

Date: October 26, 2011  
W.I.: 1514  
Referred By: PAC

ABSTRACT

Resolution No. 4037

This resolution adopts MTC's FY2011-12 Productivity Improvement Program (PIP).

Further discussion of this action is contained in the Programming and Allocation's Summary Sheet for October 12, 2011.

Date: October 26, 2011  
W.I.: 1514  
Referred By: PAC

Re: MTC Productivity Improvement Program

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
RESOLUTION NO. 4037

WHEREAS, Public Utilities Code (PUC) section 99244 provides that each transportation planning agency shall annually identify, analyze, and recommend potential productivity improvements which could lower the operating costs of transit operators within the area under its jurisdiction; and

WHEREAS, as provided for in Government Code sections 66500 *et seq.*, the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) is the regional transportation planning agency for the San Francisco Bay Area; and

WHEREAS, PUC section 99244 provides that recommendations for improvements and productivity shall include, but not be limited to, those recommendations related to productivity made in the triennial performance audits of transit operators conducted pursuant to PUC section 99246; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99244, MTC is required each fiscal year, to make a finding that a transit operator has made a reasonable effort in implementing productivity improvement recommendations prior to approving the allocation of Transportation Development Act funds in an amount greater than was allocated to the operator in the preceding fiscal year; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99314.7, MTC is required each fiscal year, to make a finding that a transit operator has made reasonable effort in implementing productivity improvements pursuant to PUC section 99244, prior to approving the allocation of State Transit Assistance funds to the operator for operating purposes; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99233.2, MTC may support the regional transportation planning process by providing technical assistance funding to transit operators or other entities to implement transit productivity improvements; and

WHEREAS, MTC adopted Resolution No. 3617, which describes MTC's statutory responsibilities related to the identification, development and recommendation of transit

productivity improvements through the MTC Productivity Improvement Program, and which reference MTC's administrative procedures attendant to these programs; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that MTC adopts the performance audit-based projects, and other productivity improvement projects, as the case may be, set forth in Attachment A to this resolution, and incorporated herein by reference.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

---

Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair

The above resolution was adopted by the Metropolitan Transportation Commission at a regular meeting of the Commission held in Oakland, California, on October 26, 2011.

Date: October 26, 2011  
W.I.: 1514  
Referred By: PAC

Attachment A  
Resolution No. 4037  
Page 1 of 20

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: AC Transit

Project Title: Review and Address Fringe Benefit Costs

Project Goal: Reduce fringe benefit costs.

Project Description: Conduct an analysis of fringe benefit costs and implement cost-cutting measures.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Review medical insurance options	15%
2	Completed	Review history of costs and relationship to other employers	10%
3	Completed	Review pension benefits	15%
4	December 2011	Review pension history, unfunded liability, comparison to other retirement benefits	10%
5	December 2011	Identify cost cutting measures	20%
6	July 2012	Implement changes	30%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: AC Transit

Project Title: Implement the State of Good Repair Program

Project Goal: Implement the State of Good Repair Program to reduce road calls.

Project Description: AC Transit is seeking grant funding from FTA to hire a consultant to review current practices and update them to industry standards and also make sure the condition of the buses are all updated to a state of good repair.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Solicit consultant services and conduct needs assessment.	10%
2	November 2011	Procurement process for asset management system.	10%
3	November 2012	Create and implement a State of Good Repair process (asset management system; vehicle condition assessment).	75%
4	December 2012	Document best practices/lessons learned from State of Good Repair Program.	5%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **AC Transit**

Project Title:        Continue to Take Steps to Complete All Preventive Maintenance Inspections on Schedule

Project Goal: Ensure that all preventive maintenance inspections are scheduled and implemented on time.

Project Description: Develop State of Good Repair-funded maintenance practices, upgrade asset management and service scheduling program, implement protocols to ensure proper use and scheduling. Assess vehicle condition and schedule improvements.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	December 2011	Assess asset management database and scheduling software options.	10%
2	December 2012	Implement new software.	20%
3	November 2012	Update maintenance manual/practices.	20%
4	March 2013	Implement new maintenance protocols.	25%
5	June 2013	Assess vehicle condition and schedule improvements.	25%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **BART**

Project Title:        Continue to Address the Perception among Passengers That Police Presence is Substandard

Project Goal: Improve customer perception of police presence on trains and in stations and parking facilities.

