



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov

Scott Haggerty, Chair
Alameda County

Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair
San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Chris Daly
City and County of San Francisco

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Sperring
Solano County and Cities

Amy Rein Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Programming and Allocations Committee
May 12, 2010
Minutes

Chair Kinsey called the meeting to order at approximately 10:42 a.m. Committee members present were: Commissioners Bates, Cortese, Daly, Dodd, Glover, and Sartipi. Other Commissioners present were: Chu, Giacopini, Haggerty, Halsted, Lempert, Mackenzie, Rubin, Sperring, Tissier, Worth, and Yeager.

Consent Calendar

The Committee approved the following consent items:

- Minutes of April 14, 2010 meeting;
- 2009 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Amendments 2009-47 and 2009-48. MTC Resolution No. 3875, Revised;
- Revisions to the New Freedom Cycle 1, 2, and 3 Programs. MTC Resolution Nos. 3847, Revised, 3871, Revised, and 3930, Revised;
- Revisions to the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act: FTA Section 5311 (Nonurbanized) Program. MTC Resolution No. 3888, Revised;
- Proposed allocation of approximately \$2.9 million in RM2 Capital funds. MTC Resolution No. 3739, Revised.

Federal

- *Agreement to exchange San Francisco Parking Revenues with Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) program funds. MTC Resolution No. 3963.*

Ross McKeown, Programming and Allocations Section, presented an agreement to exchange \$22 million in CMAQ funds for future parking revenues, to facilitate implementation of the San Francisco parking pricing program and to augment the MTC exchange fund.

The Committee approved the referral of MTC Resolution No. 3963 to the Commission for approval.

- *Federal Transit Administration Sections 5307 and 5309 Program and Policy and AB664 Bridge Toll Program and Allocations to reflect final federal appropriations. MTC Resolution Nos. 3908, Revised, 3916, Revised, 3917, Revised, and 3945.*

Glen Tepke, Programming and Allocations Section, presented updates to the Transit Capital Priorities policy which included: adding criteria for programming the Vehicle Procurement Reserve, revised policies for funding bus emission reduction devices required to meet California Air Resources Board regulations, and revised formulas for

distributing Flexible Set-Aside funds to eligible operations in the Petaluma Urbanized Area. Glen also described program changes to the FTA formula program such as the inclusion of the Vehicle Procurement Reserve for BART and Caltrain. Glen highlighted the delay in the FTA apportionments which has hampered the ability to finalize the program. He also noted a program revision handout at the request of SFMTA since the Committee mailing.

Commissioner Steve Kinsey asked if the Committee should defer referring the item for approval of Resolution Nos. 3917, Revised, and 3945 until staff is able to provide a program of projects. Alix Bockelman, Programming and Allocations Section, recommended that the Committee move approval of the resolutions understanding that the program of projects will be updated for the meeting of the full Commission on May 26, 2010.

The Committee approved the referral of MTC Resolution Nos. 3908, Revised, 3916, Revised, 3917, Revised, and 3945 to the Commission for approval.

Regional

- *Regional Measure 2 (RM2) Capital Program Update.*

Shruti Hari, Programming and Allocations Section, presented the status of capital projects in the Regional Measure 2 Capital Program for the first half of FY 2009-10.

Commissioner Sue Lempert asked if the Oakland Airport Connector (OAC) is still a viable project. Steve Heminger responded that it is still viable in the sense that the bid has been extended and BART can award the bid if they can secure the funding. Commissioner Kinsey asked how the FTA concerns with regards to the OAC are being addressed. Mr. Heminger explained the three components of federal assistance included: 1) ARRA funding of \$70 million which has been redirected; 2) \$25 million in New Starts funding; and 3) a cash flow loan from the TIFIA program. BART has reapplied for the TIFIA program and should know in the next few weeks whether or not their application has been accepted. With regards to New Starts funding, BART has a newly approved Title VI plan and should be able to access New Starts funding once all Title VI obligations are completed.

Commissioner Lempert asked if the \$400 million that the Dumbarton Rail project is underfunded by includes the funds that were reallocated to the BART to Warm Springs project. Alix Bockelman explained she will need to check and get back to her but believes that dollar amount assumes the repayment of those funds. Ms. Lempert commented that it is important to use RM2 money to improve east-west connections across the Bay.

Commissioner Scott Haggerty asked how long a project can retain RM2 funds without any work being done on the project. Mr. Heminger explained that the money is available until it is expended. Mr. Haggerty commented that at some point the committee will need to have an in depth discussion regarding the money set-aside for projects with no activity vs. the increase of project costs as time lapses.

Commissioner Adrienne Tissier asked if staff has reevaluated costs estimates in light of projects coming in under budget in this market. Mr. Heminger responded that if we could build Dumbarton

Rail project soon this would apply, but it is likely that the market would have recovered by the time the project would be ready to go to construction.

Commissioner Dave Cortese commented that several of the commissioners agree that the national average for project completion is not a good standard and asked if there has been any discussion to determine what a good standard would be and that it would be a good idea to adopt a benchmark of what the expectation should be in terms of project delivery. Mr. Heminger explained that it is difficult to manage the pace of project work.

- *FY 2010-11 Regional Measure 2 (RM2) Operating Program. MTC Resolution No. 3955.*

Theresa Romell, Programming and Allocations Section, presented the FY 2010-11 RM2 Operating Program and recommended that \$39 million be set aside for ten operating and planning projects. In addition, in following the RM2 performance policy, staff recommended to discontinue funding for CCCTA's Route 98X.

Commissioner Federal Glover commented that Route 98X provides critical transportation to education institutions, the county healthcare center, and the Sun Valley shopping mall and suggested that more time be given to CCCTA to find alternative solutions to riders of this line or to preserve the line.

Rick Ramacier, General Manager of CCCTA, requested that a decision to discontinue funding for Route 98X be deferred for at least a year to allow time for CCCTA to perform an analysis of the line and to find alternative solutions for riders of the line.

Commissioner Amy Rein-Worth suggested that the decision to discontinue funding to Route 98X be deferred for at least one year or until the completion of the Transit Sustainability Project given the route is a key lifeline service to the county. This would allow an opportunity to increase ridership with the opening of the Diablo Valley Transit Center in the next several months.

Commissioner Kinsey asked if the Transit Sustainability Project will provide information to help sustain the decision to continue funding to Route 98X within a one year time period. Steve Heminger responded that the project will not likely provide any more data than is already available with the standards set forth with the RM2 guidelines. However, the Project may provide better context.

Commissioner Haggerty asked if there is anything that CCCTA can do to reduce the costs of running this route, i.e. running smaller busses. Mr. Ramacier responded that CCCTA would like the additional time to explore this and other options.

The Committee approved the referral of MTC Resolution No. 3955 with a change to give CCCTA a time extension for one year with a report in December 2010 on corrective action plan progress.

Commissioner Kinsey adjourned the meeting at approximately 11:42 a.m.