



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov  
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Metropolitan Transportation Commission/Policy Advisory Council  
Annual Work Plan Workshop  
May 25, 2011  
**Draft Minutes**

*Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*Dave Cortese*  
Santa Clara County

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacopini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Mark Green*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Scott Haggerty*  
Alameda County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sam Liccardo*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Kevin Mullin*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Jon Rubin*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Vacancy*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Commission Chair Adrienne Tissier called the meeting to order at 11:24 a.m. Commissioners Bill Dodd, Dorene Giacopini, Federal Glover, Mark Green, Scott Haggerty, Anne Halsted, Sam Liccardo, Kevin Mullin, Amy Rein Worth, Bijan Sartipi, and Jim Spering were in attendance.

Policy Advisory Council members in attendance were Chair Paul Branson, Vice Chair Dolly Sandoval, Richard Burnett, Carlos Castellanos, Wilbert Din, Sandi Galvez, Allison Hughes, Dolores Jaquez, Linda Jeffery Sailors, Randi Kinman, Marshall Loring, Yokia Mason, Tina King Neuhausel, Cheryl O'Connor, Kendal Oku, Gerald Rico, Frank Robertson and Egon Terplan. Excused: Naomi Armenta, Cathleen Baker, JoAnn Busenbark, Bena Chang, Richard Hedges, and Tanya Narath. Absent: Federico Lopez, Evelina Molina, and Lori Reese-Brown.

### **Summary of 2010-11 Council Work Plan**

Chair Branson gave a report on the Council's activities for the past year. He noted that the Council passed a motion to ask the Commission to include seniors, youth and persons with disabilities in MTC's transportation impact analyses, in addition to low income people and communities of color.

### **Policy Advisory Council 2011-12 Work Plan**

Chair Tissier opened the discussion on the Council's new work plan. Mr. Terplan asked how the Commission would like to receive the Council's input throughout the coming year. He noted that the Council is interested in helping shape the Commission's policies. Commissioner Spering noted that the purpose of this meeting was for Commissioners to hear the Council's concerns in more detail when developing their work plan. He added that the Council chair reports to the Commission on a monthly basis. Executive Director Steve Heminger suggested that members tell the Commission what they think about Plan Bay Area efforts to date.

Commissioner Giacopini questioned what the process should be after the Council's chair reports to the Commission. Commissioner Spering suggested addressing the Council's comments at Planning Committee meetings, with specific issues agendaized in order for Commissioners to respond. Chair Tissier added that if there are critical issues, the Council chair should attend the appropriate committee meeting. She stated that input needs to be given during the time when the Commission is discussing those issues. Commissioner Spering added that the purpose of this annual workshop was for the Council to have

*– more –*

**Policy Advisory Council 2011-12 Work Plan (continued)**

direct contact with Commissioners. As such, critical issues should be discussed during the annual workshop.

Commissioner Mullin said he attended the San Mateo County public workshop and noted that it was more of a stakeholder workshop. He added that the Council can assist in providing a sense of the public's input, specifically on Plan Bay Area. Commissioner Liccardo suggested summarizing the Council's input in each relevant report to Commissioners.

Ms. Kinman said that the community she represents is concerned that MTC's investment policies center on housing and jobs, and there is no discussion about school and recreational park space. She added that investment policy should take into account quality of life, not just growth. Ms. Sandoval noted that one of the challenges has been the short timeline of the process. Mr. Din said that bilingual communities need materials that are easier for them to understand. Mr. Robertson asked why MTC does not oversee Title VI compliance for agencies that receive federal funds through MTC. Mr. Heminger said that the Federal Transit Administration regulates the vast majority of transit operators in the region and directly enforces Title VI for those agencies. MTC enforcement would be a duplication of those efforts, but MTC has asked for federal guidance on this question.