Project Description: Strengthen police services to our customers and employees through more effective and efficient high visibility patrols.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Provide a minimum of two (2) random train sweep inspections per patrol officer per shift during revenue hours.	20%
2	Completed	Deploy Critical Asset Corridor Patrol Team to patrol Downtown Oakland and San Francisco BART Stations during the weekday high commute morning and evening hours.	20%
3	September 2011	Use crime analysis and deploy bike patrols to parking structures and around stations where there are high incidents of bike thefts and vehicle burglaries.	20%
4	January 2012	Develop a new deployment strategy where personnel are highly visible on our busiest platforms during the weekday morning and evening commute hours.	20%
5	June 2012	Redesign zones and beat structure to deploy personnel where they are most needed.	20%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:     **Central Contra Costa Transit Authority**

Project Title:         Reduce the Spare Ratio of the Fixed Route Fleet

Project Goals: Adjust the fleet size to coincide with the 23% reduction in service that took effect in Spring 2009.

Project Description: The Spring 2009 service cuts resulted in a 34% spare ratio for the fixed route fleet. To address this, County Connection will forgo its 10 bus replacement scheduled for 2011 and remove the 10 buses from service. This will reduce the fleet spare ratio by 10 vehicles.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Obtain Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) amendment to convert Program of Projects (POP) bus replacement to Preventative Maintenance	75%
2	Completed	Submit grant for preventative maintenance and receive MTC concurrence	15%
3	September 2011	Remove equipment from service	10%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Eastern Contra Costa Transit Authority (Tri-Delta)**

Project Title: Improve the On-Time Performance of the Demand-Response (DR) Service

Project Goals: Increase demand-response on-time performance to the 90% goal.

Project Description: Work closely with contractor to improve the on-time performance of the demand-response system so that paratransit passengers will receive more dependable service.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Work with contractor to ensure understanding of goal and discuss methods to achieve it.	25%
2	Completed	Acquire additional med-vans for specialized service.	50%
3	September 2011	Acquire 25 additional and 20 replacement DR vans for general DR service.	25%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Fairfield And Suisun Transit (FAST)**

Project Title: Continue to Improve Procedures for Routine Performance Monitoring and Assessing Performance Against Standards

Project Goals: To ensure staff understands the strengths and weaknesses of its fixed route system on a continual basis to allow for sound business decisions that will ensure the long-term stability of the system.

Project Description: Fairfield and Suisun Transit (FAST) will revise its performance standards, procedures, and monthly reports for monitoring performance against these standards to gauge productivity, efficiency and farebox recovery, and reliability on a continual basis.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Establish sound data collection procedures through the use of the GFI Farebox and Trapeze scheduling systems	25%
2	November 2011	Work with consultant (Solutions for Transit) to maximize reporting options that will provide readily available performance monitoring information	15%
3	April 2012	Develop planning reports that specifically identify performance goals and standards, as well as the monthly and historical performance data that assess performance against goals and standards	20%
4	April 2012	Develop internal staff procedures/processes for ensuring that staff is monitoring and assessing performance	20%
5	June 2012	Develop plan for addressing poor performance	20%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Golden Gate Bridge Highway Transportation District**

Project Title: Evaluate SRTP Performance Standards that Appear to be Inconsistent with Actual Performance

Project Goals: Create more rigorous standards appropriate to actual performance.

Project Description: Review SRTP performance standards to develop more appropriate, relevant, and rigorous standards for ongoing evaluation of transit services.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	September 2011	Review and Analyze all numerical performance standards in SRTP.	33%
2	October 2011	Develop recommendations for modifying performance measure standards that are inconsistent with actual performance.	33%
3	November 2011	Finalize modifications with operating division managers.	34%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Napa County Transportation and Planning Agency (NCTPA)**

Project Title: Review Performance Monitoring Efforts to Ensure Consistency with Established Measures and Standards

Project Goal: Improve the completeness and accuracy of NCTPA’s performance monitoring efforts.

Project Description: NCTPA establishes and revises its goals, objectives and performance measures through its SRTP development process. NCTPA then monitors its transit performance through monthly reports from its contractors and internal monitoring spreadsheets developed and updated by NCTPA staff. NCTPA needs to review its established measures, standards and performance monitoring procedures to ensure consistency between the stated measures and standards and actual monitoring of those measures. This will help improve the completeness and accuracy of NCTPA’s performance monitoring efforts.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	In 2009 NCTPA established a Transit Efficiency sub-Committee of the Board of Directors to monitor performance standards on an on-going, quarterly basis	20%
2	December 2011	Implement GPS software system to monitor on-time performance	25%
3	December 2012	Supervisors to conduct physical time and point checks	15%
4	December 2012	Addition behind the wheel and safety training with follow through by purchase transportation provider management	15%
5	December 2012	Monitor on-time performance and accident reports from purchased transportation provider	25%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Napa County Transportation and Planning Agency (NCTPA)**

Project Title: Take Steps to Control Passenger Cancellations on the Paratransit Service

Project Goal: Achieve a less than 4% cancellation rate on paratransit services.

Project Description: NCTPA has established a performance measure of less than four percent as the cancellation rate on its paratransit services. During this audit period, cancellations almost doubled from 6.4 percent in FY2007 to 12.6 percent in FY2008. Cancellations reduce NCTPA's ability to provide efficient and effective service to all users. NCTPA should work with its contractor to determine the reasons for this trend, reduce the number of cancellations, and continue to monitor the cancellation rate to ensure proposed solutions to the problem are implemented.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	September 2011	Implement Vision software to schedule appointments and monitor cancellations	25%
2	June 2012	Staff to work with clients and monitor habitual late cancellations	50%
3	December 2012	Develop enforceable policies and procedures for program operations, performance measures, and penalties for habitual late cancellations	25%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **Napa County Transportation and Planning Agency (NCTPA)**

Project Title:        New Fare Collection System for VINE Transit System

Project Goal: The procurement and installation of a new fare collections system will support the VINE transit line's complex requirement of fare collection, reporting, and new fare media to better serve our customers who ride the VINE system.

Project Description: The VINE transit service currently utilizes an antiquated fare box collection system that is obsolete. The fare collection system has difficulty generating accurate reports and data needed to forecast the transit line revenues and reconcile money received. The procurement of a new farebox collection system will greatly enhance the public transit experience for our customers by allowing the customer the ability to pay for their respective fare with several different options such as currency, credit card, or electronically.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Request for Proposal (RFP) for Farebox Analysis	15%
2	Completed	Report of needs analysis of products/technologies available to serve the VINE transit system	20%
3	December 2012	Create RFP for new collection system. Submit RFP to public, review, and select vendor	20%
4	March 2012	Award contract	15%
5	December 2012	Delivery and installation of new fare boxes and installation into VINE buses	30%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Napa County Transportation and Planning Agency (NCTPA)**

Project Title: Rideshare Program

Project Goal: Provide the general public with high quality, personalized rideshare, transit, and other non-drive alone trip planning through teleservices, internet and through other means. The Rideshare program will bring commuters together. The origin, destination, and work times are processed to provide a list of possible carpool or bike buddy matches as well as convenient park and ride lots along the route.

Project Description: The commuter service is deigned to inform people about less expensive and environmentally friendly commuting alternatives. The public will be informed to help make wise commuting choices that reduce traffic congestion, pollution, commuting stress, and save money.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Develop online communication package for employers that can be used to inform employees about commute alternatives	25%
2	Completed	Form 2 vanpools and handle the support for all vanpools arriving/departing Napa County	30%
3	June 2011	Develop and implement a marketing campaign for the rideshare program	20%
4	December 2012	Add rideshare information/ database on nctpa.net website	25%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Napa County Transportation and Planning Agency (NCTPA)**

Project Title: Create and Implement New Performance Goals and Targets for New Short Range Transit Plan (SRTP)

Project Goal: NCTPA will develop and adopt a Short Range Transit Plan based upon public input and current needs of passengers.

Project Description: NCTPA will develop a full Short Range Transit Plan. The SRTP will evaluate the regional transit system and unmet needs assessment. The SRTP will survey existing riders and potential riders and address the Napa County Strategic Transportation Plan adopted in June 2009.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	December 2010	Request for Proposal (RFP) process and selection of Short Range Transit Plan consultants	25%
2	December 2012	Development of community transit plans for American Canyon, Yountville, St. Helena, and Calistoga	25%
3	November 2012	Short Range Transit Plan Report	50%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Napa County Transportation and Planning Agency (NCTPA)**

Project Title: Create and Implement New Performance Goals and Targets Based Upon Recommendations from Completed Market Segmentation Study

Project Goal: Develop a plan to improve the efficiency of the region's public transportation infrastructure.

Project Description: NCTPA will develop a plan to receive public opinion research data to improve the efficiency of the region's public transportation infrastructure. The information will help refine marketing approaches and develop appropriate tools to reach potential markets. Also, the information will make it possible to prepare a comprehensive marketing plan based upon the research data and assist NCTPA staff on an as-needed basis to implement the plan with specific marketing elements.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Request for Proposal (RFP) process and selection of Marketing Segmentation Consultants	50%
2	Completed	Market Segmentation Study Report	25%
3	December 2011	Implement Marketing Plan	25%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **City of Petaluma**

Project Title: Take Steps to Examine the Reporting of Performance Data by Operations Contractors to Ensure Data is Collected Timely and Accurately

Project Goal: Take steps to ensure that all the performance data is being reported as established in the City of Petaluma's operating contracts.

