



**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov  
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

*Scott Haggerty, Chair*  
Alameda County

*Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*Dean J. Chu*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Dave Cortese*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Chris Daly*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacopini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sue Lempert*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Jon Rubin*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spring*  
Solano County and Cities

*Amy Rein Worth*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Ken Yeager*  
Santa Clara County

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

**Policy Advisory Council  
July 14, 2010  
Draft Minutes**

Chair Paul Branson called the meeting to order at 1:33 p.m. Members in attendance were Naomi Armenta, Cathleen Baker, Richard Burnett, JoAnne Busenbark, Carlos Castellanos, Bena Chang, Wilbert Din, Richard Hedges, Allison Hughes, Dolores Jaquez, Linda Jeffery Sailors, Randi Kinman, Federico Lopez, Marshall Loring, Cheryl O'Connor, Kendal Oku, Lori Reese-Brown, Frank Robertson, Dolly Sandoval, and Egon Terplan. Excused: Evelina Molina, Gerald Rico, and Carmen Rojas.

Chair Branson requested suggestions for future agenda formats.

**Minutes**

The minutes of the June 9, 2010 meeting were unanimously approved after a motion by Mr. Hedges and a second by Mr. Loring.

**Policy Advisory Council Work Plan**

The Policy Advisory Council's Work Plan was presented by Chair Branson. Mr. Terplan suggested that issues of pricing and social equity not be treated separately, but included in discussions about the two broader topics of the Sustainable Communities Strategy and the Transit Sustainability Project. Mr. Hedges cautioned against the counterproductive ways of instituting various policies. Mr. Loring noted the importance of addressing pedestrian issues and interests, including the creation of a regional pedestrian plan. Ms. Baker noted that updates on pricing policies should include the costs of pedestrian deaths, etc. Ms. Jaquez asked what resources were available to the Council. Chair Branson responded that as resources are required the committee would get the help it needs. Ms. Kinman cautioned against completely focusing on transit. She also noted the need for better definitions, especially the definition of equity. Ms. Hughes said that equity and pricing should remain as separate points. Vice Chair Sandoval also felt pricing needs to be kept separate. She also noted the importance of pursuing a regional bike/pedestrian network. Mr. Hedges said the Council should be able to provide input on the Commission's agenda. Chair Branson noted that could be done through the Council's monthly report to the Commission. Ms. Busenbark suggested the Plan be formatted as bullet statements, rather than narrative.

– more –

**Policy Advisory Council Work Plan (continued)**

Chair Branson suggested that members submit suggestions/changes to the Work Plan – as well as suggestions for subcommittees/work groups – to Pam Grove of MTC staff via e-mail. He also suggested that the committee delay adoption of the Plan until September. Ms. Grove said comments on the Work Plan/subcommittees must be submitted to her by August 10. Mr. Terplan cautioned against having a subcommittee for each of the five Work Plan items.

**Planning Overview**

The presentation by Doug Kimsey, MTC's Planning Director, was received by the Council. Mr. Hedges noted that the MTC's previous Elderly and Disabled Advisory Committee made recommendations on the Transportation for Livable Communities (TLC) program, some of which were accepted by the Commission. Mr. Lopez asked how maintenance funding levels are sustained, and why so much funding is devoted to maintenance. He asked how much funding other regions spend on expansion. He also asked why free carpools were eliminated, and how the needs of the disabled and seniors are addressed through planning. Mr. Kimsey noted that maintenance costs have been going up due to aging infrastructure and better quantifying of our maintenance needs. He added that transportation plans need to be financially constrained and that other regions spend more on expansion due to faster growth. Mr. Kimsey noted that senior and disabled needs are addressed through the TLC program and the Lifeline program, among others. Ms. Jaquez asked if anything can be done to better address the needs of seniors. Mr. Kimsey noted that their needs would also be addressed through the new Transit Sustainability Program (TSP).

Ms. Kinman said it would be helpful for the Council to know where all Community Based Transportation Plans (CBTPs) in the region are in the planning process. She also requested that all CBTPs report the same data, in the same language, in a closer time table. Mr. Kimsey noted that 26 CBTPs have been completed and MTC is committed to funding all 44. Ms. Kinman noted that in San Jose developers can buy their way out of providing affordable housing in Transit Oriented Developments (TODs), and she asked if MTC would address this in the future. Mr. Kimsey noted that there is an affordability element in MTC's TOD policy that is not very strong. He added that the policy is due for review and the affordability issue can be addressed then. Ms. Kinman noted that over half of the low-income population lives outside of MTC's communities of concern.

Ms. Reese-Brown asked if it is possible to decrease the percentage of funding spent on maintenance. She noted that more money should be spent on getting people out of their cars. Mr. Kimsey noted that the Commission has a fix-it-first policy, and noted there are benefits to maintenance and operations. Ms. Reese-Brown asked if local jurisdictions would be required to meet their own GHG emission targets. She also asked if MTC has the authority to influence their land use policies. Mr. Kimsey noted that the GHG target is a region wide target. He also noted that the TOD policy uses funding as a carrot/stick to influence land use. Ms. Baker noted that more sticks should be added to the policy to ensure affordability in perpetuity. Executive Director Steve Heminger noted that MTC also has created a partnership to establish an Affordable Housing Fund to help developers. He added that MTC has no land use authority;

therefore, decisions must be made strategically. Ms. Baker asked if any voting members of the Joint Policy Committee would attend the July 21 workshop. Mr. Kimsey noted that he will attend. Ms. Chang asked if the target housing numbers around transit stations in Resolution No. 3434 was for all housing. Mr. Kimsey said yes. She noted that increasing the supply of housing also makes it more affordable.

Ms. Sandoval asked about the make up of current applicants of the TLC program. Mr. Kimsey noted that the larger size of the grant narrowed the pool of applicants, which were made up mostly of larger jurisdictions. Ms. Sandoval asked if there is a plan for making smaller jurisdictions more competitive. Mr. Kimsey noted that the technical assistance program of TLC would help achieve this goal. Mr. Heminger added that each county also has their own TLC program. He also noted that growth is being focused on a more city-centered approach.

Mr. Hedges suggested focusing on novel ways of increasing funding. Mr. Terplan commended MTC for focusing funding on maintenance rather than expansion. He noted that it would be useful for the group to know how maintenance and operations are defined. He also asked how many people were in the Planning section and how they work with ABAG. Mr. Kimsey said 19 people make up the planning section. He noted that staff would be working with ABAG staff more and more now than in the past due to SB 375 and the Sustainable Communities Strategy. Mr. Terplan asked why the TOD policy lacked a job density target and is it something that could be addressed in the future. Mr. Heminger noted that the initial goal was to keep the policy simple; he added that in general, the Bay Area has had a housing shortage rather than a jobs shortage. Mr. Robertson asked if there are systems and strategies in place to ensure environmental justice and social equity. Mr. Kimsey noted that there are requirements in this area for the regional planning process, and MTC looks at accessibility to certain job functions and activities, where the money is allocated, and then MTC does a comparison of low-income to non-low-income populations and minority to non-minority populations. The comparison is done in order to ensure that all populations share equally in the benefits and burdens of MTC's investments in the transportation system.

### **SB 375 Greenhouse Gas Reduction Targets**

The Council received the report by Mr. Kimsey. Ms. Jeffery Sailors noted that if growth is going to concentrate in the larger cities, ways to service those cities should be discussed, i.e. bringing in goods. She noted that little money is being spent on easing the congestion caused by trucks bringing goods into the cities. Mr. Terplan suggested that the Council submit a statement to the Commission in support of higher targets. Ms. Baker expressed her support for such a statement. She added that a higher target was important to ensure a higher quality of life. Ms. Reese-Brown questioned how realistic a higher target would be. Mr. Lopez noted his concern that a higher target would have a negative impact on the economy. Mr. Din stated his opposition to submitting a statement because impacts on seniors, the disabled and low-income people are unknown. Chair Branson suggested taking up the item at the September meeting. Vice Chair Sandoval requested that members receive the data that weighs the impacts of setting higher targets. Mr. Loring suggested staff be available to answer further questions from members.

**SB 375 Greenhouse Gas Reduction Targets (continued)**

Mr. Kimsey noted that the Commission is scheduled to adopt the principles for setting the target on July 28.

Mr. Terplan made a motion to submit a statement to the Commission to encourage them to consider setting a more aggressive greenhouse gas reduction target than the seven percent (by 2020) and ten percent (by 2035) recommended by staff. Ms. Baker seconded the motion. The motion passed with 11 ayes, and six nays. Ms. Sandoval requested that staff's recommendation to the Commission be sent to members. Mr. Kimsey said it would be sent out a week prior to the Commission meeting.

**Public Participation Plan**

Catalina Alvarado of MTC staff announced that the 45-day public review and comment period for MTC's Public Participation Plan update opened on July 9, and she gave a brief presentation on the update process. Comments must be submitted by 4 p.m., Monday, August 23, 2010. She invited members of the Council to submit comments to her by phone or send them in writing prior to the close of the comment period.

Mr. Castellanos cautioned against one-time outreach to residents. He suggested the Commission work with community-based organizations (CBOs), and really show the impact of the issues on people's lives. Ms. Kinman suggested translation services for the Vietnamese community of Santa Clara County as a matter of course for MTC's outreach. Mr. Loring suggested the creation of a "speaker's bureau" in order to go out into the community instead of expecting the community to come to MTC. Mr. Din said to use the Policy Advisory Council as a resource for outreach, noting that CBOs often need to be convinced that the outreach process is in their best interest. He also suggested asking BART for their contact database. Mr. Hedges also suggested having Vietnamese translation services. Ms. Kinman suggested creating an "Ambassador's Toolkit" for Council members. Ms. Baker suggested tapping into the contact database from previous Community Based Transportation Plans.

**Staff Liaison Report**

The report by Ms. Grove was received by the Council.

**Public Comment**

There was no public comment.

The next meeting is scheduled for September 8, 2010. The meeting was adjourned at 3:47 p.m.