



Programming and Allocations Committee
July 11, 2012
Minutes

Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair
San Mateo County

Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Dave Cortese
Santa Clara County

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Mark Green
Association of Bay Area Governments

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
Cities of Santa Clara County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Kevin Mullin
Cities of San Mateo County

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Chair Glover called the meeting to order at approximately 11:00 a.m. Committee members present were: Commissioners Campos, Cortese, and Wiener. Commissioners Tissier and Rein-Worth were present as ex-officio voting members of the Committee. Other Commissioners present as ad hoc non-voting members of the Committee were: Giacopini, Green, Haggerty, Halsted, and Liccardo.

Consent Calendar

The Committee unanimously approved the following consent items after a motion by Commissioner Cortese and a second by Commissioner Campos:

- Minutes of the June 13, 2012 meeting;
- Allocation of \$2 million of bridge tolls to the Transbay Joint Powers Authority (TJPA) for operations and maintenance of the Transbay Terminal Building. MTC Resolution No. 4070;
- Revise FY2012-13 Regional Measure 2 (RM2) Operating Program to add \$68,000 for Dumbarton Bus. MTC Resolution No. 4058, Revised;
- Allocation of \$8.5 million and scope amendment for previously allocated AB 1171 funds requested by the Solano Transportation Authority to complete the environmental document for the Solano I-80/680/12 Interchange project. MTC Resolution No. 3914, Revised; and
- FY2011-12 Year-End Transportation Development (TDA) Allocations of \$12.2 million. MTC Resolution No. 4025, Revised.

In addition, the Committee received one item for information: Quarterly Report of Executive Director's Delegated Authority Actions.

Federal

- *Public Hearing: Draft 2013 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) and Draft Air Quality Conformity Analysis for the 2013 TIP.*

Sri Srinivasan, Programming and Allocations Section presented an overview of the Draft TIP and Draft Air Quality Conformity Analysis.

There were five public speakers. Mary Savage, Shirley Humphrey, Gary Rannefeld, and Ginger Emerson (Citizens of the City of Dixon) spoke against transportation projects on A Street and B Street in preparation for the Capitol Corridor project in the City of Dixon and requested that the projects be delayed until the citizens of Dixon have an opportunity to discuss the impacts of the projects with elected officials. Manolo Gonzalez-Estay, TransForm, expressed his appreciation for the groundbreaking work on the Investment Analysis, in particular the focus on low-income and minority groups.

He further expressed concern for keeping track of expansion and maintenance projects for Plan Bay Area, and noted that he would be sending formal comments.

There were no other public speakers and the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Haggerty commented that the issues expressed by the public speakers are local issues and that he would like additional clarity regarding how the City of Dixon as a whole feels before the issue returns to the Committee for action. Mr. Heminger advised that the item is scheduled to return to the Committee in September and that staff will provide additional information as well as respond to all public comments by that time.

Commissioner Green commented that the years of the data samples used in the investment analysis seem to be outdated from 2000 through 2008 and asked if staff will be providing more recent data. Ms. Bockelman explained that staff is working to obtain more current data through surveying efforts and will use the most current data that is available but new data will not be available in time for the September Committee meeting.

Regional

- *Funding options for Low-Income Transit Pass Pilot Program.*

Alix Bockelman, Programming and Allocations Section presented three options for providing funding for the Low-Income Transit Pass Pilot Programs. The options included: 1) a focus on the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) pilot program in the near term and establishing reserve for future pilots including the Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA) and the Alameda County Transportation Authority (ACTC); 2) support for three pilot programs for SFMTA, VTA, and ACTC; and 3) establishing a framework for a regional reduced fare program for low income youth.

Commissioner Liccardo commented that he would like to see the Committee move forward with Option Two and explained that the Santa Clara pilot program offers an opportunity to better understand the ridership/revenue tradeoffs, which is information that would be very beneficial to all transit operators in the region. He further commented that VTA is looking to specifically target a population that will be highly price sensitive and focus on general assistance recipients that currently do not receive transportation benefits, and to clearly measure whether a severe reduction in fares will give a significant increase in ridership to justify the anticipated loss of revenue.

Commissioner Campos commented that he would like all three of the options to be forwarded to the full Commission without a recommendation from the Committee. He asked members of the public to limit their comments so that the Committee can have a more robust discussion at the full Commission meeting later in the month.

