



*Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*David Campos*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Dave Cortese*  
Santa Clara County

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacopini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Mark Green*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Scott Haggerty*  
Alameda County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sam Liccardo*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Kevin Mullin*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Scott Wiener*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

## Programming and Allocations Committee December 14, 2011 Minutes

Chair Kinsey called the meeting to order at approximately 10:29 a.m. Committee members present were: Vice Chair Glover and, Commissioners Cortese, Campos, Dodd, and Wiener. Commissioners Tissier and Rein Worth were present as ad hoc voting members of the Committee. Other Commissioners present as ad hoc members of the Committee were: Giacopini, Green, Haggerty, Halsted, and Mackenzie.

### Consent Calendar

The Committee unanimously approved the following consent items after a motion by Commissioner Glover and a second by Commissioner Dodd:

- Minutes of November 9, 2011 meeting;
- AB 664 Net Bridge Toll Revenue program and allocations for FY2011-12 to reallocate lapsed funds to SFMTA. MTC Resolution Nos. 4043 and 4044;
- FY2011-12 Fund Estimate Revision. MTC Resolution No. 3990, Revised;
- Revision to Regional Express Bus Program to reassign four AC Transit buses for the Dumbarton Express. MTC Resolution No. 3385, Revised;
- Revisions to Short-Range Transit Plan Guidelines. MTC Resolution No. 3532, Revised; and
- Allocation of \$2.9 million in Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds to Fairfield for FY2011-12 transit operations. MTC Resolution Nos. 4025, Revised.

### Regional

- *Lifeline Transportation Program Cycle 3 Guidelines and Mobility Management Guidelines. MTC Resolution Nos. 4033 and 4042.*

Kristen Mazur, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented proposed Lifeline Cycle 3 guidelines including timelines and the project selection process, and eligible projects and guidelines for an accompanying Mobility Management Call for Projects.

Commissioner David Campos commented that the most significant economic pressure faced by low income families whose income is less than \$30,000 annually is that most of their income goes towards transportation and housing and the Lifeline guidelines and modifications being made to the program are critical to address this issue.

Commissioner Steve Kinsey asked what options exist to address the uncertainty of so many of the funding sources referenced for this program. Alix Bockelman responded that the most uncertainty is with the State Transit Assistance (STA) funds. Staff will provide more information on the STA revenues in the February fund estimate and, depending on the generations at that point, may need to work with counties to

adjust their project lists or the timing of when their projects can be delivered.

Commissioner Kinsey further asked if the \$1 million being set aside would be used to develop a means-based discount program, which he noted would be a significant step forward. Ms. Bockelman explained that the \$1 million would be used to conduct a study and early development to support a means-based discount program but additional revenues would have to be identified to support the program implementation. Steve Heminger further commented that there are two sets of issues. The first is that current fare discounts on transit are surrogates for income based on age and disability status. The other is that the various transit systems have different fare discount policies. The intent is to look at the issue of how transit is priced and to determine if the region should continue to rely on surrogate categories or shift toward a more direct means-based discount.

Commissioner Dave Cortese asked where the impetus comes from for the means-based discount program – the region, counties, or transit operators. Mr. Heminger explained that discussions in various forums have taken place. There was an East Bay demonstration of youth passes and a regional fare study through Regional Measure 2. A means-based discount may be the solution to ensuring that discounts are given to individuals that need them.

Commissioner Amy Rein Worth referred to a letter from Contra Costa County and wanted to confirm that the intention of MTC is to coordinate among multiple jurisdictions. Ms. Bockelman commented that language was included to encourage transit operators and CMA staff to coordinate their project selection when projects cross county boundaries.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Campos with a second by Commissioner Cortese, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution Nos. 4033 and 4042 to the Commission for approval.

- *Release Notice for Upcoming Public Hearing: Proposed Amendment to the Regional Measure 2 (RM2) Program for the Dumbarton Rail project.*

Anne Richman, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented a request to release a public hearing notice to begin the 30-day public comment period to modify the project scope for RM2 project #5, the Dumbarton Rail operating project. The revision would allow funds to be used for bus operations in the Dumbarton Bridge corridor rather than for rail operations.

