

**Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Programming and Allocations Committee**

November 4, 2009

Item Number 2b

**Resolution No. 3927**

---

**Subject:** FY 2009-10 MTC Productivity Improvement Program (PIP)

**Background:** In accordance with the Transportation Development Act, MTC annually adopts a PIP, a set of projects to be undertaken by transit operators in the region during the fiscal year to improve productivity and lower operating costs. Projects are derived from recommendations made in the operator's most recently completed Triennial Performance Audit. An independent auditing firm conducts the audits, and PIP projects are developed cooperatively by staff from MTC and each affected operator. A finding that an operator has made a reasonable effort in implementing its PIP project(s) is required for MTC to allocate Transportation Development Act (TDA) or State Transit Assistance (STA) funds to the operator. The finding relative to FY 2009-10 PIP projects will pertain to the allocation of FY 2010-11 funds.

Though all public transit operators to which MTC apportions TDA or STA funds are subject to inclusion in the PIP, not all operators are included in the PIP each fiscal year. In some cases, an operator may have already completed all of the projects recommended in its most recently completed Triennial Performance Audit. In other cases, an operator may choose to implement a performance audit recommendation in the second or third year following the audit. Because all audit recommendations must be addressed prior to the next audit, MTC encourages operators to undertake the projects as soon as is practical.

Attachment 1 to this summary sheet lists audit recommendations made to each operator in its most recent audit report. The operators are grouped by audit report year. Operators have three years following the audit report to address recommendations made. If the area in the column titled "Status of Recommendation" is blank, staff is working with the operator on the recommendation and that specific project is not included in the recommended FY 2009-10 PIP.

Attachment A to the Resolution No. 3927 lists each FY 2009-10 PIP project, including project description, goals and milestones. In several cases, operators have commenced a project prior to adoption of the PIP, and certain milestones for such projects will be shown in the project listing as "completed".

Recommendations for fiscal year 2009-10 include projects for the following operators: AC Transit, BART, CCCTA, City of Fairfield, City of Healdsburg, City of Petaluma, SFMTA, City of Santa Rosa, SamTrans, ECCTA, City of Union City, City of Vallejo, Santa Clara VTA, and WestCAT.

**Issues:** None

**Recommend:** Refer MTC Resolution No. 3927 to the Commission for approval

**Attachments:** Attachment 1 – List of Operators and Audit Recommendations  
MTC Resolution No. 3927

**Productivity Improvement Program (PIP)  
List of Operators and Triennial Audit Recommendations**

Programming Allocations Committee  
Agenda Item 2b, November 4, 2009  
Attachment 1  
Page 1 of 3

**2007 - Most Recent Audit Report  
2010 - Last Year Recommendations are Expected to be Addressed**

AGENCY	RECOMMENDATION	STATUS
<b>Benicia</b>	1 Continue to review the incidence of preventable accidents for both fixed-route and paratransit services.	In Progress *
	2 Restructure the goals, objectives and performance measures to improve the relationships among the elements and include goals and objectives related to safety.	
	3 Evaluate and revise standards as warranted to improve adequacy and reflect actual trends in performance.	
	4 Evaluate data gathering and reporting to ensure accurate monthly performance summaries.	
<b>Fairfield-Suisun</b>	1 Develop a comprehensive new set of goals, objectives and standards in conjunction with the next SRTP update.	Completed
	2 Continue to develop procedures for routine performance monitoring and assessing performance against standards.	Completed
	3 Continue to monitor ADA paratransit denials to ensure compliance with the ADA standards.	Completed
	4 Additional Project: Spare Ratio	In Progress
<b>LAVTA</b>	1 Redefine established goals, objectives and standards to improve consistency.	Completed
<b>SFMTA</b>	1 Continue to make progress towards developing strategies to achieve the Proposition E service delivery standards.	Completed
	2 Conduct a comprehensive evaluation of maintenance standards and practices in an effort to improve service reliability, particularly at the Potrero, Presidio and Light Rail Divisions. The evaluation should also determine if resources are being used efficiently.	In Progress
	3 Refine the routine performance monitoring process to include specific performance standards that clearly support all goals and objectives.	In Progress
	4 Develop a set of goals, objectives, measures and standards that address paratransit performance and incorporate these into the primary performance monitoring process.	In Progress
	5 Sub-project for #2 above: Conduct a comprehensive evaluation of maintenance standards and practices in an effort to improve service reliability,	In Progress
<b>Union City</b>	1 Examine the declining trend in fixed-route productivity and develop strategies to reverse the trend.	Completed
	2 Continue reviewing fixed-route vehicle maintenance activities and take actions to improve service reliability.	
	3 Review performance standards to ensure they are reasonable in regard to actual performance.	
	4 Additional Project: Improve Union City Transit's Performance Monitoring Mechanism.	Completed
	5 Bus Schedule Revision	Completed
	6 Monthly Youth Pass Sales at Local School District Schools and Facilities	In Progress
<b>VTA</b>	1 Continue efforts towards implementing strategies to sustain financial stability.	In Progress
	2 Tighten the relationship between the goals and objectives in the Short Range Transit Plan (SRTP) and the measures and standards in the Transit Operations Performance Report. Additional measures should be developed to address reporting gaps in paratransit service, labor productivity and contracted services.	Completed
	3 Continue to monitor mechanical schedule loss for the bus system to ensure that it does not decline. Light rail vehicle reliability should be reviewed to ensure that the goal is achievable and consistent with the manufacturer's guidelines and industry best practices.	Completed
	4 Ensure that bus and light rail mechanical performance continues to be in the acceptable range, and realize any potential improvements	Completed

