



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov

Scott Haggerty, Chair
Alameda County

Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair
San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Chris Daly
City and County of San Francisco

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Amy Rein Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Programming and Allocations Committee
December 8, 2010
Minutes

Chair Kinsey called the meeting to order at approximately 10:03 a.m. Committee members present were: Commissioners Glover, Bates, Cortese, Daly, Dodd, and Sartipi. Commissioners Haggerty and Tissier were present as ad hoc members of the Committee. Other Commissioners present were: Chu, Giacopini, Halsted, Lempert, Mackenzie, Rubin, Spering, and Rein-Worth.

Consent Calendar

The Committee approved the following consent items:

- Minutes of November 10, 2010 meeting;
- 2011 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Amendment 2011-03. MTC Resolution No. 3975, Revised;
- Revised FY 2010-11 Interim Cycle STA Funds for Lifeline Transportation Program. MTC Resolution No. 3965, Revised;
- SAFETEA Third Cycle STP/CMAQ Program – Climate Program Visualization Outreach. MTC Resolution No. 3723, Revised; and
- Fund Estimate revision of \$0.8 million in State Transit Assistance (STA) revenue-based funding. MTC Resolution No. 3939, Revised.

Regional

- *CTSA Designation process revision. MTC Resolution No. 1076, Revised*

Bob Bates, Programming and Allocations Section, presented revisions to the process for designating Consolidated Transportation Service Agencies (CTSAs) to better streamline the administration of the Lifeline Program.

The Committee unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution No. 1076, Revised to the Commission for approval after a motion by Commissioner Daly and a second by Commissioner Cortese.

- *Proposed allocation of approximately \$28 million in RM2 and AB 1171 funds and rescission of \$3 million in RM2 Capital funds. MTC Resolution Nos. 3739, Revised, 3889, Revised, 3909, Revised, and 3914, Revised*

Shruti Hari, Programming and Allocations Section, presented RM2 Capital Allocations for approximately \$17 million for the Napa Multi-modal Transit Center Terminal/Park and Ride project (\$2.4 million) and for the I-80 Express Lanes (High Occupancy/Toll) project in Solano County (\$15 million). She also requested RM2 capital rescissions of approximately \$3 million for the Water Emergency Transportation Authority that is no

longer needed (because state funds have been secured) and an AB1171 capital allocation of \$7 million for the I-80/680/12 Interchange in Solano County.

Commissioner Steve Kinsey requested a report of original RM2 projections, passed by voters, compared to revenues received. Ms. Bockelman responded that in the past this information has been provided in the semi-annual report and staff will provide this information to Commissioner Kinsey prior to the next Committee meeting and as part of the next semi-annual report.

The Committee unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution Nos. 3739, Revised, 3889, Revised, 3909, Revised, and 3914, Revised to the Commission for approval after a motion by Commissioner Daly and a second by Commissioner Dodd.

Federal

- *Revisions to the Job Access and Reverse Commute (JARC) and New Freedom Program Management Plan. MTC Resolution No. 3986*

Kristen Mazur, Programming and Allocations Section, presented revisions to the Job Access and Reverse Commute (JARC) and New Freedom Program Management Plan to delineate the designated recipient, direct recipient, and subrecipient roles and responsibilities.

Commissioner Chris Daly asked for staff's assessment of risk associated with the administrative changes being made to the federal grant programs. Mr. Heminger commented that the risk assessment is very low and that MTC is still engaged in correspondence with the FTA about our role with respect to Title VI for federal transit programs. MTC will proceed with the changes until advised otherwise.

The Committee unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution No. 3986, Revised to the Commission for approval after a motion by Commissioner Glover and a second by Commissioner Dodd.

- *BART Car Replacement Policy Commitment. MTC Resolution Nos. 3738, Revised, and 3918.*

Glen Tepke, Programming and Allocations Section, presented the funding framework for the BART car replacement project replacing 669 cars with a projected cost of approximately \$3.2 billion in year-of-expenditure dollars. The proposed framework calls for MTC to fund approximately \$2.4 billion, or 75% of the total \$3.2 billion project costs, while BART provides approximately \$800 million, or 25%. Staff also presented the Phase 1 funding plan that will direct roughly \$870 million in regional funding in the first ten years to design, develop and procure first 200 cars.