Commissioner Green asked if the Commission were to pursue Option Three how much time it would take for staff to return to the Commission with the framework for the program. Ms. Bockelman explained that staff would return in the late Fall to allow enough time to work through any issues with the transit operators in each county.

Commissioner Haggerty asked if Option Three would offer an opportunity for a discount of fifty percent off of the price of current monthly youth passes once the framework for a region-wide program has been established and whether this option would hold off on the implementation of the other pilot programs until that time. Mr. Heminger explained that Option Three would mean not conducting any of the pilots and implement a regional discount program on a standardized basis.

Commissioner Wiener agreed with Commissioner Campos' suggestion to forward all three of the options to the full Commission without a recommendation given there are only four out of seven Committee members present today. He further commented that a more robust discussion with the full Commission could lead to a more informed decision.

Commissioner Rein Worth asked if funds would be taken from existing Lifeline programs to fund Option Three based on youth ridership as it relates to county poverty population. Ms. Bockelman explained that approximately sixty-percent of the STA/Lifeline funds would be used for purposes of funding the program established through Option Three. Mr. Heminger further commented that the Lifeline program has existed in different guises over its history and it started as a regionally discretionary program but over time changes have been made to its policies at the Commission's discretion. Each time policy changes are made there are different impacts on the region.

Commissioner Cortese commented that each county should know how many people on general assistance are actually buying transportation passes and asked if staff has surveyed for this information. Ms. Bockelman explained that data on the general assistance population transportation passes is not available at this time but would be collected for the means-based study that is being conducted. However, this information does tend to be available through each transit agency. Additionally, Commissioner Cortese asked if it would be possible to have pilot programs take place as suggested in Options One and Two, while moving to establish the framework as outlined in Option Three. Mr. Heminger explained there is no reason why this could not happen and that it would be up to the Committee or full Commission to decide whether or not they have enough information to move forward regionally or with the pilot programs for the three transit operators.

Commissioner Haggerty commented that the general assistance issue that Santa Clara County is bringing forward has not been implemented before and that is an option that he would support because he would like to learn if transportation is an impediment to getting people to work. He further commented that on the school bus program he would rather see a more holistic program that encompasses all nine bay area counties because he does support free transit for all; however, the issue is how to pay for it.

Commissioner Wiener reiterated that it makes sense to forward all three options to the full Commission without a recommendation so that a more robust discussion can take place with all Commissioners present.

Commissioner Glover commented that he does support free transit for youth; however, if free transit cannot be offered to all nine bay area counties, especially when using regional funds, he is not willing to support the program. He offered members of the public an opportunity to be heard and suggested that one member from each group speak on that group's behalf.

Public Comments:

Eric Chu of the Chinese Progressive Association, Anthony Navarro of the Phillipino Community Center, Richard Miupao of James Logan High School, Silvia Lopez of MUA, and Leah LaCroix of the San Francisco Youth Commission spoke in support of free Muni for youth.

Anita Miles of PACT San Jose spoke in support of the VTA pilot program for reduced transit fares.

Jane Martin of POWER, Jodi Schwartz of Lyric, Bahar Ostadan of the City of Oakland Youth Commission, Roland Lebron, and Virginia Hall of Hope Collaborative spoke in support of options one and two and encouraged the Committee not to support option three because it takes away money from low income communities.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Campos with a second by Commissioner Wiener, unanimously approved the referral of all three program options to the Commission without a recommended action.

Regional and State

- *Revisions to the Third Cycle Lifeline Transportation Program of Projects. MTC Resolution No. 3925, Revised, and 4053, Revised; and*
- *Revise FY2012-13 Fund Estimate and allocate FY2012-13 Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds, State Transit Assistance (STA) funds, Assembly Bill (AB) 1107 funds and Regional Measure 2 (RM2) operating funds and capital funds to various claimants in the region. MTC Resolution Nos. 4051, Revised, 4059, Revised, 4061, Revised, 4062, Revised, and 4063, Revised.*

The Committee received, in writing, the details for both items and the Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Cortese with a second by Commissioner Campos, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution Nos. 3925, Revised, 4051, Revised, 4053, Revised, 4059, Revised, 4061, Revised, 4062, Revised, and 4063, Revised to the Commission for approval.

California Transportation Commission Update

The Committee received, in writing, updates on the California Transportation Commission (CTC) meeting held on June 27 in Ontario, CA.

Public Comment

There were no public comments.

Commissioner Glover adjourned the meeting at approximately 12:19 p.m.