\* Benicia is currently consolidating with Vallejo; joint short range transit plan (SRTP) is being completed.

**Productivity Improvement Program (PIP)  
List of Operators and Triennial Audit Recommendations**

Programming Allocations Committee  
Agenda Item 2b, November 4, 2009  
Attachment 1  
Page 2 of 3

**2008 - Most Recent Audit Report  
2011 - Last Year Recommendations Are Expected to Be Addressed**

AGENCY	RECOMMENDATION	STATUS
<b>AC Transit</b>	1 Evaluate the district's CBO performance monitoring program to enhance its effectiveness	
	2 Expand efforts to improve schedule adherence and other service delivery performance	In Progress
	3 Continue to focus on strategies for reducing operator absences	In Progress
	4 Review security policies in light of increasing rate of calls for protective services assistance	
	5 Investigate the reasons for worsening road call rates despite improved preventive maintenance	
	6 Take steps to reduce the call abandonment rate	
<b>BART</b>	1 Continue to Focus Efforts on Improving On-Time Performance	In Progress
	2 Expand efforts aimed toward reducing operational safety-related incidents	
	3 Address the continuing perception among passengers that police presence is declining	
<b>CCCTA</b>	1 Continue to work with the paratransit contractor to reduce the turnover rate of LINK contract employees	
	2 Ridecheck Plus Implementation	In Progress
<b>Healdsburg</b>	1 Contiue efforts to expand routine performance monitoring and begin assessing performance against standards	In Progress
	2 Develop a strategy to improve performance in the cost per passenger, farebox recovery, average fare and subsidy per passenger	In Progress
	3 Utilize the Short Range Transit Plan (SRTP) as the Primary Forum for Defining Performance Expectations	Complete
<b>Petaluma</b>	1 Continue to monitor fixed route vehicle performance to improve service reliability	
	2 Examine the trends in fixed-route performance and develop strategies to improve performance relative to standards	
	3 Evaluate the inclusion of the contract clause requiring contractors to supplement farebox revenues	Complete
	4 Provide MTC with a cost allocation plan that shows the methodology for how the city allocates its administrative costs to the transit system	In Progress
<b>Santa Rosa</b>	1 Continue efforts to improve CityBus On-Time Performance	In Progress
	2 Examine the established performance standards and revise as necessary to improve their usefulness	In Progress
<b>Sonoma</b>	1 Continue to monitor fixed-route farebox recovery performance	Completed

**Productivity Improvement Program (PIP)  
List of Operators and Triennial Audit Recommendations**

Programming Allocations Committee  
Agenda Item 2b, November 4, 2009  
Attachment 1  
Page 3 of 3

**2009 - Most Recent Audit Report**  
**2012- Last Year Recommendations are Expected to be Addressed**

AGENCY	RECOMMENDATION	STATUS
Dixon	1 Continue to Implement the Revised Goals, Objectives, Measures and Standards, and the New System of Performance Monitoring	Completed
Golden Gate	1 Continue Efforts to Develop a Comprehensive Performance Monitoring System	
	2 Continue to Address the Increasing Rates of Complaints in Most Category	
	3 Develop Strategies to Address a Recent General Downturn in Ferry Performance	
	4 Evaluate SRTP Performance Standards that Appear to be Inconsistent with Actual Performance	
NCTPA	1 Continue Efforts to Meet Established System Promotion Targets, and Reevaluate Those Targets Given the Current Operating Environment	
	2 Review Performance Monitoring Efforts to Ensure Consistency with Established Measures and Standards	
	3 Take Steps to Control Passenger Cancellations on the Paratransit Service	
	4 Develop Policies and Procedures to Improve Administration Oversight of Data Collection, Reporting and Recordkeeping	
Rio Vista	1 Evaluate Performance Measures and Standards to Ensure Consistency, Adequacy and Measurability	
	2 Continue to Refine Procedures for Routine Performance Monitoring and Assessing Performance Against Standards	
SamTrans	1 Reconfigure the long term target items contained in the quantitative performance standards in the SRTP	In Progress
	2 Investigate and monitor the increases in bus operator and maintenance worker absences, and develop a plan to reduce those absences	
Tri Delta	1 Continue Evaluation of Performance Standards to Meet Goals and Objectives	In Progress
	2 Evaluate the Recent Decline in Performance for Percent of Lost Calls For its Fixed-Route Service and Take Steps to Improve Performance	
Vacaville	1 Updated Contractor Incentives & Liquidated Damages Program.	Completed
	2 Re-Evaluate the Standard For Fixed-Route Miles Between Preventable Accidents	
Vallejo	1 Continue to Refine Procedures for Routine Performance Monitoring and Assessing Performance Against Standards	In Progress
	2 Evaluate Objectives, Performance Measures and Standards to Ensure Comprehensiveness, Adequacy and Measurability	In Progress
	3 Re-Evaluate the Performance Standards and Measures in Light of Current Fiscal and Operating Environment	Completed
	4 Transition of Ferry Operations to Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA)	In Progress
	5 Consolidation of Service Between Benicia and Vallejo	Completed
WestCAT	1 Expand routine performance monitoring to include the assessment of performance against standards	Completed
	2 Re-Evaluate the Performance Standards For Both Bus and Paratransit Services to Ensure Adequacy of the Standards	
	3 Re-evaluate the performance standards for miles between roads calls for both bus and paratransit services	In Progress

Date: November 18, 2009  
W.I.: 1514  
Referred By: PAC

ABSTRACT

Resolution No. 3927

This resolution adopts MTC's FY 2009-10 Productivity Improvement Program (PIP).

Further discussion of this action is contained in the Programming and Allocation's Summary Sheet for November 4, 2009.

Date: November 18, 2009  
W.I.: 1514  
Referred By: PAC

Re: MTC Productivity Improvement Program

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
RESOLUTION NO. 3927

WHEREAS, Public Utilities Code (PUC) section 99244 provides that each transportation planning agency shall annually identify, analyze, and recommend potential productivity improvements which could lower the operating costs of transit operators within the area under its jurisdiction; and

WHEREAS, as provided for in Government Code sections 66500 et seq., the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) is the regional transportation planning agency for the San Francisco Bay Area; and

WHEREAS, PUC section 99244 provides that recommendations for improvements and productivity shall include, but not be limited to, those recommendations related to productivity made in the triennial performance audits of transit operators conducted pursuant to PUC section 99246; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99244, MTC is required each fiscal year, to make a finding that a transit operator has made a reasonable effort in implementing productivity improvement recommendations prior to approving the allocation of Transportation Development Act funds in an amount greater than was allocated to the operator in the preceding fiscal year; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99314.7, MTC is required each fiscal year, to make a finding that a transit operator has made reasonable effort in implementing productivity improvements pursuant to PUC section 99244, prior to approving the allocation of State Transit Assistance funds to the operator for operating purposes; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99233.2, MTC may support the regional transportation planning process by providing technical assistance funding to transit operators or other entities to implement transit productivity improvements; and

WHEREAS, MTC adopted Resolution No. 3617, which describes MTC's statutory responsibilities related to the identification, development and recommendation of transit

productivity improvements through the MTC Productivity Improvement Program, and which reference MTC's administrative procedures attendant to these programs; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that MTC adopts the performance audit-based projects, and other productivity improvement projects, as the case may be, set forth in Attachment A to this resolution, and incorporated herein by reference.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

---

Scott Haggerty, Chair

The above resolution was adopted by the  
Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
at a regular meeting of the Commission held in  
Oakland, California, on November 18, 2009.

Date: November 18, 2009  
W.I.: 1514  
Referred By: PAC

Attachment A  
Resolution No. 3927  
Page 1 of 22

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: AC Transit

Project Title: Creation of Leave Section in Human Resources Department

Project Goal: The new Leave Section will be responsible for developing guidelines for all mandated leaves in order to reduce potential abuse of AC Transit's leave provisions.

