



SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR
Alameda County

ADRIENNE J. TISSIER, VICE CHAIR
San Mateo County

TOM AZUMBRADO
*U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development*

TOM BATES
Cities of Alameda County

DEAN J. CHU
Cities of Santa Clara County

DAVE CORTESE
Association of Bay Area Governments

CHRIS DALY
City and County of San Francisco

BILL DODD
Napa County and Cities

DORENE M. GIACOPINI
U.S. Department of Transportation

FEDERAL D. GLOVER
Contra Costa County

ANNE W. HALSTED
*San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission*

STEVE KINSEY
Marin County and Cities

SUE LEMPERT
Cities of San Mateo County

JAKE MACKENZIE
Sonoma County and Cities

JON RUBIN
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

BIJAN SARTIPI
*State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency*

JAMES P. SPERING
Solano County and Cities

AMY REIN WORTH
Cities of Contra Costa County

KEN YEAGER
Santa Clara County

STEVE HEMINGER
Executive Director

ANDREW B. FREMIER
Deputy Executive Director

Bay Area Toll Authority (BATA) MINUTES
January 27, 2010
Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium
101 8th Street, 1st Floor
Oakland, California

Attendance

Chair Haggerty convened the meeting at 9:35 a.m. In addition to Commissioner Haggerty, the following Authority members were in attendance: Dean Chu, Dave Cortese, Chris Daly, Bill Dodd, Federal Glover, Anne Halsted, Steve Kinsey, Sue Lempert, Jake Mackenzie, Jon Rubin, Bijan Sartipi, Jim Spering, Amy Rein Worth, and Ken Yeager and Vice Chair Tissier.

Consent Calendar

The Authority unanimously approved the following items on the Consent Calendar:

- Minutes of the December 16, 2009 Authority meeting.

Resolution No. 90, Toll Increase for the State-owned Toll Bridges in the Bay Area.

Chair Dodd, moved approval of BATA Resolution No. 90, to revise the toll schedule for state-owned bridges in the Bay Area. An increase in the toll rates is needed to complete the seismic retrofit of the bridges, including the retrofits of the Antioch and Dumbarton bridges, to cope with higher debt costs and declining traffic volumes, and to meet the toll bridge revenue bond obligations authorized and issued by BATA to which bridge toll reserves have been pledged. Over the past four months, the Committee has had a number of discussions in regards to the most effective structure for an increase in the tolls to raise the needed revenues. Also, four public hearings were held in Oakland, the City of San Mateo, Concord, and in San Francisco, to allow the public to comment on the toll increase proposals. Public comment was also solicited by e-mail, letters and by a survey on the BATA website. The Oversight Committee was provided with copies of all of the e-mails and letters that were received from the public.

Mr. Rod McMillan, BATA staff, provided an overview of the BATA Oversight Committee recommendation for modification to the Toll Schedule, as follows:

Vehicle Class	Bridges	Toll Formula	Proposed Toll
2-axle Vehicles	Antioch, Benicia, Carquinez, Dumbarton, Richmond and San Mateo Bridges	NA	\$5.00 (base toll)
	San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge	NA	Peak - \$6.00 Non-Peak - \$4.00 Weekends - \$5.00
Carpools	All Bridges	50 percent of 2-axle base toll (\$5.00) rate	\$2.50
Trucks (multi-axle vehicles)	All Bridges	2-axle base toll (\$5.00) rate times number of axles.	3-axle - \$15.00 4-axle - \$20.00 5-axle - \$25.00 6-axle - \$30.00 7+-axle - \$35.00

The BATA Oversight Committee further recommends:

1. That the toll rate increases for 2-axle vehicles, including congestion pricing on the Bay Bridge, and carpools be effective on July 1, 2010.
2. That tolls for multi-axles vehicles would be deferred for one year (July 1, 2010 through June 30, 2011) and at 50 percent of the total increase in the second year (July 1, 2011 through June 30, 2012). The full toll increase for multi-axle vehicles would be effective on July 1, 2012.
3. That an evaluation of the toll increase, including congestion pricing for the Bay Bridge, be conducted and provided to the BATA Oversight Committee on an annual basis after congestion pricing is implemented.

