



Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair
San Mateo County

Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Dave Cortese
Santa Clara County

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Mark Green
Association of Bay Area Governments

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Licardo
Cities of Santa Clara County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Kevin Mullin
Cities of San Mateo County

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spring
Solano County and Cities

Vacancy
City and County of San Francisco

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Fleder
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Policy Advisory Council
January 11, 2012
Draft Minutes

Vice-chair Egon Terplan called the meeting to order at 1:38 p.m. Members in attendance were Naomi Armenta, Cathleen Baker, Richard Burnett, JoAnn Busenbark, Carlos Castellanos, Bena Chang, Wilbert Din, Sandi Galvez, Dolores Jaquez, Linda Jeffery Sailors, Randi Kinman, Federico Lopez, Marshall Loring, Yokia Mason, Kendal Oku, Gerald Rico and Frank Robertson. Excused: Richard Hedges, Tanya Narath, Tina King Neuhausel and Chair Dolly Sandoval. Absent: Evelina Molina, Cheryl O'Connor and Lori Reese-Brown.

Approval of December Meeting Minutes

The minutes of the December 14, 2011 meeting were approved after a motion by Mr. Din and a second by Mr. Loring.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

Subcommittee Reports

Equity and Access Subcommittee

Chair Armenta gave a report on the subcommittee's meeting earlier in the day, where they received an update on the California Household Travel Survey, already underway, and the Bay Area Transit Passenger Survey, for which the subcommittee provided input to staff. Following up on the issue of charging disabled placard users at parking meters brought before the Policy Advisory Council last month, Ms. Armenta noted there has been some interest from the news media, and MTC Commissioner Dorene Giacomini was quoted in an article in the Examiner. The Commission passed MTC's 2012 Legislative Program at their December meeting, but remanded the parking meter item back to the Equity and Access Subcommittee for review at a later date. Ms. Armenta asked that MTC staff agendaize this item for a future meeting.

Regional Equity Working Group

Ms. Armenta gave an update on the working group meeting earlier that day, where they discussed and clarified questions on the equity analysis results and the target assessment results for the alternative scenarios. The group also discussed proposed revisions to the One Bay Area Grant program, and group members showed a lot of interest. The group did not have time to discuss a previously agendaized item on potential policy considerations for the preferred scenario.

Plan Bay Area: Policy Initiatives to Reduce Greenhouse Gas Emissions

The Council received the report given by Ashley Nguyen, MTC Senior Planner. Comments from the Council included:

- Staff should add or broaden categories to capture a larger menu of options such as flexible work hours, carpool incentives and bike sharing on corporate campuses.
- In regards to commuter benefit ordinances, 20 employees is too low of a threshold, as federal rules around employers don't go into effect until 50 employees.
- Demands of the workplace can be an economic hardship.
- Monthly Internet service charges can add to the costs of telecommuting.
- There is a need to educate disadvantaged and low income populations in order to take advantage of benefits.
- The policies listed are urban focused; also need to have policies focused on rural areas.
- The aging population could benefit from rideshare programs.
- In addition to Safe Routes to School, there should also be a Safe Routes to Transit program.
- The policy chart could benefit from the addition of two columns: 1) column that shows how the policy ranks in terms of reduction in emissions and finances, and 2) one that indicates if a state, local or federal law is required to implement the policy.
- Transit is missing in the list of policies; perhaps a category related to transit should be added.
- The list is a mix of policies and programs that take a lot of investment.
- While free parking does encourage driving, a parking surcharge is difficult to implement; this policy should not be pursued.
- The list should include investigating road pricing and open lane tolling, which can generate a lot of revenue and have a huge impact on overall per capita emissions.
- Add a column to note if a policy is already tied to another program that is potentially underway.
- Consider the impact on low-income populations when implementing parking surcharges and lane pricing.
- Access and present case studies from employers that could educate other employers on the direct benefit and return on investment for participating in some of these programs.

Catherine Lyons of the Bay Area Council commented that the Bay Area Council and the Bay Area Business Coalition want to ensure the list of policies are financially feasible, reasonable and impactful on greenhouse gas emissions. A suggestion at the Regional Advisory Working Group (RAWG) meeting was to create a policy task force to discuss feasible targets to meet the 15% goal by 2035.

OneBayArea Grant (OBAG) Proposal Update

The Council received the report given by Alix Bockelman, MTC Director of Programming and Allocations.

Parisa Fatehi-Weeks of Public Advocates commented that the original July proposal was going in the right direction, but the latest proposal of the OBAG seems to be sliding back a bit. Two recommended changes include affordable housing production being at the sub-county level vs.

on a county level and to revisit the menu that was removed which included affordable housing and anti-displacement policies.

Upon discussion, the Council felt generally supportive of the overall revised staff proposal. However, the Council felt that MTC should be very specific to focus the OneBayArea grant in a way that:

- Sets standards for how CMAs complete public outreach and in the creation of their PDA implementation plan
- Has clear definitions for all terms (such as “open space access” and “PDA access”)
- Sets clear eligibility requirements so that funds cannot be inappropriately used on projects that do not support the overall Play Bay Area goals
- Encourages coordination between cities and transit operators on use of funds
- Includes anti-displacement policies for cities to implement in order to qualify for eligibility
- Includes anti-displacement incentives and affordability protections
- Ensures transparency as to how much of the grant is used for planning fees (such as the percentage of the overall OBAG grant used as administrative fees by CMAs)
- Provides incentives to local jurisdictions to allocate funds in a fair way (i.e., those areas or individual cities that meet their RHNA allocations receive a higher grant share)
- Provides incentives for job production at higher densities, particularly near transit
- Maintains performance monitoring to make sure local jurisdictions meet the goals

In addition, the Council felt that a non-binding “resolution of intent” by local jurisdictions to align RHNA, PDA and zoning policies might not have enough teeth to actually be effective.

Staff Liaison Report

The Council received the report given by Ms. Grove, which highlighted the upcoming Policy Advisory Council recruitment for a new term which would begin in April 2012. Ms. Grove also noted the attached memo in response to the Council’s comments regarding the Clipper Title VI analysis.

Council Member Reports

Ms. Armenta commented on the roster of the Equity and Access Subcommittee and encouraged any members no longer interested in participating on the subcommittee to let her or staff know in order to alleviate future quorum issues.

Ms. Jaquez reported that former Policy Advisory Council member Ann Hancock, using a grant from MTC, will be piloting a car sharing program that allows people to sign up through their mobile device. She would like to invite Ms. Hancock to come to visit a future council meeting to share the details of her pilot.

Ms. Kinman reported that the BART to San Jose project received an influx of funding and is moving along.

Mr. Din commented on the Plan Bay Area meeting in San Francisco, stating he felt a majority of attendees were new to the process. As a result, there was a lot of meeting time spent on defining terms.

Vice-chair Terplan reported on a paper released on the Urban Future of Work on the importance of job density as it relates to economic competitiveness.

New Business

There was no new business.

Adjournment/Next Meeting

The meeting was adjourned at 3:33 p.m. The next Policy Advisory Council meeting is scheduled for February 8, 2012 in the MTC Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, California.