Project Description: Through reorganizing the Human Resources Department, a Leave Section will be established with the staff members who are experts in complexities of the myriad leave options available to employees. This new section will be responsible for updating AC Transit's leave policies and procedures, communicating the policy and procedure changes to employees, and conducting management training.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Reorganize the Human Resources Department: Create and staff a centralized Leave of Absence Unit responsible for all leaves including FMLA, CFRA, Workers' Compensation, union contract leaves, etc.	20%
2	Completed	Implement new PeopleSoft 9.0 software package. Include Time and Labor module programming to help track leaves and communicate the leave status of employees.	30%
3	Completed	Update leave policies and procedures.	30%
4	November 2009	Communicate policy and procedure changes. Conduct management training.	20%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **AC Transit**

Project Title:        On-Time Performance Improvement Plan: Hastus ATP Integration Project

Project Goal: This project has two primary goals:  
 1) secure accurate and current scheduled running time data for use in ATP; and  
 2) train Scheduling Staff to adjust scheduled bus running times in the Hastus Scheduling Software based on those real-time observations in order to improve on-time performance at AC Transit.

Project Description: The HASTUS software application is now used by the Scheduling Department to produce bus schedules, create Bus Operator duties, route design maps and overall bus service. HASTUS "ATP" is integrated into that software and displays scheduling and passenger activity. It was purchased in 2006 and assists Scheduling and Planning staff to monitor bus system performance by providing a graphical view of passenger activity and schedule adherence. That data is then used to make adjustments to bus routes and schedule running time. The purpose of the project is to integrate the use of this software module into daily scheduling activities by importing data collected by either automatic passenger counters, traffic checker data (using Hastus Rider module) or using the District's CAD/AVL system.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Data Analysis and Import testing	50%
2	Completed	Training Scheduling Staff on ATP Usage	10%
3	December 2009	Configuration of Hastus ATP software module	30%
4	April 2010	Import routines and data archiving procedures sufficient to adjust some new running times in ATP	10%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **BART**

Project Title:        Continue to Focus Efforts on Improving On-Time Performance,  
 Emergency Medical Services

Project Goal: The intent of this program is to reduce delays by quickly assisting any passengers requiring help with illness or injury at the stations with largest passenger through-traffic in the system. The program will not only directly benefit passengers stricken with medical problems, but will improve on-time performance in the most active section of the system.

Project Description: BART continues to focus on improving passenger and train on-time performance. To this end, the District is contracting for the provision of emergency medical personnel to be stationed at West Oakland and Embarcadero Stations during the morning and evening rush periods (0600-0900 and 1500-1900). An ambulance, staffed with an Emergency Medical Technician (EMT) and a Paramedic, will be provided at each station. Approximately 300 trains were significantly delayed as a result of medical emergencies at those stations during the last fiscal year.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Contract for EMT services and program initiation.	50%
	Completed	Evaluation of results and possible contract extension: Vendor #1.	13%
2	Completed	Evaluation of results and possible contract extension: Vendor #2.	12%
	Completed	Second evaluation of results and possible contract extension: Vendor #1.	12%
3	October 2009	Second evaluation of results and possible contract extension: Vendor #2.	13%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Central Contra Costa Transit Authority (CCCTA)**

Project Title: Ridecheck Plus Implementation

Project Goal: Improve fixed route performance as measured in terms of passengers per revenue hour.

Project Description: Use Ridecheck Plus software to view and manage automatic passenger counting (APC) data to make route changes and service cuts so that the least number of passengers are affected. County Connection needs to reduce service to account for funding loss, and the process of route re-structuring and making route reductions will be performed using this new tool (Ridecheck Plus).

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	Completion	Milestone/Deliverable	% of Project
1	Completed	Use of Ridecheck Plus to make planning decisions	50%
2	Ongoing	Monitor ridership patterns and make cuts to unproductive service-ongoing	50%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **City of Fairfield**

Project Title:        Spare Ratio Program

Project Goals: Reduce spare ratio to the FTA recommended level of no more than 20%.

Project Description: The City of Fairfield has developed a Bus Fleet Management Plan that satisfied the initial deficiency listed by FTA. Since that time, the City continues to reduce the spare ratio and is on target for full compliance with the FTA recommended 20% in FY 10/11. Paratransit fleet is in compliance and fixed route fleet spare ratio is calculated at 27% for FY 08/09 and 23% for FY 09/10. Full compliance is expected in FY 10/11.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Develop Bus Fleet Management Plan	25%
2	June 2011	Reduce Spare Ratio to no more than 20%	75%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **City of Healdsburg**

Project Title:        Continue Efforts to Expand Routine Performance Monitoring and Begin Assessing Performance Against Standards

Project Goals: The goal of this project is to continue the expansion of and complete enhancement of the performance reporting/monitoring system to make it consistent with the measures and standards that are included in the SRTP goals and objectives. The completed monitoring system will be developed to track data for the deviated fixed-route service and the demand response, Dial-a-Ride service.

