



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Agenda Item No. 2a

OPERATIONS COMMITTEE
FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 12, 2010
MINUTES

Scott Haggerty, Chair
Alameda County

Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair
San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Chris Daly
City and County of San Francisco

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Amy Rein Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

ATTENDANCE

Chair Rein Worth convened the meeting at 11:00 a.m. In addition to Chair Rein Worth, the following Committee members were in attendance: Vice-Chair Chu, Commissioners Azumbrado, Giacopini, Haggerty, Halsted, Lempert, Mackenzie, Rubin, Spering, Tissier and Yeager. Also in attendance were Commissioners Bates, Cortese and Daly.

CONSENT CALENDAR

Committee members unanimously approved the following items on the consent calendar:

- Minutes of December 11, 2009 Committee Meeting;
- Second Quarter SAFE Financial Statements.

TransLink[®] Program Contract Actions

Mr. Brian Gebhardt, MTC staff person, reported that there are four items before the Committee for approval. He noted that Golden Gate Bridge Highway and Transportation District (GGBHTD) is seeking to replace its paper ticketing with Smart Cards to automate passenger counting at all ferry terminals using TransLink[®]. This would be done via a TransLink[®] contract change order that would be administered by MTC; however, it would be paid for in full by GGBHTD. This is similar to the agreement that MTC has with SFMTA for their fare gate and TVM project. The cost for the change order and any staff costs would all be funded by GGBHTD. The second item is the contract change order, which includes the TransLink[®] equipment, limited use Smart Cards, and associated software, as well as the design, manufacture, installation, testing, training, and support for that hardware and software. The third item is a contract amendment with Booz Allen Hamilton. In December 2008, MTC entered into a multi-year contract with Booz Allen Hamilton, which ends at the end of this month. While Booz Allen Hamilton has begun focusing more on operational aspects of the program, over the course of the next sixteen months, that shift will increase with additional operational support. The final item is a contract amendment with Swirl, who provides marketing, web, and communication services to MTC including the TransLink[®] program. This amendment would provide for services to support the rebranding of the TransLink[®] program to Clipper[™], as well as previously planned marketing initiatives, which will begin in June 2010.

Commissioner Spering noted that he has received several letters from the public regarding this item, and asked that due to tough economical times, is there any way that staff could cut costs on the TransLink[®] program.

Mr. Steve Heminger, MTC's Executive Director, responded that two items have been confused. He noted that there are two separate items: 1) the costs of Clipper™, which is related to going out to the transit agencies and putting a sticker on TransLink® and changing it to Clipper™; which is approximately \$475,000; and 2) there are a much larger costs of \$900,000, that is related to rolling out the program throughout the region. He noted that some of the correspondence that he has seen from the public objects to \$1.3M for Clipper™. However, it is only \$475,000. The largest expense is rolling out the card and program itself.

Commissioner Rubin said that by changing the name of the card, spending the money to promote the name, and getting it out, in the end, we are saving money, and a greater number of people will be aware of and more likely to use the card.

Commissioner Yeager reported that he had voted "no" against the contract amendment for Clipper™ in December 2009. Therefore, he will be voting "no" on this item as well.

Commissioner Sperring moved to approve the above requested items; Commissioner Yeager seconded the motion, voting "no" on Agenda Item No. 3iv, Contract Amendment with Swirl for marketing the Clipper™ program. The motion carried.

Ms. Rein Worth emphasized that now that staff is moving into the consumer aspect of the program, most of the comments that she read in the newspaper focus mostly on the fact that they wanted to be able to put their employer credits on the card.

Transit Coordination Implementation Plan – MTC Resolution No. 3866

Mr. Pierce Gould, MTC staff person, presented a slide presentation to Committee members. He noted that the TransLink® Management Plan is scheduled to be presented to this Committee next month. Its purpose is to define the roles and responsibilities of MTC and the transit agencies, assuming that MTC withdraws from the consortium in July. Resolution No. 3866, the Transit Coordination Implementation Plan, lays out coordination requirements for transit operators with respect to regional initiatives. Outreach to develop Resolution No. 3866 began by consulting with technical advisory committees of transit agency staff. Once Resolution No. 3866 was drafted, a Partnership Transit Coordination Committee (PTCC) meeting was convened in November, and staff presented at several other transit agency and advisory committees meetings. A second PTCC meeting was convened in early February. In response to feedback, staff made some changes to the resolution. He noted that transit operators found the consultation process to be too short and somewhat confusing. To address this, staff convened an additional PTCC meeting, in February and rewrote the consultation process. Transit agencies also commented on cost sharing, requesting O&M funds to cover their costs to coordinate these services, and asking for project costs assumptions. He noted that staff plans to share project budgets with the Transit Finance Working Group beginning FY 10/11. With respect to O&M, staff believes that the requirements are reasonable. Staff received several comments beyond the scope of the update, and is recommending them for consideration as part of the Transit Sustainability Project scope of work.

Other comments were that Resolution No. 3866 infringed on an operator's right to set its own fare policies. Mr. Gould explained that the resolution does not dictate fare policy, but that an operator risks non-compliance if it adopts fare policies that do not support TransLink[®]. There were many requests from transit operators to delay fare media product transition dates to TransLink[®]-only availability. Staff worked with the operators to change dates; however, staff kept in mind the goal of 20 million monthly transactions by April 2011. Mr. Gould reported that four additional requirements were added to Resolution No. 3866 for TransLink[®] (equipment ownership/replacement, training and customer service expectations for staff, and brand transition to Clipper[™]) and the Hub Signage program (applicability of sign standards to new/remodeled facilities). Since the February PTCC meeting, one transit agency informed staff of concerns about the potential impact of elimination of paper tickets on protected classes under Title VI and other Federal and State non-discrimination statutes. Staff is still gathering information; however, the language in Resolution No. 3866 is flexible to address this issue and doesn't warrant any change.

Mr. David Weir, MTC staff person, went through the remaining TransLink[®]-specific slides with Committee members. He noted that the slides had been seen before in an earlier presentation on TransLink[®] fare media transition plan. He highlighted a few changes made to the graphs.

Commissioner Spering moved to refer MTC Resolution No. 3866 to the Commission for approval. Commissioner Chu seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

PUBLIC COMMENT/OTHER BUSINESS/ADJOURNMENT

Chair Rein Worth adjourned the meeting in memory of Paul Crotty, Melanie Crotty's father.

There being no further business, Chairperson Rein Worth adjourned the meeting at 11:30 a.m.