



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov

Programming and Allocations Committee
November 14, 2012
Minutes

Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair
San Mateo County

Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Dave Cortese
Santa Clara County

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Mark Green
Association of Bay Area Governments

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kimsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
Cities of Santa Clara County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Kevin Mullin
Cities of San Mateo County

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Chair Glover called the meeting to order at approximately 10:07 a.m. Committee members present were: Commissioners Bates, Campos, Cortese, Dodd, and Wiener. Commissioner Tissier was present as an ex-officio voting member of the Committee. Other Commissioners present as ad hoc non-voting members of the Committee were: Giacopini, Green, Haggerty, Halsted, and Mackenzie.

Consent Calendar

The Committee received for information the TDA Triennial Performance Audits of Various Operators and unanimously approved the following consent items after a motion by Commissioner Cortese and a second by Commissioner Dodd:

- Minutes of the October 10, 2012 meeting;
- 2012 Productivity Improvement Program (PIP) from Transportation Development Act (TDA) Triennial Audit Reports. MTC Resolution No. 4073;
- Pavement Management Technical Assistance Program (P-TAP) Guidelines. MTC Resolution No. 4078;
- Allocation of \$4.2 million in FY2012-13 Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds and State Transit Assistance (STA) funds to Union City and AC Transit. MTC Resolution Nos. 4061, Revised, and 4062, Revised;
- Allocation of \$6 million in AB 1171 funds to the Solano Transportation Authority (STA). MTC Resolution No. 3914, Revised;
- Allocation of approximately \$2 million in RM2 funds to the Napa County Transportation and Planning Agency (NCTPA). MTC Resolution No. 3889, Revised; and
- Reallocation of \$3.6 million in lapsed AB 664 Bridge Toll funds to BART and SFMTA. MTC Resolution Nos. 4079 and 4080.

Regional

- *Regional Measure 2 (RM2) Operating Program Update.*

Christina Verdin, Programming and Allocations Section, presented updates and staff recommendations for the three RM2 operating projects that did not meet the required performance standards by the close of FY2011-12 Operating Program: FAST Route 40, Napa Route 29, and WestCAT Route 30Z/JPX.

This item was presented for information only and no action was required by the Committee.

Federal

- *BART Car Replacement Project Status Update and Funding Request. MTC Resolution No. 3738, Revised.*

Grace Crunican, BART General Manager, and Paul Oversier, BART Assistant General Manager, provided the Committee with the status of the BART Car Replacement project, including the selection of Bombardier, Inc. to begin building 410 cars in the first phase of the rail fleet replacement program with the first cars expected in December 2016; final bid results; projected budget; and anticipated funding levels. Glen Tepke, Programming and Allocations Section, presented a recommendation to update the amount of federal programming subject to the BART Car Replacement Funding Exchange Account and to allow BART to withdraw up to \$15.5 million from the Exchange Account to assist in meeting project expenses.

Commissioner Campos asked if there is a maintenance plan connected to the purchase of the replacement cars and the projected lifespan of the cars. Mr. Oversier explained that BART has already begun the transition to a strategic maintenance program that will ensure scheduled maintenance and the expansion of the maintenance facilities. Mr. Oversier further explained that the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) standard useful life for rail cars is 30 years.

Commissioner Campos asked for information on Bombardier, Inc.'s background. Mr. Oversier advised that Bombardier, Inc. is a Canadian firm with its subsidiary company being the largest rail car builder in North America and that, of the three firms that bid on the BART car project Bombardier, Inc. has the highest quality with a real focus on reliability. Commissioner Campos also asked what the escalation contingency is and Mr. Oversier explained that there is a 9% contingency which falls within the norm in comparison to other car builders in North America.

Commissioner Haggerty asked for confirmation that the cost per car is \$2 million. Mr. Oversier explained that there is a quantity discount and the first 260 cars are priced at \$2.4 million each and the next 150 cars are priced at \$1.8 million. Commissioner Haggerty asked about the disposition of the old cars. Mr. Oversier explained that BART is looking into how to recycle the car materials.

In response to questions from Commissioner Bates, Mr. Oversier advised that the final assembly would take place in upstate New York and Philadelphia. Ms. Crunican added, with regard to the location of where the cars are being manufactured, that it is a 66% domestic content due to assistance received from the legislature.

Commissioner Haggerty asked if Bombardier, Inc. would consider hiring employees from the Bay Area if they were willing to relocate. Mr. Oversier explained that now that the contract has been awarded it would be appropriate to have those discussions with Bombardier, Inc.

Commissioner Dodd asked for clarification on the \$69 million (5%) for BART project management. Mr. Oversier explained that this line item will cover the costs of engineering staff, the design process, train operators to test cars, project management, inspectors, and warranty administration. Commissioner Dodd asked MTC staff if this is a standard operating procedure and Mr. Tepke advised yes that these costs are typically included in a vehicle project capital cost. Ann Flemer also explained that the 5% is over a ten year span which is within range for this type of project.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Campos with a second by Commissioner Cortese, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution No. 3738, Revised to the Commission for approval.

California Transportation Commission Update

The Committee received, in writing, updates on the California Transportation Commission (CTC) meeting held on October 24 in Sacramento, CA. Ms. Bockelman noted that the CTC allocated \$65.8 million in Proposition 1B Trade Corridor Improvement Funds (TCIF) to the Port of Oakland's Outer Harbor Intermodal Terminal (Segment 2) project.

Public Comment

Commissioner Haggerty announced that Measure B1, in Alameda County, saw an explosion of votes yesterday and went from 65.79% to 66.19% approval, which is a little short of the percentage required for passage

, with 17,000-18,000 more ballots to count.

Commissioner Glover adjourned the meeting at approximately 10:52 a.m.