Mr. Terplan pointed out that the voluntarily targets lack a geographic focus that explicitly tries to set goals around the amount of growth in priority development areas or adjacent to transit. As such, the process is becoming a standard regional transportation plan rather than looking at the big picture and it is not questioning what kinds of places the region should be growing around. He added that there is no target that specifically says what portion of growth should be near our billion-dollar transit infrastructure. He noted that the Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS) is an opportunity to add a discussion about the shape of the Bay Area in the future. Commissioner Haggerty asked if the station area plans address Mr. Terplan's concern. Mr. Heminger said the priority development areas address growth near transit. He questioned if where we put the growth will determine if we meet the targets, and added that the answer will come from the current process. Mr. Terplan added that the lack of a mode share target and a percent growth around a transit target will make it harder to evaluate the scenarios as the policy of MTC going forward.

Ms. Kinman again expressed concern that the focus is completely directed toward growth. She added that one of the goals should be to improve the pedestrian and bike infrastructure throughout the region, not just in the areas where growth is directed. Ms. Jeffery Sailors cautioned that some targets may not be achievable because of other targets. Mr. Branson suggested that the Council continue to be involved in the Transit Sustainability Project (TSP) process. Mr. Robertson noted that "low income" is often erroneously used to analyze race-specific information, and added that the two should be separated. Pam Grove of MTC staff noted that collecting demographic data during the community based outreach was a sensitive issue. Commissioner Rein Worth added that ethnicity/race information and income information are not necessarily synonymous. She noted the importance of accuracy when discussing communities of concern because the new census data is showing that our development pattern over the last ten years has created a different picture from historic assumptions. Ms. King Neuhausel said the Commission should be cautious about the organizations it partners with for public meetings.

### **Policy Advisory Council 2011-12 Work Plan (continued)**

Commissioner Spring requested the Council's input on how to engage local jurisdictions. He added that if the Plan is not received by local jurisdictions it would create a great challenge for implementing the SCS. Ms. Kinman said that part of the process of planning for the next 30 years is to correct the inadequacies of the last 30. She added that MTC is the money funnel that is incentivizing infill growth and must be aware of the potential problems that may arise in the next 30 years as a result. She clarified that it is not MTC's responsibility to build parks, but if the purpose is to incentivize high-density growth, then quality of life issues must be addressed. Ms. Kinman suggested MTC should put up the local planning money in order to get the necessary information from the local jurisdictions.

Commissioner Green suggested the Council meet at different locations in the region on a regular basis, and well as hold joint meetings with each county's advisory committee. Mr. Terplan said that MTC has a great opportunity through the TSP to set performance targets for the transit agencies and tie some of the money they receive to performance and have something similar for local jurisdictions. He added that the Commission has the opportunity to speak for the Bay Area. Ms. King Neuhausel also suggested holding joint and regional meetings. Mr. Castellanos said that continuing programs, such as the Transportation for Livable Communities program, can be used as a tool to educate local jurisdictions about the importance of planning sustainably, thus complying with the SCS. Ms. Jaquez noted that the Commissioners, as local elected officials, can best engage local jurisdictions.

Chair Tissier noted that the process is moving quickly, but it is important to keep it moving. Ms. Sandoval asked if there are additional issues the Commission would like the Council to address. Commissioner Spring asked the Council to discuss possible legislative changes that could assist MTC in implementing the SCS. Commissioner Rein Worth concluded that the goal is to have a unified plan for the Bay Area, but stressed the importance of each county's uniqueness and so the Plan must have something that addresses the needs of each county.

### **Chair and Vice Chair Nominations**

Council Chair Branson opened nominations for Council chair and vice chair. Ms. Jaquez nominated Ms. Sandoval for Council chair. Mr. Rico nominated Mr. Castellanos for Council chair; however, Mr. Castellanos declined the nomination. Mr. Terplan nominated Mr. Castellanos for vice chair. Ms. Jaquez nominated Mr. Branson for vice chair. Ms. Sandoval nominated Mr. Terplan for vice chair. Nominations will remain open until the elections, to be held at the June 8, 2011 meeting.

### **Public Comment**

Mahasin Abdul-Salaam of Genesis spoke of the work of her organization. Gerry Grace commented on his participation in MTC's meetings.

### **Adjournment/Next Meeting**

The meeting was adjourned at 12:31 p.m. The next Policy Advisory Council meeting is scheduled for June 8, 2011 in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, California.