In response to correspondence received from the public since the BATA Oversight Committee meeting, Mr. McMillan also stated:

- BATA legal staff does not believe that BATA has the authority to raise tolls for a project to provide bicycle access on the West Span of the Bay Bridge. At the BATA Oversight Committee, Commissioner Bates stated that he would ask the Legislative Counsel for an opinion regarding BATA's authority.

- There has been concern that recreational vehicles are being charged the same toll as multi-axle trucks. There are two issues that seemingly prohibit BATA from charging different toll rates based on vehicle type, rather than on the number of vehicle axles. First, the law states that the tolls on the bridges shall be based on the number of axles on a vehicle. Second, BATA's current toll collection system can only differentiate between vehicles based on axles.
- In regards to toll charges for low emission vehicles, the law states that if BATA grants reduced rate passage to any vehicle, that it shall also grant the same reduced rate passage to inherently low emission vehicles, such as electric vehicles. Therefore, it is proposed that low emission vehicles can continue to use the carpool lanes and pay the same reduced rates as carpools.

Public comment was provided, as follows:

Dick Anderson, East Bay Bicycle Coalition and Delta Pedalers
Carli Paine, Transform
Andrew Casteel, Bay Area Bicycle Coalition
Thomas Ayres
Dave Campbell, BFBC
Robert Rayburn with East Bay Bicycle Coalition
Marc Caswell, San Francisco Bicycle Coalition
Peter Price, California Natural Gas Vehicle Coalition
Bob Lundin, FMCA
John Carnahan, representing Professor Astaneh, UC Berkeley
Rachel Chang
Kevin Smith
Jamie Hall, CalStart
Howard Jennings, Jr., Chishulm 72
Victor Douglas
Doug Cameron, Clean Energy
David Schonbrunn, TRANSDEF
Peter Aguirre, East Bay Bicycle Coalition .

In summary, the major issues raised in the testimony from the public included:

1. The tolls should be increased further than proposed to provide funding for bicycle access on the West Span of the San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge.
2. Tolls should not be increased or the decision should be delayed for tolling of inherently low emission vehicles, such as natural gas and electric vehicles.
3. Implementing a toll for carpools will be a significant detriment to casual carpooling.

4. Multi-axle recreational vehicles should not be required to pay the same toll as multi-axle trucks, since recreational vehicles are a lighter weight than trucks and do not cause as much damage to the roadway.
5. The concept of congestion pricing on the Bay Bridge is a positive step to reduce peak congestion.

Following additional Committee discussion, Commissioner Daly moved and Commissioner Bates seconded a substitute motion to amend the toll schedule, as referred by the BATA Oversight Committee, with the exception that tolls for carpools would be \$2.00, rather than \$2.50. The motion failed: 3 Yes and 13 No. Commissioner Dodd moved and Commissioner Tissier seconded a motion to revise the toll schedule as referred by the BATA Oversight Committee, including directing staff to provide annual assessments of the impacts of all aspects of the toll increase. The motion passed unanimously.

BATA Resolution No. 86, Revised – Toll Bridge Program Capital and Operating Budget Revisions

Chair Dodd requested the Authority to approved BATA Resolution No. 86, Revised, to 1) allocate toll bridge seismic retrofit funds for the construction of the transition structures from the Self Anchored Suspension Span to the Yerba Buena Island Tunnel for the San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge East Span project, 2) add the Dumbarton Bridge and Antioch Bridge Seismic Retrofit Projects to the Seismic Retrofit Program, and budget \$750 million for the projects, and 3) amend the BATA operating budget to include an additional \$1,683,000 for 2% transfers to MTC for projects to relieve congestion on the toll bridges. The Authority unanimously approved the motion as requested.

Public Comment/Other Business/Next Meeting/Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Haggerty adjourned the meeting at 10:30 a.m.