Project Description: The remaining standards and performance indicators, identified in the Goals & Objectives portion of the SRTP, will be added to the existing computer-based spreadsheet which is currently utilized to document and report ridership and revenue figures. Documentation will be written and added to the spreadsheet explaining how the monitoring process and spreadsheet works including information on the sources of data, frequency of updating spreadsheet and types of reports produced. The reports will be utilized to assess actual performance against adopted performance standards, to identify current trends and to improve efficiency.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	October 2009	Remaining Standards and Performance Indicators for inclusion in the reporting spreadsheet are added to existing spreadsheet	20%
2	November 2009	Reporting procedures to collect necessary data are enhanced and/or created as necessary	20%
3	February 2010	Documentation for spreadsheet and monitoring process written. Report Templates created.	50%
4	March 2010	Initial Qtrly Report Produced	10%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **City of Healdsburg**

Project Title: Develop a Strategy to Improve Performance in the Cost per Passenger, Farebox Recovery, Average Fare and Subsidy per Passenger

Project Goals: The goal of this project is to improve performance in cost effectiveness.

Project Description: Fares and operating costs will be evaluated in relationship to current ridership to determine areas for cost cutting/savings and for increasing revenue. Fares will adjust upward with City Council approval. The Dial-a-Ride service, which has the highest subsidy, will be reviewed to determine if a reduction in service, or a change in service should be considered. A marketing plan will be developed and opportunities to increase ridership will be explored; for example a "Bus Buddy" program will be considered to increase ridership in both the senior and hispanic populations.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	A proposal to change Dial-A-Ride service operations and raise fares will go to City Council for approval.	20%
2	Completed	Implementation of new Dial-a-Ride service	15%
3	October 2009	Initial quarterly report produced to evaluate ridership and operating costs following implementation of new Dial-A-Ride service and fare increases	10%
4	January 2010	Create a transit marketing plan to include concept for Bus Buddy program	20%
5	March 2010	Implement new Bus Buddy program	15%
6	July 2010	Evaluation of & report produced for cost cutting and revenue enhancing efforts and results.	20%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **City of Petaluma**

Project Title:        Provide MTC with a Cost Allocation Plan that Shows the Methodology for  
How the City Allocates its Administrative Costs to the Transit System

Project Goals: Provide MTC with a Cost Allocation plan that shows the methodology for how the City allocates its administrative costs to the transit system.

Project Description: The City experienced a 48 percent increase in its fixed-route operating costs between FY2006 and FY2007. This was largely due to a 108 percent increase in the intergovernmental fees charged to the transit system by the City to help cover the City's central services costs for such items as administrative overhead, general services, information technology, and risk management costs. During the Triennial Audit the basis for how City's central services costs were allocated to the transit system could not be determined. The City will provide MTC with a cost allocation plan that shows how the cost allocation for City central services to the transit system was developed and that the intergovernmental costs charged were appropriate to the level of support provided to the transit system.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Review current cost allocation plan (Maximus Report)	10%
2	December 2009	Transit management participation in new City-wide cost allocation plan with regard to transit's allocation	80%
3	January 2010	Implementation of new City-wide cost allocation plan	10%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)**

Project Title: Conduct a Comprehensive Evaluation of Maintenance Standards and Practices in an Effort to Improve Service Reliability, Particularly At the Light Rail Divisions, and Determine If Resources Are Being Used Effectively

Project Goal: To adjust practices to improve service reliability at the Green Light Rail Division. Improve the timeliness of major inspections to use resources more efficiently.

Project Description: Identify critical subsystems where component replacement can significantly improve fleet reliability.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Ongoing	Maintenance practices and programs have been implemented to increase fleet reliability.	N/A
2	Ongoing	Implement LRV leveling program by adjusting LRV suspension systems and couplers to decrease the number of trainline issues.	30%
3	Completed	Convert LRV fleet to a 10,000 mile preventive maintenance schedule to improve efficiency of maintenance practices.	10%
4	Completed	Remove all OEM HVAC motors and compressors and replace with modified improved compressor units from Complete Coach Works (CCW).	20%
5	Completed	Improve propulsion system reliability by changing out original batteries on propulsion system CPU cards.	20%
6	June 2013	Prevent unnecessary vehicle propulsion and electrical system failures by replacing LRV battery sets, which are mostly reconditioned and exhibiting normal wear and tear. As of May 2009, this project is 40% complete.	20%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)**

Project Title: Refine the routine performance monitoring process to include specific performance standards that clearly support all goals and objectives

Project Goal: Implement a series of refinements to SFMTA’s performance monitoring process culminating in their incorporation into the next SRTP.