Project Description: The City's operations contracts include performance indicators that the contractors are required to report in writing each month to the City. During the Triennial TDA Audit, it was discovered that performance data for several of the standards established by the City were not included in the monthly reports submitted by the contractors. For fixed route service, these included miles between preventable accidents, passenger injuries per 100,000 miles, on-time departures and number of road calls. Road call data was supplied separately by the City. Paratransit reports were missing data for missed trips. This makes it difficult to determine both the City's and contractor's performance against the established standards. The City needs to take steps to ensure that all the performance data is being reported as established in its operating contracts.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Award new operations contract	25%
2	Completed	Begin new operations contract	5%
3	Completed	Meet with operations contractor to define format for periodic reporting	15%
4	Completed	Review contractor performance reports for first six months of contract	15%
5	December 2011	Revisit reporting procedures to ensure selected method is effective	15%
6	On-going	Monitor contractor performance reports	25%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)**

Project Title: Incorporate the Set Of Goals, Objectives, Measures and Standards that Address Paratransit Performance into the Primary Performance Monitoring Process

Project Goal: Incorporate the goals, objectives, quantifiable measures and performance standards for paratransit service and maintain the on-going performance monitoring.

Project Description: SFMTA has implemented goals, objectives and performance monitoring for paratransit. They address both the Paratransit Broker management activities and the provision of services. However, it does not appear that paratransit performance standards have been incorporated into SFMTA's primary performance monitoring process beyond these contract-based items.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	April 2012	Incorporate paratransit performance standards into SFMTA's primary performance monitoring process	50%
2	On-going	Maintain on-going performance monitoring	50%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **San Mateo County Transit District (SamTrans)**

Project Title: Reconfigure the Long Term Target Items Contained in the Quantitative Standards in the Short Range Transit Plan

Project Goal: Address the recommendation in the 2009 TDA Audit to update quantitative standards of system performance. This is being done through two means: the SamTrans Service Plan (ongoing, with projected completion of the analysis phase in 2012) and coordination with the MTC Transit Sustainability Project. SamTrans will examine peer to peer assessments of service performance and look at maximizing efficiency and ongoing monitoring of performance.

Project Description: SamTrans will continue to provide updates to its quarterly performance monitoring program; conduct a detailed analysis of service provision and coordinate with the MTC TSP for regional metrics of service performance.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	2012	Participate in MTC Transit Sustainability Project and committees.	50%
2	2012	Conduct service analysis through the SamTrans Service Plan to update baseline information and prepare recommended future performance metrics and standards ("long-term target items" as recommended in the audit report).	50%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Santa Rosa CityBus**

Project Title: Fixed Route System Evaluation and Service Improvements

Project Goal: The goal of performing a fixed route system evaluation and associated service improvements are to increase overall system ridership by 3 - 5% and improve system efficiency. Implement the first CityBus high-frequency route, with 15 minute headways.

Project Description: This project will evaluate the performance of several low-performing routes and reallocate resources from the low-performing routes to create at least one high-frequency route in Santa Rosa, taking into account community resource allocation levels, minority and low-income population distribution, and future identified system growth.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	March 2012	Preliminary System Evaluation and identification of system improvements	30%
2	June 2012	Public outreach and feedback on proposed system improvements	20%
3	July 2012	City Council Approval of proposed changes	10%
4	October 2012	Implement system improvements	20%
5	April 2013	Perform preliminary on-time and ridership evaluation on system changes	10%
6	October 2013	Evaluate total system ridership benchmarks	10%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Santa Rosa CityBus**

Project Title: Enhanced Automated Vehicle Locator System

Project Goal: The goal of implementing an Enhanced Automated Vehicle Locator System is to improve system performance through delivery of improved system information, and increase total system ridership through the deployment of real-time passenger information in both fixed signage and electronic media.

Project Description: This project will implement an Automated Vehicle Locator system on the Santa Rosa CityBus fixed-route fleet that will be enhanced with a real-time arrival prediction function, Automated Passenger Counting, smart-phone subscription capabilities, fare box and head sign integration, automated enunciator, and vehicle diagnostic capabilities.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	October 2011	Release Enhanced AVL RFP	10%
2	March 2012	Award vendor contract	10%
3	August 2012	Complete system installation	30%
4	October 2012	Market and Outreach program	20%
5	October 2012	Initiate system	20%
6	April 2013	System evaluation	10%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2011-2012 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **City of Union City**

Project Title:        Tripper Service for School Bell Times

Project Goal:    Increase passenger productivity per hour.

Project Description: Work with contractor to add in permanent tripper buses on existing scheduled runs to accommodate a large increase in student ridership. The local school district has eliminated almost all of their school bus service and it is anticipated that a lot of those students will now be using public transit service instead.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Examine ridership levels per route.	40%
2	October 2011	Make recommendations for tripper implementation changes.	20%
3	November 2011	Design runcuts for new tripper service.	20%
4	December 2011	Include new runcuts in driver bids.	10%
5	December 2011	Implement permanent service.	10%
		Total	100%