



*Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*David Campos*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Dave Cortese*  
Santa Clara County

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacopini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Mark Green*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Scott Haggerty*  
Alameda County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sam Liccardo*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Kevin Mullin*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Scott Wiener*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

## Programming and Allocations Committee September 14, 2011 Minutes

Chair Kinsey called the meeting to order at approximately 10:22 a.m. Committee members present were: Commissioners Bates, Cortese, Campos, Dodd, Glover, and Wiener. Commissioner Rein Worth was present as an ad hoc voting member of the Committee. Other Commissioners present as an ad hoc member of the Committee were: Giacopini, Green, Haggerty, Halsted, and Mackenzie.

### Consent Calendar

The Committee unanimously approved the following consent items after a motion by Commissioner Glover and a second by Commissioner Cortese:

- Minutes of July 11, 2011 meeting;
- 2011 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Amendment 2011-13. MTC Resolution No. 3975, Revised;
- FY2011-12 State Transit Assistance (STA) Regional Discretionary Program. MTC Resolution No. 4007, Revised;
- Revisions to the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA): FTA Section 5311 (Nonurbanized) Program. MTC Resolution No. 3888, Revised;
- Programming of FY2011-12 5% State Unrestricted Funds and 2% Bridge Toll Revenues to WETA for Ferry service. MTC Resolution No. 4009;
- Allocation of \$8.5 million in Regional Measure 2 (RM2), \$59.4 million in Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds, \$42.1 million in State Transit Assistance (STA) funds and \$29.2 million in AB 1107 funds to various claimants in the region. MTC Resolution Nos. 4004, 4025, Revised, 4026, Revised, and 4032; and
- FY2011-12 Fund Estimate Revision. MTC Resolution No. 3990, Revised.

### Regional

- *Sonoma Marin Area Rail Transit (SMART) Project Public Hearing and Allocations. Resolution Nos. 3712, Revised, 3801, Revised, 3884, Revised, and 4022.*
  - *Public Hearing: Proposed Amendment to the Regional Measure 2 (RM2) Program.*
  - *Subject to completion of the public hearing process, refer to the Commission programming and allocation of funds to the SMART project for design and construction.*

Commissioner Kinsey provided introductory comments and opened the public hearing. Anne Richman, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented a request to amend the RM2 Program to modify the project scope for the SMART project to include the segment from San Rafael to Santa Rosa; to reassign \$1.5 million in funding from the Greenbrae Interchange/Larkspur Ferry Access Improvement project to the SMART project; and to program and allocate funds to the SMART project for design and construction.

Commissioner Kinsey asked for public comment. There was one public speaker, Andy Peri of Marin County Bicycle Coalition, who spoke in favor of the SMART project. Commissioner Kinsey closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Kinsey commented that it would be worth bringing the TOD policy back before the Commission to ensure that in addition to transit to housing, transit to work also be considered. Ann Flemer, Deputy Executive Director of Policy commented that this is a point that has been raised in discussions on Plan Bay Area and is expected to come back to the Commission in that context at a later time.

Commissioner Mackenzie commented that the current TOD policy had a major impact on SMART deliberations and in the City Council of Rohnert Park. He noted that the city's submittal of the PDA application in the next cycle will further cement the commitment to ensuring that housing is going to be within walking and biking distance to SMART stations.

Commissioner Bates commented that he would like to further review the TOD policy because it is important to emphasize the job component in the TOD policy.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Bates with a second by Commissioner Cortese, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution Nos. 3712, Revised, 3801, Revised, 3884, Revised, and 4022 to the Commission for approval.

- *Proposed allocation of \$27.1 million in AB 1171 Capital funds, and a rescission and allocation of approximately \$1 million in RM2 Capital funds. MTC Resolution No. 3914, Revised and 3682, Revised.*

Shruti Hari, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented an allocation request for \$27.1 million in AB 1171 Capital funds for the integration of eBART median structures into Caltrans/CCTA SR 4 contract segments and to accommodate eBART in the median, and a rescission for approximately \$1 million in RM2 Capital funds from prior allocations to the Clipper® project and a reallocation of the same funds to other Clipper® activities.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Glover with a second by Commissioner Cortese, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution Nos. 3914, Revised and 3682, Revised to the Commission for approval.

- *Lifeline Program Evaluation.*

Anne Richman, MTC Programming and Allocations Section and, Richard Weiner of Nelson Nygard, presented findings from the Lifeline Transportation Program evaluation and requested input on the draft recommendations for a third Lifeline funding cycle.

Commissioner Campos asked if the assessment included the overall impact the Lifeline program had in addressing the transportation needs of low income communities in the Bay Area. Mr. Weiner explained that this was a fairly complex issue because the intentions identified when the program began in 2005 were affected by the economy, which in turn cause fixed route transit cuts. These cuts made it difficult to determine the success of the program with regards to ridership in low income communities.

