



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair
San Mateo County

Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Dave Cortese
Santa Clara County

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Mark Green
Association of Bay Area Governments

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
Cities of Santa Clara County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Kevin Mullin
Cities of San Mateo County

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Sperring
Solano County and Cities

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

COMMISSION MEETING

Wednesday, February 22, 2012

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607

MINUTES

ATTENDANCE

Vice Chair Rein Worth called the meeting to order at 9:40 a.m. In addition to Vice Chair Rein Worth the following Commissioners were present: Bates, Campos, Cortese, Dodd, Giacomini, Glover, Green, Haggerty, Halsted, Kinsey, Liccardo, Mackenzie, Mullin, Sperring, and Wiener.

VICE-CHAIR'S REPORT

Happy Birthday to MTC

Vice Chair Rein Worth indicated that the first Commission meeting for MTC was held in February of 1971, making MTC 41 years old this month. Happy Birthday to MTC.

Revised Agenda

The Vice Chair announced that a Revised Agenda was before the Commission indicating that item 9 a. "Guidelines for Applying Project Performance Assessment to Plan Bay Area Investments" was forward by the Planning Committee Meeting.

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT

Egon Terplan, Vice Chair, Policy Advisory Council provided a summary of the Council's review of the evaluation of the Council. In the coming year, the Council anticipates having a more productive working session with Commissioners to share agenda items, direction and goals. The Council wants to be useful by delivering specific agenda items and advice. Mr. Terplan expressed the Council's high praise for Pam Grove and all staff at MTC. Mr. Terplan reported that the Council did not take a position on the project performance assessment, however, they support the direction that staff is going. The Council plans to discuss the Transit Sustainability Project at their next meeting before the Commission votes on the final project recommendations.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Steve Heminger presented the Executive Director's report to the Commission. Copies of the report are available from the Executive Office or www.mtc.ca.gov.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Commissioner Mackenzie reminded Commissioners of the second 511 Information Session to take place after the Commission meeting and encouraged Commissioners to attend.

Commissioner Mackenzie informed the Commission that he and Commissioner Haggerty attended the New Partners for Smart Growth Conference in San Diego at the beginning of the month. He highlighted that Dr. Dick Jackson produced a series called “Designing Healthy Communities” which will be shown on PBS and recommended viewing the series when aired in the Bay Area.

Commissioner Green offered kudos to the Bay Area’s 511 traveler information system.

CONSENT CALENDAR

Upon the motion by Commissioner Mackenzie and seconded by Commissioner Kinsey the Commission unanimously approved the following items on the Consent Calendar:

- Commission Meeting Minutes – January 25, 2012.

Operations Committee

- Resolution No. 3983, Revised – Clipper Operating Rules.

Programming and Allocations Committee

- Resolution Nos. 3708, Revised and 4050 – Proposed programming and allocation of \$350,000 in RM2 Capital funds MTC for Regional Real-Time Transit Information System Expansion.
- Resolution No. 3880, Revised – Proposition 1B – Transit BART FY 2010-11 Population-based Funds Allocation Request for \$17.5 million.
- Resolution No. 3925, Revised – Surface Transportation Program/Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (STP/CMAQ) First Cycle Programming Revision.
- Resolution Nos. 4025, Revised and 4026, Revised – Allocation of \$5.4 million in Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds and \$1.6 million in State Transit Assistance (STA) funds to the City of Santa Rosa for FY 2011-12 transit operations.
- Resolution No. 4038, Revised – 2012 RTIP Amendment for the Alameda County Transportation Commission to allow for an exchange of local funds to ten projects.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Programming and Allocations Committee - Glover

Upon the motion by Commissioner Rein Worth and seconded by Commissioner Spring the Commission unanimously approved the following:

- Resolution No. 4051 – MTC FY 2012-13 Fund Estimate includes the proposed apportionments and distribution of the Transportation Development Act (TDA), State Transit Assistance (STA), Assembly Bill (AB) 1107 sales tax and transit related bridge toll funds for FY 2012-13.