Project Description: As noted in the evaluation of goals and objectives, MTA’s SRTP goals and objectives only include specific measures and standards for areas that relate to Proposition E. Other goals and objectives are not always supported by a clear set of quantifiable measures and standards. MTA should refine its goals and objectives in advance of the next SRTP update to include quantifiable measures and performance standards for all its goals and objectives and incorporate these into its routine performance monitoring.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Develop and approve Agency-wide Strategic Plan including clear goals and objectives	35%
2	Completed	Identify performance measures in support of the Agency’s Strategic Plan goals	25%
3	Completed	Widen service standards report to include performance measures that reflect a broader set of Agency responsibilities	15%
4	Completed	Align service standards related performance measures to the Strategic Plan	10%
5	Completed	Implement annual reporting on progress related to the Strategic Plan and associated measures	10%
6	December 2009	Incorporate updated measures into next SRTP (2010-2029)	5%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)**

Project Title: Develop a set of goals, objectives, measures and standards that address paratransit performance and incorporate these into the primary performance monitoring process.

Project Goal: Articulate a set of goals, objectives, quantifiable measure and performance standards for paratransit service and maintain on-going performance monitoring.

Project Description: As part of the Triennial TDA audit, it was observed that the SFMTA did not appear to have a formal set of goals, objectives, measures and standards for its paratransit service. This project is designed to provide better information regarding the SF Paratransit goals, performance measures and its on-going monitoring activities.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Provide information regarding paratransit goals and objectives to address: safety (accidents and injuries); cost efficiencies; service quality (on-time performance and telephone call wait times); and ADA requirements (trip denials and excessively long trip)	70%
2	On-Going	Review of monthly reports	10%
3	On-Going	Quarterly Incentive/Disincentive review	10%
4	On-Going	Provide quarterly service reports to the Paratransit Coordinating Council	10%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)**

Project Title: Conduct a comprehensive evaluation of maintenance standards and practices in an effort to improve service reliability, particularly at the Potrero Division. The evaluations should also determine if resources are being used efficiently

Project Goal: Adjust practices to improve reliability, particularly at the Potrero and Presidio Divisions; improve timeliness of major inspections to use resources more efficiently.

Project Description: All divisions are challenged in producing quality PM inspections due to ongoing standing and continuing part shortage problems. This program adjusts maintenance practices with the goal of improving performance in the preventive maintenance function and reducing coaches removed from service at the Potrero Division.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	February 2010	Continue to adjust maintenance practices, including assignment of maintenance Controllers to all divisions to improve Potrero MDBF	50%
2	June 2010	Improve timeliness of PM inspections at Potrero division to 95%	50%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **City of Santa Rosa**

Project Title:        Improve On-Time Performance

Project Goal: The goal of this project is to work towards achieving a 90% "on-time" departure standard.

Project Description: Santa Rosa CityBus' TDA Triennial Review Final Report noted that CityBus maintained, on average, an 81% on-time performance standard during the review period. The stated goal of CityBus is to continue improving on the TDA Triennial Review's on-time performance base. Staff continues to make schedule and equipment adjustments; train bus operators to improve driving skills and comfort levels; and work to maintain a high level of morale to support schedule adherence.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Evaluate current system (as part of 2008 - 2017 Short Range Transit Plan Update development )	30%
2	Completed	Design Service Enhancements	30%
3	Completed	Public Outreach and City Council approval	20%
4	Completed	Implementation	10%
5	April 2010	Continue with system, equipment and personnel adjustment to improve on-time performance standard from 81% to 90%.	5%
6	August 2010	Evaluate system's adherence to a 90% on-time performance standard.	5%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **City of Santa Rosa**

Project Title:        Examine the Established Performance Standards and Revise As Necessary To Improve Their Usefulness

Project Goal: It is the stated objective of this project to evaluate and revise the CityBus fixed-route and paratransit service performance standards to improve the accuracy of CityBuses' transit service performance monitoring, and therefore the overall usefulness as a management tool.

Project Description: It is the intention of CityBus to review all performance standards as part of the 2008-2017 Short Range Transit Plan Update and make adjustments to improve consistency and accuracy.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Review performance standards for fixed route and paratransit services.	10%
2	Completed	Develop list of potential modifications to performance standards.	30%
3	Completed	Evaluate modifications based upon availability of performance data and comparisons with past performance data.	30%
4	Completed	Select and implement new performance measurements.	20%
5	November 2009	Evaluate performance standards.	10%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **SamTrans**

Project Title: Development of Goals, Objectives and Performance Measures and Monitoring Program

Project Goal: To Develop an on-going performance monitoring system that measures the progress towards goals contained in SamTrans' Strategic Plan and Short Range Transit Plans (SRTP)

Project Description: SamTrans has completed and its Board has adopted a five year District-wide Strategic Plan, the first in over 20 years. The District Strategic Plan serves as a foundational policy document for the formation of future Short Range Transit Plans (SRTPs) and contains the framework for the goals to be incorporated in the next full SRTP to be written in 2011. Currently the District maintains a quarterly performance monitoring report.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Complete Strategic Plan	
2	Completed	On-going Quarterly Performance Reports and Reviews	67%
3	September 2011	2011-2021 Full SRTP with updated performance measures and targets from the Strategic Plan	33%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Eastern Contra Costa Transit Authority (Tri-Delta)**

Project Title: Continue Evaluation of Performance Standards to meet goals and objectives.

Project Goal: Revise standards to be more realistic.

Project Description: Evaluate and refine overall set of goals, objectives, performance measures and standards. Incorporate these into the monthly reporting system.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	September 2009	Evaluate Standards.	25%
2	December 2009	Revise standards to be more realistic. Add or delete standards as determined to be appropriate.	25%
3	January 2010	Incorporate revised standards into monthly reporting process.	50%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:    **City of Union City**

Project Title:        Monthly Youth Pass Sales at local School District Schools and Facilities

Project Goal: Increase overall Youth ridership on Union City Transit

Project Description: Project involves setting up a system to sell Union City Transit Youth Passes at the local school sites and/or school district facilities. Pass sale locations that are more accessible to students will encourage more ridership.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	October 2009	Meet with local school district to discuss feasibility of selling passes on school district property	40%
2	November 2009	Determine site locations for pass sales	10%
3	November 2009	Set up a payment reconciliation system/protocol between school district and City Finance Department	10%
4	December 2009	Produce Youth Passes for Sale	25%
5	January 2010	Advertise Pass Sales to Youth population	10%
6	2010 and ongoing	Deliver passes to sale and recover unsold passes from previous month	5%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **City of Vallejo**

Project Title: Continue to Refine Procedures for Routine Performance Monitoring and Assessing Performance Against Standards

Project Goal: The City should refine its performance monitoring efforts to ensure a coordinated, effective system of performance monitoring is in place. The City should make sure its monitoring system is comprehensive; includes all relevant measures and standards; and that its objectives and standards support the most effective system of monitoring its transportation related activities. The City also should require its contractors to provide complete, accurate data that reflect the objectives measures and standards established by the City.

Project Description: The City has established a performance monitoring system that tracks performance on a monthly and annual basis, with the operations contractors compiling performance data into monthly reports, and the City summarizing that data into monthly and annual summaries. Some discrepancies exist between the contractor's monitoring activities and the City's activities. The contractor's reports provide data on a few, but not all, performance measures included in the SRTP. The contractors' summary performance reports do not provide a comprehensive monitoring of performance against the standards, and the City's monthly and annual performance summaries do not include all the measures established in the SRTP. The City does not appear to be actively tracking the measures and standards set forth in the SRTP as evidence by the missing performance data in the performance against established standards section. The City indicated it had initiated quarterly on-site performance reviews for the bus and paratransit services, but none of the quarterly reviews were provided for this audit period.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Establish a comprehensive monitoring performance	40%
2	Completed	Include all performance measures as established in the SRTP	30%
3	December 2009	Begin actively track measures and standards set forth in the SRTP	30%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **City of Vallejo**

Project Title: Evaluate Objectives, Performance Measures and Standards to Ensure Comprehensiveness, Adequacy and Measurability

Project Goal: The City should evaluate and revise its goals, objectives, measures and standards to improve their comprehensiveness, adequacy and measurability, and therefore their overall usefulness as a management tool.

