



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov  
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

**PLANNING COMMITTEE  
MEETING OF NOVEMBER 13, 2009  
MINUTES**

*Scott Haggerty, Chair*  
Alameda County

*Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*Dean J. Chu*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Dave Cortese*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Chris Daly*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacomini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sue Lempert*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Jon Rubin*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Amy Rein Worth*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Ken Yeager*  
Santa Clara County

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flermer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

**ATTENDANCE**

Commissioner Spering called the Planning Committee meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Other members in attendance were Commissioners Giacomini, Haggerty, Lempert, Mackenzie, Rein-Worth, Rubin, and Yeager. Commissioners Bates, Cortese, and Daly also attended.

**CONSENT CALENDAR: Minutes of September 11, 2009**

Commissioner Mackenzie moved approval, Commissioner Rein-Worth seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

**Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis Follow-Up**

Ms. Jennifer Yeaman provided an update on two follow-up actions identified in the Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis Report a sought Committee comments on: (a) snapshot analysis methodology and (b) results of a regional housing and transportation affordability study.

Ms. Randi Kinman, MCAC, reported on MCAC's role and their thoughts on the process.

**Committee Comments:**

- Commissioner Cortese asked how MTC influences CMA decisions once the analysis has been done and the criteria have been established? Response: The goal is to have the information readily available for any person or agency that can use it to make planning or investment decisions.
- Commissioner Yeager asked if it would be helpful to look at the bus lines that local transportation agencies are cutting? Is MTC finding that the lines that are being cut are in the areas of concern? Response: Staff is able to show year over year the change in the level of transit service in a given area, which staff gets from the 511 database. Ms. Kinman stated that one of the things they have been looking at is the difference between regional averages for transit supply and local averages. Mr. Steve Heminger stated that both MTC and transit operators are required, under Title VI of the Federal Civil Rights Act, to perform specific analyses related to where communities of concern are and how they are affected by transportation decisions. When transit agencies make decisions about specific routes they have their own Title VI obligations, and are required to evaluate whether the cuts result in any kind of disproportionate impact. Staff depends on the transit operators to carry out that part of their Title VI responsibility.

- Commissioner Spring asked where other choices, such as taxis, get factored into this formula? He noted that it would be nice to have a regional approach to some of these solutions. Response: Ms. Yeamans stated that looking at such alternatives may be part of the work that will be undertaken in the Transit Sustainability Project. Commissioner Mackenzie stated that he would like to see a map that displays sub-regional housing and transportation affordability at a larger scale.
- Commissioner Rein-Worth noted that it would be helpful to have some clear data on origins and destinations, where people are living, where they are working, and their work hours. She also asked how people travel by different modes.
- Commissioner Lempert encouraged a larger percentage of affordable housing units in TODs as part of Station Area Planning processes. She also noted that some communities, such as East Palo Alto, only have access to buses and are not in proximity to rail.
- Commissioner Spring asked if staff has conducted surveys of low-income households? Are they willing to live in high-density developments? What kind of input are we getting from them? Response: Ms. Yeamans stated that staff has various data sources where income can be broken down to answer those questions, but more research could be done specific to attitudes and preferences as part of our upcoming 2010 Bay Area Travel Survey.
- Commissioner Daly commented on the RTP performance objective to reduce the share of income spent on housing and transportation costs by 10 percent. He asked if staff is planning on addressing that through housing pricing as well as transportation pricing. Response: Mr. Heminger stated that MTC can no longer address these questions separately. MTC and ABAG will work on those subjects together as part of the SB 375 Sustainable Communities Strategy.
- Commissioner Mackenzie stated that people of lower income in Rohnert Park have no choice but to use an auto to get where they have to go.

**Public comment:**

Mr. Bob Allen, Urban Habitat, stated that he has always envisioned the Snapshot Analysis to be something you can access on the web. One should be able to click on a neighborhood and all the tabular data would appear showing all the statistics behind what's embedded on the map. As far as measuring affordability, he encouraged staff to look at the website [www.bayareaburden.org](http://www.bayareaburden.org).

**OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT**

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 10:25 a.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Friday, December 11, 2009 at 9:30 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.