Commissioner Mark Green commented that the approach identified by staff is realistic and urged the Committee to support the recommendation.

Commissioner Adrienne Tissier asked what the approach would be if the San Mateo County Transportation Authority does not concur with the Dumbarton PAC's request to redirect funding. Mr. Heminger explained that it would then be the Commission's decision to make.

Commissioner Steve Kinsey commented that this is similar to what was done with the Sonoma Marin Area Rail in terms of redirecting RM2 funds from one project to another. There are certain findings that will have to be made and we seem to be on track to have discussions brought back to the Committee in January for the public hearing and then Commission action at the end of January but we will know whether or not there is concurrence when the hearing is held.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Tissier with a second by Commissioner Rein Worth, unanimously approved the release of the public hearing notice to modify the Dumbarton Rail operating project.

- *RM2 Safe Routes to Transit (SR2T) Fourth Cycle Grant Program. MTC Resolution No. 3735, Revised.*

Sean Co, MTC Planning Section, presented a recommendation for eight projects in the SR2T Fourth Cycle Grant Program, totaling \$4.1 million.

Commissioner Scott Haggerty questioned the project selection process managed by Transform rather than MTC staff and requested that when this item is brought before the full Commission that staff provide a summary as to where the four cycles of funding have been allocated. Ms. Bockelman explained that the Regional Measure 2 legislation set forth how the program would be administered and specifies in statute that Transform and East Bay Bicycle Coalition are the sponsors for the program.

Commissioner Steve Kinsey directed staff to provide the Commission with a breakdown by agency with the allocation of funding for the past four cycles.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Campos with a second by Commissioner Cortese, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution No. 3735, Revised to the Commission for approval.

### **State**

- *2012 Regional Transportation Improvement Program (RTIP) Program of Projects Adoption. MTC Resolution No. 4038.*

Alix Bockelman, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented a recommendation to the Committee to adopt the 2012 RTIP and to allow staff to transmit the draft RTIP list to the California Transportation Commission by December 15, 2011.

Commissioner Steve Kinsey asked when the Committee would know CTC's response to the RTIP submittal. Ms. Bockelman explained that the CTC is scheduled to take action in March and she expects to hear back from CTC staff in January, which will allow some time for discussion before the March CTC action.

Commissioner Dave Cortese asked if there has been any feedback about the bike/pedestrian programming in the RTIP. Ms. Bockelman explained that the process has been consistent with the past practice to direct half of the Transportation Enhancements (TE) funding for regional priorities. The Congestion Management Agencies did express some concerns with the regional project proposed, but agreed with the concept of leveraging state funds and recommended that staff consider distributing the remaining regional TE funds to the counties as part of the OneBay Area Grant program. The counties still have non-regional TE funds that would be proposed for local projects.

Commissioner Kinsey asked for further information about the bike/pedestrian project related to the Bay Bridge. Mr. Heminger explained that these funds are not intended for the bike/pedestrian path on the bridge, rather they are for Gateway Park access to the bridge. He said staff will provide the Commission with an overview of plans for Gateway Park early in 2012.

Commissioner Scott Wiener commented that the Presidio Parkway project is critical to the region and that it provides a critical transportation link to the North Bay. Commissioner Wiener further commented that the \$26 million funding gap has been an ongoing issue. Mr. Heminger explained that \$80 million of state bridge tolls were programmed to the Doyle Drive / Presidio Parkway project. Under then-Chair Bill Dodd, the Commission negotiated a funding plan for the project assuming it was a design, bid, build project and the tail-end of the plan identified the \$26 million gap in funding. Now the \$26 million is needed earlier in order to implement the Public-Private Partnership agreement for this project. MTC staff has proposed to address the cash flow issue and advance \$34 million of federal funding to the Doyle Drive project with \$34 million of future San Francisco STIP funds returning for regional decision-making. He noted that it is a reasonable expectation that the two project sponsors (Caltrans and SFCTA) would cover the budget shortfall amount. There are a couple of months before the RTIP is adopted to finalize a funding plan.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Dodd with a second by Commissioner Cortese, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution Nos. 4038 to the Commission for approval.

**Public Comment**

There were no public comments.

Commissioner Kinsey adjourned the meeting at approximately 11:20 a.m.