Project Description: The City's goals, objectives, measures and standards as established in its SRTP are clear and concise, addressing a wide range of concerns. However, several deficiencies were identified in the structure of the objectives, measures and standards established in support of the goals. There were no objectives or measures established to address or fulfill the needs of the overall community served. There also were no service planning objectives or safety objectives or measures established for any mode of service, although the City's contractors do compile safety/accident data in their monthly reports. Some of the measures (mainly non-service provision related), included in the SRTP had no standards established for them, and none have been developed to date. Likewise, a suggested split of the bus service measures into local service and express service measures has not been implemented. Finally, while most measures have quantifiable standards, some of the measures do not, which may make performance monitoring difficult.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Create a Planning objectives or safety objectives	30%
2	September 2009	Establish a standard to measure in fulfilling the needs of the overall community served	40%
3	December 2009	To implement split of Bus service measure into local service and express service	30%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator:     **City of Vallejo**

Project Title:        Transition of Ferry Operations to Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA)

Project Goal: By July 1 2009, the WETA Board of Directors must adopt a transition plan that includes the following financially constrained elements: An operating element describing existing services and planned service expansions; and a capital element defining a five-year Capital Improvement Program identifying all assets required to maintain, sustain and expand the system as planned. The WETA also must develop a Water Emergency System Management Plan on or before July 1, 2009 in coordination with MTC, the US Coast Guard and the state Office of Emergency Services, which has been developed as a separate planning document. In developing this transition plan, under additional legislation, SB 1093, WETA is required to balance planned expansion services with the needs of existing Alameda and Vallejo ferry services planned for transition to WETA.

This plan is structured to fulfill the reporting mandates of SB 976 and SB 1093 by providing a description of the existing Bay ferry services, charting a course for transfer and consolidation of those services under WETA, plans for service expansion and a five-year financial outlook, including capital improvements. The document concludes with a set of next steps to meet a service transfer target of January 1, 2010.

Project Description: Under SB 976, WETA is to assume control over publicly operated ferries in the Bay Area, except those owned and operated by the Golden Gate Bridge District. Additionally, SB 976 requires WETA to produce a transition plan outlining the process of consolidating and transferring three existing ferry services to the WETA, the Alameda/Oakland, Harbor Bay and Vallejo Baylink Services.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Transition Plan	35%
2	January 2010	Transfer of service	65%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA)**

Project Title: Continue Efforts toward Implementing Strategies to Sustain Financial Stability

Project Goal: The ultimate goal is to achieve long-term financial stability, while sustaining at least current service levels.

Project Description: Continue Efforts Towards Implementing Strategies to Sustain Financial Stability. Implement the fiscal recommendations and the organizational changes related to fiscal stability identified in the 2007 Organization and Financial Assessment conducted by the Hay Group. Short term deliverables include hiring an interim Chief Financial Officer (CFO), implementing GASB-35 compliance with the '08 budget, implementing a cash-management system, updating and validating the 30-year Measure A plan. Longer term deliverables detailed Hay Group March 2007 VTA Organizational & Financial Assessment Part 1, Section B pp. 11 &12.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	VTA Board adopts Hay Group's 2007 Organizational & Management Assessment.	30%
2	Completed	VTA Board hires Interim CFO.	5%
3	Completed	VTA Board Approves CFO's Work plan.	5%
4	Completed	VTA Implements Short-Term Hay Group Recommendations.	20%
5	Completed	VTA Implements Medium-Term Hay Group Recommendations.	20%
6	June 2010	VTA Implements Long-Term Hay Group Recommendations.	20%
		Total	100%

**Fiscal Year 2009-2010 Productivity Improvement Program**

Transit Operator: **Western Contra Costa Transit Authority (WestCat)**

Project Title: Re-evaluate the performance standards for miles between roads calls for both bus and paratransit services.

Project Goal: Work with Board of Directors to tailor performance standards so that goals and objectives better reflect actual performance.

Project Description: WCCTA's standard for miles between roadcalls is significantly lower than actual performance for both bus and paratransit services. WCCTA will work with site Management Contractor personnel, Metropolitan Transportation Commission and its Board of Directors to review, evaluate and change the standard to better reflect actual performance.

Schedule and Percentages of Milestones/Deliverables:

	<b>Completion</b>	<b>Milestone/Deliverable</b>	<b>% of Project</b>
1	Completed	Work with MTC and staff to evaluate current roadcall performance and change the standard to reflect current roadcall performance as needed and include in WCCTA Short Range Transit Plan.	30%
2	September 2009	Agendize the updated Goals and Objectives for the Board of Directors meeting and include Board in discussion and approval of new Goal.	35%
3	Ongoing	Continue to work with Board of Directors to add or tailor goals and objections according to their direction, system trends and the changed requirements.	35%
		Total	100%