



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair
San Mateo County

Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Dave Cortese
Santa Clara County

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Mark Green
Association of Bay Area Governments

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
Cities of Santa Clara County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Kevin Mullin
Cities of San Mateo County

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

COMMISSION MEETING

Wednesday, October 26, 2011

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607

MINUTES

ATTENDANCE

Chair Tissier called the meeting to order at 10:14 a.m. In addition to Chair Tissier and Vice Chair Rein-Worth, the following Commissioners were present: Commissioners Bates, Campos, Cortese, Glover, Green, Haggerty, Kinsey, Mackenzie, Mullin, Spering, and Wiener.

CHAIR'S REPORT

- Chair Tissier welcomed and introduced Grace Crunican, new General Manager for the Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART). Ms. Crunican indicated that she is looking forward to working with MTC.
- Commission Chair Tissier reminded Commissioners of changes in the Commission meetings in November and December dates and times due to the holidays, and asked Commissioners to mark their calendars accordingly. A schedule with new dates and times was distributed to Commissioners.

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT

- Egon Terplan presented the Policy Advisory Council Report and indicated that they had a very full meeting and discussed the Equity Analysis Scenarios; Title VI Update and the Transit Sustainability Project. Mr. Terplan indicated that the Council supports the Equity Analysis Scenarios but some concerns were expressed about potential unintended consequences of making the jobs/housing connection the theme with a performance metric of lowering the commute travel time. As transit takes longer, this could unintentionally give the advantage to auto transportation and discourage scenarios that involve transit and walking. He indicated further that regarding healthy communities, the metric of Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) density could also have unintended outcomes, since cities are inherently dense. Mr. Terplan also reported that in reference to the Title VI Update, the Council is very supportive of the program. In regard to the Transit Sustainability Project update, Mr. Terplan indicated that the Council received an update and the Council has some growing concerns although no motion was made on the subject.

Mr. Terplan noted that the reason this project was started by MTC is that as a region there has been more and more money put into the transit system for the past ten years, but the region has been getting less and less out of it. The speeds have been slowing down on a lot of the lines and costs are going up at a much faster rate than ridership. The Council's concern at the time is that, some of the proposed solutions may be insufficient to actually fully reform the overall system. In particular, the idea that metrics would only be set for the regional systems and not the local systems seems to be an arbitrary cut off, and does not necessarily serve the transit systems. As some of the specific recommendations come forward, he noted that we have to ask ourselves as a region are these the recommendations that are really going to make transit better? We will be asking the public for more money to go into the transit system and they are not going to put in money if they don't think they are going to get a better return on it. He indicated that the public doesn't think more money will cause transit to speed up or that transit is going to be more reliable; that has not been the case thus far. He offered one message to the Commission to think about: for the Commission to put conditions on new money that goes into the system. Mr. Terplan indicated that the Council hopes to work with the Commission as recommendations come forward.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ann Flemer presented the Executive Director's report to the Commission in Steve Heminger's absence. Copies of the report are available from the Executive Office or www.mtc.ca.gov.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Commissioner Green informed the Commissioners that the Alameda County published a document on polling for those who may be interested on a regional stand point.

CONSENT CALENDAR

Upon the motion by Commissioner Spring and seconded by Commission Vice Chair Rein Worth the Commission unanimously approved the following items on the Consent Calendar:

- Commission Meeting Minutes – September 28, 2011.
- Joint MTC/BATA Meeting Minutes – September 28, 2011.

Programming and Allocations Committee

- Resolution Nos. 3925, Revised and 3989, Revised – Climate Initiatives Innovative Grant Program changes.

- Resolution Nos. 4025, Revised and 4026, Revised – Allocation of \$6.2 million in Transportation Development Act. (TDA) funds and \$20.5 million in State Transit Assistance (STA) to various transit claimants for FY 2011-12 transit operations.
- Resolution No. 4037 – 2011 Productivity Improvement Program (PIP) from Transportation Development Act (TDA) Triennial Audit Reports.

Standing Committee Minutes

Draft Committee minutes of the following standing committees were presented for information only; they were provided as background information for items that were being taken up by the full Commission.

- Administration Committee Meeting Draft Minutes – October 12, 2011.
- Programming and Allocations Meeting Draft Minutes – October 12, 2011.
- Planning Committee Meeting Draft Minutes – October 14, 2011.
- Operations Committee Meeting Draft Minutes – October 14, 2011.
- Legislation Committee Meeting Draft Minutes – October 14, 2011.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Ad Hoc Audit Committee - Tissier

- a. Fiscal Year 2010-11 Fiscal Audit.

Chair Tissier announced that Pricewaterhouse Coopers conducted an exit interview with an ad hoc committee consisting of Chair Tissier; and Commissioners Cortese and Mackenzie, the morning of October 26th. Chair Tissier also indicated that they reviewed the following:

- MTC Financial report for June 30, 2011.
- Single Audit A-133 report for federal funding.
- BAIFA Financial statements.
- Business Control review of the FasTrak[®] service center.
- Management comments on internal controls.

The auditors went over the audit opinion as well as any recommendations and corrective actions.

- The audit opinion is unqualified.
- The auditors reported no material weaknesses or questioned costs in internal controls.
- The auditors did discuss some findings designed to improve internal reporting procedures as well as management's plans to implement the procedures.

Chair Tissier asked for the Commission to accept the June 30, 2011 Annual Financial Report, indicating that a copy of the MTC financial report was on the table.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Mackenzie and seconded by Commissioner Spering the Commission received the Audit with Commissioner Wiener abstaining, due to the fact that he had not had a chance to review the audit prior to voting.

Operations Committee – Mackenzie

- Resolution No. 3866, Revised – Update of Transit Coordination Implementation Plan relating to the Clipper[®] program. The revisions primarily:
 - Establish specific dates for the transition of certain SamTrans and VTA passes to Clipper[®]-only form;
 - Update the transition dates of BART's High Value Discount, red and green tickets;
 - Delete some fare products that are not a good fit for Clipper[®]; and
 - Note the completed transition of 27 fare products to Clipper[®].

Upon the motion by Commissioner Mackenzie and seconded by Commissioner Spering the Commission unanimously approved Resolution No. 3866, Revised.

PUBLIC COMMENT/ADJOURNMENT/NEXT MEETING

There being no further business or public comment, Commission Chair Tissier adjourned the meeting at 10:30 a.m. The next Commission meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, November 16, 2011 @ 1:30 p.m. in Oakland, California.

Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair