the most problems.	50%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **San Mateo County Transit District (SamTrans)**

Project Title: Continue Efforts to Revise the Long Term Performance Standards and Measures Contained in the Short Range Transit Plan

Project Goal: This is being done through two means: the SamTrans Service Plan (ongoing, with projected completion of the analysis phase in 2012) and coordination with the MTC Transit Sustainability Project. SamTrans will examine per-to-peer assessments of service performance and look at maximizing efficiency and ongoing.

Project Description: SamTrans will continue to provide updates to its quarterly performance monitoring program; conduct a detailed analysis of service provision and coordinate with the MTC TSP for regional metrics of service performance.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Participate in MTC Transit Sustainability Project and committees.	50%
2	Fall 2012	Conduct service analysis through the SamTrans Service Plan to update baseline information and prepare recommended future performance metrics and standards ("long-term target items" as recommended in the audit report).	50%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (SCVTA)**

Project Title: Achieve SCVTA Transit Sustainability (TSP) Performance Target

Project Goal: Increase VTA Transit operation's productivity per MTC's TSP.

Project Description: Establish performance baseline, develop strategic plan for adoption by the VTA Board of Directors and specific measures for adoption and implementation via VTA's biennial budget process.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	November 2012	Select TSP performance measure(s) to address.	20%
	January 2013	SCVTA Board adopts TSP Strategic Plan.	10%
	February 2013	Develops specific TSP implementation strategies.	50%
	June 2013	Incorporate specific TSP implementation strategies into VTA 2014- 2015 Biennial Budget and service plan.	10%
2	June 2014	Reports initial performance to MTC	10%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Santa Rosa CityBus**

Project Title: Fixed Route System Evaluation and Service Improvements

Project Goal: The goal of performing a fixed route system evaluation and associated service improvements are to increase overall system ridership by 3 - 5% and improve system efficiency. Implement the first CityBus high-frequency route, with 15 minute headways.

Project Description: This project will evaluate the performance of several low-performing routes and reallocate resources from the low-performing routes to create at least one high-frequency route in Santa Rosa, taking into account community resource allocation levels, minority and low-income population distribution, and future identified system growth.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Preliminary System Evaluation and identification of system improvements.	30%
2	Completed	Public outreach and feedback on proposed system improvements.	20%
3	November 2013	City Council Approval of proposed changes.	10%
4	February 2013	Implement system improvements.	20%
5	May 2013	Perform preliminary on-time and ridership evaluation on system changes.	10%
6	December 2013	Evaluate total system ridership benchmarks	10%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **Santa Rosa CityBus**

Project Title: Enhanced Automated Vehicle Locator System

Project Goal: The goal of implementing an Enhanced Automated Vehicle Locator System is to improve system performance through delivery of improved system information, and increase total system ridership through the deployment of real-time passenger information in both fixed signage and electronic media.

Project Description: This project will implement an Automated Vehicle Locator system on the Santa Rosa CityBus fixed route fleet that will be enhanced with a real-time arrival prediction function, Automated Passenger Counting, smart-phone subscription capabilities, fare box and head sign integration, automated enunciator, and vehicle diagnostic capabilities.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Release Enhanced AVL RFP.	10%
2	Completed	Award vendor contract.	10%
3	May 2013	Complete system installation.	30%
4	June 2013	Market and Outreach program.	20%
5	July 2013	Initiate system.	20%
6	May 2014	System evaluation.	10%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **City of Union City**

Project Title: Modify Performance Standard for ADA Paratransit Service Denials to Ensure Compliance with the Federal ADA

Project Goal: Ensure compliance with Federal ADA guidelines for paratransit service denials.

Project Description: Modify the performance standard for ADA paratransit service denials from 1-2 per year to 0 (zero) in the upcoming Short Range Transit Plan (SRTP).

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Change standard in draft SRTP.	80%
2	January 2013	Public Hearing on SRTP.	10%
3	February 2013	Adoption of SRTP.	10%
		Total	100%

Fiscal Year 2012-2013 Productivity Improvement Program

Transit Operator: **City of Union City**

Project Title: Continue to Address Declines in Fixed Route Vehicle Maintenance Performance and Improve Contractor Maintenance Activities

Project Goal: Increase maintenance effectiveness with periodic inspections of contract maintenance activities to address declines in fixed route vehicle maintenance performance and to improve contractor maintenance activities.

Project Description: Conduct periodic inspections of vehicle fleet to determine contractor compliance with agency's written maintenance standards. Maintenance inspection report can be used as a basis for performance incentives or penalty assessments.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Prepare Scope of Work.	40%
2	Completed	Review proposals.	20%
3	Completed	Award contract.	10%
4	Completed	Begin inspections.	15%
5	December 2012	Conclude inspections.	15%
		Total	100%