



**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov  
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

*Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Tom Azunbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*David Campos*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Dave Cortese*  
Santa Clara County

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacomini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Mark Green*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Scott Haggerty*  
Alameda County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sam Liccardo*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Kevin Mullin*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Sperling*  
Solano County and Cities

*Scott Wiener*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

**COMMISSION MEETING**

Wednesday, December 21, 2011

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607

**MINUTES**

**ATTENDANCE**

Chair Tissier called the meeting to order at 10:12 a.m. In addition to Chair Tissier the following were present: Vice Chair Rein Worth, Commissioners Bates, Campos, Cortese, Dodd, Giacomini, Glover, Green, Haggerty, Halsted, Kinsey, Liccardo, Mackenzie, Mullin, Sartipi, Spring, and Wiener.

**CHAIR'S REPORT**

- **Resolution No. 4045** – Resolution of Appreciation for Melanie Morgan on the Occasion of her Retirement.

Motion made by Chair Tissier and seconded by Vice Chair Rein Worth to approve Resolution No. 4045 as presented. Motion passed unanimously. Ms. Morgan expressed her gratitude for and memories of serving Staff and the Commission.

- **Resolution No. 4046** – Resolution of Appreciation for Robert “Bob” Bates on the Occasion of his Retirement.

Motion made by Commissioner Kinsey and seconded by Commissioner Rein Worth to approve Resolution No. 4046 as presented. Motion passed unanimously.

**POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT**

The Policy advisory council Vice Chair, Egon Terplan presented the Council’s He conveyed the Council’s concern that MTC’s 2012 Legislative Program that was ultimately recommended by the Legislation Committee had significant changes that were not in the initial draft reviewed by the Council, pertaining to the proposal to institute parking meter payment by those who drive a car with a handicapped placard.

### **POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT (continued)**

He also reported that Council heard a presentation on Plan Bay Area's Draft Scenario Assessment results and expressed its disappointment in the lack of variations among the scenarios and believed the scenarios did not meet the established targets and goals. He reported that Council adopted a motion (with one abstention) to encourage the Commission and its staff to: a) develop a preferred scenario that achieves the 15% greenhouse gas reduction target; b) broaden and expand the policy initiatives list to include areas that will further help the region achieve the 15% greenhouse gas reduction target; and c) include a parallel set of policy initiatives that help achieve all the other voluntary targets that fall short of their adopted goal.

### **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Steve Heminger presented the Executive Director's report to the Commission. Copies of the report are available from the Executive Office or [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov).

Commissioner Haggerty commented on the Map of the Month and requested that the actual map that was taken to the voters be presented at a later date.

Commissioner Spring referred to the Bureau of State Audits review of MTC's acquisition of 390 Main Street in San Francisco that is currently being conducted and asked what activities are going to be taking place on the building between now and when the report is presented. Mr. Heminger noted that a January BAHA agenda item will be presented to hire an architect and that MTC envisions hiring a Construction Manager-at-Risk so that construction activities can begin later this year.

Commissioner Wiener referenced the Map of the Month and noted the similarities between the original plans for building and extending BART and how they parallel with the current obstacles to constructing High Speed Rail.

Commissioner Mackenzie expressed his concern with the scheduled Plan Bay Area Public Workshops. He noted that pre-registration in Sonoma was already filled. He asked if a larger meeting venue might be considered. Mr. Heminger responded that venues, as well as other issues, were all under reconsideration.

Commissioner Green noted that he spoke in favor of AB57 during the Senate Transportation Committee Hearings on Regionalism which was chaired by Senator DeSaulnier.

Due to logistics regarding the Plan Bay Area meetings, Commissioner Haggerty asked if southern Alameda County constituents were advised of the meetings scheduled in Alameda County as well as San Jose. Mr. Heminger confirmed that this was happening.

### **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT (continued)**

The Commission received public comment from the following:

- Jerry Grace asked if a piece of the existing Bay Bridge was going to be moved to Pier 27. Staff was not aware of the move and would provide a response, once verified.

### **COMMISSIONER COMMENTS**

There were no Commissioner comments.

### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

Upon the motion by Commissioner Dodd and seconded by Commissioner Rein Worth the Commission unanimously approved the following items on the Consent Calendar:

- Commission Meeting Minutes – November 16, 2011.

### **Programming and Allocations Committee**

- Resolution No. 3385, Revised – Revision to Regional Express Bus Program to reassign four AC Transit buses for the Dumbarton Express.
- Resolution No. 3532, Revised – Revisions to Short-Range Transit Plan Guidelines.
- Resolution No. 3990, Revised – FY 2011-12 Fund Estimate Revision.
- Resolution No. 4025, Revised – Allocation of \$2.9 million in Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds to Fairfield for FY 2011-12 transit operations.
- Resolution Nos. 4033 and 4042 – Lifeline Transportation Program Cycle 3 Guidelines and Mobility Management Guidelines.
- Resolution Nos. 4043 and 4044 – AB 664 Net Bridge Toll Revenue Program and allocations for FY 2011-12 to reallocate lapsed funds to SFMTA.

### **Standing Committee Minutes**

Draft Committee minutes of the following standing committees were presented for information only; they were provided as background information for items that were being taken up by the full Commission.

**Standing Committee Minutes** (continued)

- Legislation Committee Meeting Draft Minutes – December 9, 2011.
- Operations Committee Meeting Draft Minutes – December 9, 2011.
- Planning Committee Meeting Draft Minutes – December 9, 2011.
- Administration Committee Meeting Draft Minutes – December 14, 2011.
- Programming and Allocations Meeting Draft Minutes – December 14, 2011.

**Draft MTC Policy Advisory Council Minutes**

Draft Policy Advisory Council minutes were presented for Commission information only.

- Minutes of the Policy Advisory Council Meeting – December 14, 2011.

**COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**Administration Committee - Cortese**

Upon the motion by Commissioner Cortese and seconded by Commissioner Kinsey the Commission unanimously approved the following item:

- Resolution No. 4011, Revised – FY 2011-12 Agency Budget - Approves budget amendment to add carryover funding from prior years, final allocations for FHWA and FTA planning funds, and to add authorized positions to the budget to implement the recently announced staff reorganization.

Commissioner Mullin asked for clarification regarding the total Operating expense line item. Brian Mayhew, MTC CFO, explained that due to prior year carry-over monies identified by the year-end close, this line needs to be amended into the budget each year, usually in December.

**Programming and Allocation Committee - Kinsey**

Upon the motion by Commissioner Kinsey and seconded by Commissioner Haggerty the Commission unanimously approved the following:

- Resolution No. 3735, Revised – RM2 Safe Routes to Transit (SR2T) Grant Program – Fourth Cycle – Recommendation to program eight projects totaling \$4.1 million in the SR2T Grant Program – Fourth Cycle.

**Programming and Allocation Committee – Kinsey (continued)**

Upon the motion by Commissioner Kinsey and seconded by Commissioner Sperring the Commission unanimously approved the following:

- Resolution No. 4038 – 2012 Regional Transportation Improvement Program (RTIP) Program of Projects Adoption. The 2012 RTIP is MTC’s proposal for spending the regional portion of the 2012 State Transportation Improvement Program (STIP). The Commission was asked to adopt the 2012 RTIP and submit it to the California Transportation Commission.

Commissioner Kinsey asked Mr. Heminger to comment on the next steps for California Transportation Commission (CTC) approval. Mr. Heminger noted that the Doyle Drive project was originally envisioned as a “design/bid/build” for the length of the project but is experiencing a cash flow problem of \$34 million. He advised that it has STIP monies pledged, but it is not pledged early enough in the program. Additionally, there is a \$26 million budget problem because the original funding plan contemplated being able to redirect federal earmarks, which was unsuccessful. The public-private partnership (P3) for the project requires an early resolution of this funding plan.

He advised that MTC has offered to cover the cash flow problem by programming Federal STIP monies on the project and San Francisco would then pledge/provide MTC \$34 million of their STIP monies to be paid in a later year. Regarding the budget shortfall, he explained that so far, the two project partners (State of California and the San Francisco County Transportation Authority) have been unable to reach an agreement. He concluded by advising that in the action presented, MTC is asking for more STIP monies than it expects to be awarded but these issues have to be finalized by March – as the P3 contract needs to be signed.

**Legislation Committee – Haggerty**

Commissioner Giacomini expressed her concern with the Parking Policy Reform section of the 2012 Legislative Program per the input of the Policy Advisory Council and suggested this item be removed and be returned to the Policy Advisory Council for further review and comment. Chair Tissier agreed that this issue warranted further vetting. Committee Chair Haggerty suggested that the Commission vote on the complete Program adding the request to have the Legislative Committee along with the Advisory Council to continue to monitor any parking policy reforms as they come forward.

Commissioner Wiener made the motion to consider AB 57 separately from the 2012 Final Legislative Program. Motion was seconded by Commissioner Campos. Motion passed by 13 Yes votes and 3 No votes by Commissioners Cortese, Glover, and Liccardo.

Subsequently, a motion was made by Commissioner Wiener to postpone, indefinitely, whether MTC shall continue to pursue enactment of AB 57 currently residing in the Senate Transportation and Housing Committee with an informal request to the Chair that it be agendaized in either July or September for Committee review. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Campos. Motion failed by 11 No votes to 5 Yes votes by Commissioners Tissier, Campos, Halsted, Mullin and Wiener.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Haggerty, excluding *Item 3b: Modify MTC's board to improve representation of region's largest cities* and seconded by Commissioner Kinsey, the Commission unanimously approved the following:

- 2012 Final Legislative Program

The Commission received public comment from the following:

- Sharon Cornu, Oakland resident, expressed her support for AB 57.
- Joyce Roy, expressed her support for AB 57.

Commissioner Haggerty moved to include Item 3b in the 2012 Final Legislative Program and seconded by Commissioner Liccardo. Motion passed by 13 Yes votes to 3 No Votes by Commissioners Campos, Mullin and Wiener.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT/ADJOURNMENT/NEXT MEETING**

The Commission received public comment from the following:

- Jerry Grace – Requested additional information regarding the Clipper<sup>®</sup> program.

There being no further business or public comment, Commission Chair Tissier adjourned the meeting at 11:43 a.m. The next Commission meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, January 25, 2012 in Oakland, California.

---

Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair