METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair
San Mateo County

Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Dave Cortese
Santa Clara County

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Mark Green
Association of Bay Area Governments

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
Cities of Santa Clara County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Kevin Mullin
Cities of San Mateo County

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Vacancy
City and County of San Francisco

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Policy Advisory Council
July 13, 2011
Draft Minutes

Chair Dolly Sandoval called the meeting to order at 1:36 p.m. Members in attendance were Naomi Armenta, Cathleen Baker, Paul Branson, Richard Burnett, Carlos Castellanos, Bena Chang, Wilbert Din, Sandi Galvez, Richard Hedges, Dolores Jaquez, Linda Jeffery Sailors, Randi Kinman, Federico Lopez, Marshall Loring, Yokia Mason, Tanya Narath, Tina King Neuhausel, Cheryl O'Connor, Kendal Oku, Lori Reese-Brown, Gerald Rico, and Frank Robertson. Excused: JoAnn Busenbark and Egon Terplan. Absent: Allison Hughes and Evelina Molina.

Approval of May and June Meeting Minutes

The minutes of the May 11, 2011 and June 8, 2011 meetings were unanimously approved after a motion by Mr. Loring and a second by Mr. Branson.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

Subcommittee Reports

Equity and Access Subcommittee
Subcommittee Chair Armenta reported that the subcommittee received a report on the Lifeline transportation program. She added that the subcommittee will be looking at new census data at a future meeting. Ms. Sandoval asked what the next step is in the Lifeline program assessment. Ms. Armenta said the subcommittee will review the draft program guidelines. Ms. Reese-Brown asked what the subcommittee would be looking for on the census data. Ms. Kinman explained that MTC defines communities of concern by ethnicity and/or income, and members would like to find out if the community boundaries have shifted or if there are new communities of concern. Mr. Robertson added that the subcommittee would also include the elderly and the disabled. Ms. Kinman clarified that their data is not tracked in the same manner as income and ethnicity. Ms. Sandoval requested staff explain via e-mail how the elderly and the disabled get reported in the census.

Plan Bay Area Alternative Scenarios

Deputy Executive Director for Policy Ann Flemer introduced the item to the Council. She noted that the Commission requested the Council's input. Doug Johnson of MTC

Plan Bay Area Alternative Scenarios (continued)

staff and Miriam Chion of ABAG staff presented how the alternative scenarios are being developed and how equity is being addressed.

Chair Sandoval first requested members ask clarifying questions. Questions included:

- What analysis will be used to determine if transit maintenance and operations monies can in fact be shifted around?
- Would staff be adding a 6th scenario specific to equity?
- Define PM (preventive maintenance).
- Does the forty percent minimum housing floor refer to housing production or planning?
- How does staff plan to get more affordable housing built?
- Is there a Plan B to redevelopment?

Mr. Johnson and Ms. Chion responded to members' questions and clarified their concerns. Chair Sandoval recognized members of the public:

- Lindsay Imai said to focus more affordable housing in communities that are opportunity rich and the goal should be to meet both current and future housing needs.
- Parisa Fatehi noted there is no scenario that ties affordable housing, transit and low-wage jobs together.
- Amy Petré Hill said the goal should be to live, work, and volunteer in the same community.
- Carl Anthony pointed out that inequities could be costing the region, which may result in poor CO_2 performance.
- Chione Flegal asked that the scenarios give the tools needed to make the best decisions possible.

Chair Sandoval thanked the public for their input. She suggested putting together a policy statement to the Commission that noted the Council's position and she opened the floor for members' comments, which included:

- The use of PDAs as the focus of analysis may be missing other PDA-like neighborhoods not currently designated as PDAs.
- Add the three Fs of social equity to the equity definition: frugal, fast and fair.
- All current and future projects should be subject to an equity analysis that includes environmental justice, jobs, and environmental performance.
- Prefer the core concentration scenario.
- Core Concentration scenario moves in the right direction but does not address historical inequities.
- Build workforce housing so people can participate in their communities.
- Broaden the concept of equality to allow for the most informed decision.
- Include the three Fs of social equity.
- Propose legislation that gives carbon credits to cities, and award cities that accelerate targets.

– more –

Plan Bay Area Alternative Scenarios (continued)

- Housing is always the greatest concern for businesses.
- We need money to build affordable housing.
- Not enough middle income housing near jobs.
- Local jurisdictions need the ability to develop regional plans at the local level.
- There are no triggers to stop housing development when no affordable housing is built.
- There is still no clear definition of equity.
- Doing a 6th scenario may sidetrack current work.
- There are still equity elements missing from the five scenarios.
- It should be the regional agency's responsibility to ensure that General Plans are consistent with regional goals. This responsibility should be incorporated into the scenarios.
- Prioritizing bus service is not being addressed.
- Restrict funding to cities.
- There are real economic reasons to place housing near jobs.
- Need to create the economic engine that will generate the wealth necessary to support the scenarios.

Chair Sandoval suggested making a motion to submit the Council's input to the Commission. Ms. Flemer noted that the equity issue has evolved in a short period and will continue evolving until it is presented to the Commission. Mr. Hedges made a motion to encourage the Commission to work on the five scenarios as long as all five are subject to an equity analysis; continue the discussion on the definition of equity and the criteria for the equity analysis; and incorporate all the elements within the sixth scenario into the five, but leave open all possibility of a continuing with a sixth scenario. Ms. Kinman seconded the motion. The motion passed with three nay votes from Mr. Castellanos, Ms. Galvez, and Ms. Baker.

DBE & Title VI Report

The Council received the report from Denise Rodrigues of MTC staff. She noted that the FTA compliance review is regarding Title VI and it has not been scheduled by the FTA. Chair Sandoval requested the item be brought to the Council when the FTA conducts the compliance review.

MTC's High School Internship Program

The Council received the report from Ann Macaulay of MTC staff. Mr. Castellanos noted that he attended the orientation session for current high school interns and added that the event was very inspiring. Chair Sandoval requested the item be brought to the Council before the next application process begins.

EEO Statistics

The Council received the report from Robin James of MTC staff. Mr. Lopez asked what actions were being taken to remedy the low number of employees in certain categories. Ms. James noted that the EEO reporting structure is very limited to how the federal government requests the data.

Staff Liaison Report

Chair Sandoval asked members to read the staff liaison report.

Council Member Reports

Ms. Kinman announced that AB 57 (Beall), the bill to add two additional seats to the Commission, had become a two-year bill and is stuck in the Senate's Transportation and Housing Committee.

Ms. Jeffrey Sailors announced that the City of Livermore approved the route alignment for BART.

New Business

There was no new business.

Adjournment/Next Meeting

The meeting was adjourned at 3:36 p.m. The next Policy Advisory Council meeting is scheduled for August 10, 2011 in Conference Room 171, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, California.