Commissioner Campos asked if there is a summary of various services that were restored region-wide, new services added, and a summary of those benefits. Anne Richman advised that a summary is available which contains that information in terms of the services provided and the number of users for those services and that she would be happy to make available to the Commissioners.

Commissioner Campos commented that it is important to hear directly from low income communities and asked what efforts were made to reach out to those communities. Ms. Richman explained that this was something that the Technical Advisory Committee struggled with and it was determined that stakeholder involvement needed to be broadened to reach more of the low income communities.

Commissioner Rein Worth commented that it is important to continue to actively engage the CMAs because they are working very closely with communities and local transit agencies to identify the communities at a route-specific level. She asked if the Lifeline evaluation contemplates taking a look at the current census data and addressing communities of concern in various areas of the Bay Area. Ann Flemer commented that the evaluation of communities of concern will come before the Planning Committee in October. She further noted that staff could come back before the Committee with an evaluation of the community based transportation planning process.

Commissioner Giacopini asked how projects that cross county boundaries are addressed. Ms. Richman explained that this is an issue that has come up in the first two cycles of funding and there are some projects that cross county lines that have been challenging for the project sponsors and for the CMAs. One idea is to further involve MTC in projects that cross multiple counties and to further encourage the CMAs to work with each other in those instances.

Commissioner Kinsey commented that he has been directly involved with two community based transportation planning processes that have benefitted from Lifeline funds. With regards to Commissioner Campos' comments on how to reach out to communities, in Marin County local grass roots organizations were utilized, under contract to the CMA, to facilitate the outreach and development of these plans. He also asked for further clarification on the limited funding to Pedestrian and Bicycle and Information and Outreach project. Ms. Richman explained that the main issue with these projects to this point is that the mix of funding sources that have been dedicated to this program are primarily transit funds and heavily weighted towards transit capital funding. This demonstrates that there is a real need in this program for more operating funds and flexible funds that can be used for pedestrian and bicycle projects.

Commissioner Bates commented that when he thinks of Lifeline programs he thinks of a program that would provide opportunities for people to get to and from work, hospitals, and other important services. Strategies need to be looked at in instances where there are cuts to public transportation affecting those trips.

This item was presented for informational purposes and no action was taken by the Committee.

### **Federal**

- *Surface Transportation Program/Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (STP/CMAQ) First Cycle Programming Revision. MTC Resolution No. 3925, Revised.*

Craig Goldblatt, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented a request to use additional FY2010-11 apportionments to advance \$18 million in Cycle 2 programming within the existing New Transportation Act STP/CMAQ Program framework.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Cortese with a second by Commissioner Campos, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution No. 3925, Revised to the Commission for approval.

### **State**

- *2012 RTIP Policies and Procedures. MTC Resolution No. 4028.*

Kenneth Kao, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented policies and procedures for the 2012 Regional Transportation Improvement Program (RTIP).

Commissioner Kinsey asked if Caltrans is aware of and in support of the pre-review policy. Mr. Kao confirmed that the change in this procedure has been discussed with Caltrans and they are in support of this change.

Commissioner Haggerty asked what is envisioned by further involving Caltrans in the review process and if this would create a delay in projects. Mr. Kao explained that the change in the process would help to identify problems before they occur. Once the CMAs submit their applications on October 24, Caltrans is expected to turn the applications around within a two week period. Commissioner Haggerty requested to go on record as being uncomfortable with this process. Dan McElhenney of Caltrans explained that they will not be an impediment and the plan is a cursory review with a very quick turnaround. Commissioner Kinsey commented that if the process works the way it is intended it is in our best interest because this process will catch issues before it is too late in the process.

The Committee, upon the motion of Commissioner Campos with a second by Commissioner Wiener, unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution No. 4028 to the Commission for approval.

**California Transportation Commission Update**

Alix Bockelman, MTC Programming and Allocations Section, presented an update from the CTC meeting held on August 10, 2011 in Sacramento, California. Highlights included the approval of \$328 million in state funds for Bay Area projects including SR-12 Jameson Canyon Widening in Napa and Solano Counties, US-101 Auxiliary Lanes in Santa Clara County, I-880 Widening in Santa Clara County, SR-4 East Widening in Contra Costa County, SR-84 Expressway in Alameda County, and the Kato Road Grade Crossing in Alameda County. Alix also noted that the CTC was meeting today and tomorrow in Petaluma, and will be receiving a presentation by Steve Heminger on the Bay Area Express Lane proposal.

**Public Comment**

Commissioner Kinsey adjourned the meeting at approximately 11:18 a.m.