Commissioner Dave Cortese asked that staff further expand on the types of projects that could be affected by the restrictions being placed on MTC's flexibility of FTA formula funds and transit capital funds for projects of this type. Mr. Tepke explained that FTA formula funds can be used for any transit capital purpose. The Commission's current policy is to use those funds for the replacement and rehabilitation of existing capital assets. Within the universe of replacement and rehabilitation needs, the Commission (through Transportation 2035), prioritized the replacement of revenue vehicles followed by fixed guideway projects. Therefore, the flexibility limitations may be

in the area of rehabilitation and replacement over expansion and vehicles over other types of high priority replacement needs.

Commissioner Chris Daly asked how old the existing cars are and if BART has a higher than average maintenance cost. Mr. Tepke explained that they range from 20 to 25 years with a specified life of 25 years and that as the cars age the maintenance costs do increase. The useful life is based on the point at which it becomes more cost effective to replace the vehicle than to continue to maintain it.

Commissioner Dean Chu asked if the replacement of the 200 cars replace the original allocation and what is done with the old cars once removed from the system. Mr. Tepke explained that the oldest cars were rehabilitated in the late 1990's to extend their life but now those cars are reaching the end of their extended life. The older cars will be replaced as well as the newer cars that are reaching the end of their 25-year life span. Once the cars are removed from the system they will likely be scrapped because their unique design makes them incompatible with other transit systems.

Commissioner Sue Lempert inquired about the production location of the new cars. Mr. Tepke explained that the FTA has a "Buy America" requirement for any project that is given federal funds and that the project would be held to that requirement.

Under public comment, Dorothy Dugger, General Manager of BART, commented that BART has the oldest fleet in the United States transit industry. She noted that the cars are the foundation of the reliability and safety of service offered to the public, and that over fifty percent of the public transit miles traveled in the Bay Area take place on BART. She thanked MTC for their partnership to accomplish the Phase I replacement of the first 200 of 669 cars, and for future efforts to identify new sources of funding beyond what is currently available to complete the entire fleet replacement. BART will work under the FTA "Buy America" program requiring at least 60% of the rolling stock systems to be manufactured in the United States and BART is prohibited by those same rules from specifying the location of any particular manufacturing facility.

Commissioner Steve Kinsey asked if a good bid cycle is anticipated given the climate for infrastructure and capital projects in this poor economy. Ms. Dugger explained that manufacturing is different than the construction industry and the pool of car suppliers is more limited than those delivering the heavy civil construction projects. BART is currently reviewing the bids and is expecting to select a supplier later this year. The best and final offer process will identify cost drivers and attempt to get the best possible price.

Commissioner Kinsey also commented that a condition of the project includes the deployment, implementation, and meeting of milestones for the Clipper program and asked if BART is on target with those conditions. Ms. Dugger responded that BART is making good progress with the highest market penetration of any of the transit systems accepting Clipper today, with about 25% of all trips on BART using the Clipper card.

Commissioner Tom Bates asked if there will be any design changes with the new cars. Ms. Dugger responded that a number of design changes are anticipated including possible three door cars, improved communication devices, and interior upgrades.

Commissioner Adrienne Tissier asked if the noise level of the new cars is expected to be reduced. Ms. Dugger explained that the external noise and inside car noise are based on the condition of the rail and it is important that BART maintain a good state of repair through rail grinding.

Commission Chair Scott Haggerty asked that staff consider bringing regular updates on the progress of the rail car procurement given the significant cost and regional importance.

The Committee unanimously approved the referral of MTC Resolution Nos. 3738, Revised, and 3918 to the Commission for approval after a motion by Commissioner Daly and a second by Commissioner Cortese.

Commissioner Kinsey adjourned the meeting at approximately 10:53 a.m.