Legislation Committee – Haggerty

Upon the motion by Commissioner Haggerty and seconded by Commissioner Halsted the Commission unanimously approved the following:

- Resolution No. 3931, Revised – approves a 15 month extension for current members of the MTC Policy Advisory Council.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Haggerty and seconded by Commissioner Spring the Commission unanimously approved a support position on the following pending legislation:

- AB 819 (Wiecowski) would require the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) to establish procedures for cities, counties, and local agencies to request approval to use nonstandard planning, design and construction features in the construction of bikeways and roadways where bicycle travel is permitted.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Haggerty and seconded by Commissioner Spring the Commission unanimously approved an oppose position on the following pending legislation:

- H.R. 7 (Mica), the American Energy and Infrastructure Jobs Act of 2012, would authorize funds for federal-aid highway, public transportation, and highway and motor carrier safety programs, and for other purposes. H.R. 3864 (Camp), the American Energy and Infrastructure Jobs Financing Act of 2012, is the companion financing bill.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Haggerty and seconded by Commissioner Bates the Commission unanimously approved a position to support and seek amendments on the following pending legislation:

- S. 1813 (Boxer), the Moving Ahead for Progress in the 21st Century (MAP-21) Act is a bill to reauthorize federal-aid highway and highway safety construction programs, and for other purposes.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Haggerty and seconded by Commissioner Spering the Commission unanimously approved a position to oppose the following pending legislation:

- S. 2006 (Lautenberg), the “Commuter Protection Act”, would require that tolls for passage on any bridge or tunnel on a federal and highway must be “just and reasonable” and subject to review and regulation by the Secretary of the U.S. Department of Transportation (DOT).

Planning Committee – Spering

- Guidelines for Applying Project Performance Assessment to Plan Bay Area Investments. Steve Heminger, Executive Director presented proposed guidelines to help inform the selection of projects for inclusion in the transportation investment element of the preferred scenario for Plan Bay Area. The Planning Committee reviewed staff recommendations on guidelines that would require project sponsors to present a “compelling case” for including low-performing projects in Plan Bay Area if they fell in one of two categories: (1) project benefits are not adequately captured in the MTC travel demand model, and (2) projects given special preference under federal law or regulations. The Planning Committee approved a motion to create a third compelling case category for projects that are: a) included in Regional Measure 2 or a voter-approved expenditure plan, b) included in Resolution 3434, c) in close proximity to affordable housing in transit hubs, or d) supportive of Senate Bill 375 mandate to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. The Committee agreed to forward its action as a recommendation for full Commission consideration.

The Commission received public comment from the following:

- Mark Evanoff, Union City - spoke in support of the Planning Committee’s recommendation to expand the criteria for evaluating low performing projects.
- Joan Molloy, Union City – spoke in support of the Planning Committee’s recommendation to expand the criteria for evaluating low performing projects.
- Beth Walukas, Alameda County Transportation Commission – spoke in support of the Planning Committee’s recommendation to expand the criteria for evaluating low performing projects.
- Manolo Gonzalez-Estay, TransForm – spoke against moving forward with “Category 3” in the final resolution and referred Commissioners to a letter sent to them from TransForm.
- Paul Cohen, Carpenters – spoke in support of the Planning Committee’s recommendation to expand the criteria for evaluating low performing projects.

After discussion, Commissioner Cortese moved and Commissioner Green seconded a motion to adopt all three categories but category “3a” be modified to say “Regional Measure 2 or voter approved funding from local agencies or significant local funding from other sources”. Motion failed by a roll call vote of 6 Yeas by Commissioners: Cortese, Glover, Green, Haggerty, Mullin and Spering, 9 Nays by Commissioners: Campos, Bates, Dodd, Halsted, Kinsey, Liccardo, Mackenzie, Wiener and ReinWorth.

Commissioner Wiener moved and Commissioner Liccardo seconded a motion to approve staff’s original recommendation that limits projects eligible to make a compelling case to categories 1 and 2. Motion passed by a roll call vote of 9 Yeas by Commissioners: Bates, Campos, Dodd, Halsted, Kinsey, Liccardo, Mackenzie, Wiener; and Rein Worth, 6 Nays by Commissioners: Cortese, Glover, Green, Haggerty, Mullin, and Spering.

PUBLIC COMMENT/ADJOURNMENT/NEXT MEETING

The Commission received public comment from the following:

- Sheila Lumford, ACCE Riders for Transit Justice – commented on MTC funds moneys given to Wall Street instead of funding transit.
- Alia Phelps, ACCE Riders for Transit Justice – asked the Commission to find more money to fund transit.
- Lindsay Imai, Urban Habitat – asked MTC to drop interest rates that are currently being paid to the banks and renegotiate swaps to find money for transit.
- Latanya Wolf, St. Mary’s Center and Alameda County Food Bank – referred to undue hardships to children, students and seniors who use public transit.
- Claire Haas, ACCE Riders for Transit Justice – indicating that swap re-negotiation needs to be considered.

There being no further business or public comment, Commission Vice Chair Rein Worth adjourned the meeting at 11:40 a.m. The next Commission meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, March 28, 2012 in Oakland, California.

Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair