

Metropolitan Transportation Commission Programming and Allocations Committee

July 8, 2009

Item Number 2d

Resolution No. 3919

Subject: FY 2008-09 FTA Section 5310 Transportation for Elderly Persons and Persons with Disabilities Program

Background: The Federal Transit Administration (FTA) Transportation for Elderly Persons and Persons with Disabilities Program (49 U.S.C. Section 5310) provides capital grants to meet the transportation needs of elderly persons and persons with disabilities in areas where existing public transit services are otherwise unavailable, insufficient, or inappropriate. California's apportionment is managed by the California Transportation Commission (CTC). Statewide, approximately \$12.6 million in funds is available in FY 2008-09.

During this funding cycle, seventeen Bay Area organizations and agencies submitted Section 5310 applications. They requested a total of \$3.7 million in federal funds for vehicle and equipment purchases.

The CTC has established a set of quantitative scoring criteria that regions must use to objectively evaluate and score the projects; however, the CTC gives regions the flexibility to establish their own regional evaluation process. MTC chose to have the county Paratransit Coordinating Councils (PCCs) assist in the evaluation process. Applications were due on May 20, 2009. At that time the County PCCs reviewed and scored the applications and transmitted their local scores to MTC. At the PCC staff's discretion, applicants were given a regional deadline of June 5, 2009 to make any revisions suggested during the local review process.

MTC staff also reviewed and scored the applications to certify that the proposed projects were derived from the Bay Area's Coordinated Public Transit-Human Services Transportation Plan as required, and to ensure that the same scoring standards were applied consistently throughout the region in areas where some discretion was allowed. After compiling the scores for all projects and developing a draft regional prioritization list, MTC staff notified all applicants of their scores and the appeals process. An open forum for applicants to appeal their project scores was scheduled for June 26, 2009. No appeals were received.

If approved by the Commission, the FTA Section 5310 regional prioritization list and scores will be transmitted to both the California Department of Transportation and the CTC for consideration in the statewide competition. A statewide review committee will make the final determination of scores and eligibility, and will determine a "cutoff" score, above which all projects will be funded. The CTC is tentatively scheduled to distribute the statewide prioritized list of projects in December 2009. At

that time, applicants will have another opportunity to appeal their project scores.

Issues: None.

Recommendation: Refer MTC Resolution No. 3919 to the Commission for approval.

Attachments: MTC Resolution No. 3919

Date: July 22, 2009
W.I.: 1512
Referred By: PAC

ABSTRACT

Resolution No. 3919

This resolution adopts program priorities for the FY 2008-09 Federal Transit Administration (FTA) Transportation for Elderly Persons and Persons with Disabilities Program (49 U.S.C. Section 5310), as listed in Attachment B, and directs that the recommendations be submitted to Caltrans with the request that the projects be considered for funding and incorporated in the statewide Program of Projects submitted to the Federal Transit Administration.

Further discussion of this action is contained in the MTC Programming and Allocations Summary dated July 8, 2009.

Date: July 22, 2009
W.I.: 1512
Referred By: PAC

Re: FY 2008-09 FTA Transportation for Elderly Persons and Persons with Disabilities Program Recommendations for the San Francisco Bay Area Region

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
RESOLUTION NO. 3919

WHEREAS, Title 49 U.S.C. 5310 authorizes grants to private non-profit organizations and certain public entities for public transportation capital projects to meet the special needs of elderly individuals and individuals with disabilities; and

WHEREAS, the California Transportation Commission (CTC) must consider all project applications received within the state prior to submittal to the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) for funding approval; and

WHEREAS, the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) is the regional transportation planning agency for the San Francisco Bay Area pursuant to Government Code sections 66500 et seq.; and

WHEREAS, MTC, as the Regional Transportation Planning Agency, is responsible for objectively reviewing and scoring projects submitted by applicants in the MTC region and for making recommendations concerning their suitability for funding; these recommendations are to be considered by the CTC in its preparation of the statewide Program of Projects; and

WHEREAS, MTC, as the Regional Transportation Planning Agency, is responsible for establishing a public participation plan and a Local Level Appeals Process for the applicants; and

WHEREAS, MTC Resolution No. 468 states that “MTC shall not endorse a federal or state transportation grant request by private non-profit, or paratransit operators, including claimants under the FTA Elderly and Persons with Disabilities Program, unless the claimant shows to the satisfaction of the MTC evidence of willingness to participate in a countywide Paratransit Coordinating Council (PCC)”; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that MTC has followed the Elderly and Persons with Disabilities Program Application Evaluation Process set forth in Attachment A, attached hereto and incorporated herein as though set forth in full; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that MTC has notified and involved interested members of the public in the selection and ranking of FTA Elderly and Persons with Disabilities Program projects; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that, based on the outcome of such process, MTC endorses the project priorities and conditions as listed on Attachment B to this resolution, attached hereto and incorporated herein as though set forth at length; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that the Executive Director of MTC or his designee shall transmit these recommendations to the CTC, with the request that they be fully considered and incorporated by the CTC in its preparation of the statewide program of projects to be submitted to FTA for funding under the Elderly and Persons with Disabilities Program; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that a copy of this resolution shall also be transmitted to each county PCC which has participated in the FTA Elderly and Persons with Disabilities Program Project Review Process, and to other organizations as shall be appropriate; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that MTC will amend its Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) when appropriate to incorporate those projects approved at the state level.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Scott Haggerty, Chair

The above resolution was entered into by the Metropolitan Transportation Commission at a regular meeting of the Commission held in Oakland, California on July 22, 2009.

Date: July 22, 2009
W.I.: 1512
Referred By: PAC

Attachment A
Resolution No. 3919
Page 1 of 1

**FTA Section 5310 Transportation for Elderly Persons and Persons with Disabilities Program
MTC's FY 2008-09 Application Evaluation Process**

1. Each eligible project request received was evaluated using the statewide criteria, which were developed by the California Transportation Commission (CTC). The evaluation criteria are divided into the following categories: 1) ability of applicant, 2) coordination planning, 3) utilization of existing or proposed equipment, and 4) service effectiveness.
2. MTC, as the Regional Transportation Planning Agency, convened the nine county Paratransit Coordinating Councils (PCCs) to lead each county-wide evaluation process. Each county PCC assembled a Local Review Committee (LRC) to evaluate and score the applications submitted for funding under the FTA Section 5310 program. The composition of the county teams was determined entirely by each PCC. Applicants for projects that were deemed ineligible by the LRC were notified by the county PCC.
3. MTC staff reviewed the each application to determine that the proposed project was derived from MTC's Coordinated Public Transit – Human Services Transportation Plan: Elderly and Disabled Component, and also independently evaluated the applications to make sure that the same standards were applied throughout the region in areas where some discretion was allowed.
4. The LRC's scores were transmitted to MTC staff. Discrepancies between the LRC's and MTC staff's scores were discussed and resolved. MTC staff notified each applicant of their scores and the local appeal process.
5. MTC staff with representatives from county PCCs met in an open forum format to hear and resolve applicant appeals (if any).
6. MTC staff compiled all scores for the region and developed a regional priority listing. MTC staff will present the final recommendations to the Commission for adoption. Once adopted, the final list will be transmitted to Caltrans for funding consideration.

**FTA SECTION 5310 TRANSPORTATION FOR ELDERLY PERSONS & PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES PROGRAM
FY 2008-09 PROGRAM PRIORITIES FOR SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA REGION**

NO.	APPLICANT	PROJECT	TYPE ¹	VIN ²	QTY	PROJECT SCORE	TOTAL COST	FEDERAL PORTION ³	COUNTY
1	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	42966		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
2	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	35924		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
3	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	48662		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
4	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	48665		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
5	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	48672		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
6	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	48673		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
7	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	48674		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
8	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	48675		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
9	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	48676		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
10	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	48677		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
11	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	48678		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
12	Outreach	Minivan Type IV	R	48666		98	\$48,000	\$42,494	Santa Clara
13	Outreach	Mobile Radio	OE		12	98	\$12,000	\$10,624	Santa Clara
14	City of Richmond	Minivan Type IV	R	65452		96	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
15	City of Richmond	Minivan Type IV	R	02102		96	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
16	City of Richmond	Small Bus Type IB	R	99147		96	\$64,000	\$56,659	Contra Costa
17	City of Richmond	Minivan Type IV	R	68943		96	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
18	Outreach	Base Station	OE		1	96	\$2,500	\$2,213	Santa Clara
19	Golden Rain	Bus Type IIIA	R	29805		94	\$71,500	\$63,299	Contra Costa
20	Golden Rain	Bus Type IIIA	R	29801		94	\$71,500	\$63,299	Contra Costa
21	Golden Rain	Bus Type IIIA	R	29802		94	\$71,500	\$63,299	Contra Costa
22	Golden Rain	Bus Type IIIA	R	29803		94	\$71,500	\$63,299	Contra Costa
23	Golden Rain	Other Equipment (4 Brake Retarders, 4 Bike Racks, 8 Destination Signs, 4 Stop Request Signal/Pull Cords, 4 Luggage/Grocery Racks)	OE		4-8	94	\$40,000	\$35,412	Contra Costa
24	Self Help for the Elderly	Medium Bus Type IIA	R	86000	1	93	\$66,000	\$58,430	San Francisco
25	PACE Solano	Large Bus Type IIIA	R	16070		92	\$71,500	\$63,299	Solano
26	PACE Solano	Large Bus Type IIIA	R	24915		92	\$71,500	\$63,299	Solano
27	City of Richmond	Minivan Type IV	R	52285		91	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
28	Center for Elders' Independence	Small Bus Type IA	R	25612		91	\$57,000	\$50,462	Alameda
29	Respite Inn	Minivan Type IV	R	29407		89	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
30	On Lok	Small Bus Type IA	R	33810	1	89	\$57,000	\$50,462	San Francisco
31	On Lok	Small Bus Type IA	R	33825	1	89	\$57,000	\$50,462	San Francisco
32	On Lok	Small Bus Type IA	R	51641	1	89	\$57,000	\$50,462	San Francisco
33	On Lok	Small Bus Type IA	R	68610	1	89	\$57,000	\$50,462	San Francisco
34	On Lok	Small Bus Type IA	R	68611	1	89	\$57,000	\$50,462	San Francisco
35	On Lok	Small Bus Type IA	R	73792	1	89	\$57,000	\$50,462	San Francisco
36	On Lok	Small Bus Type IA	R	13643	1	89	\$57,000	\$50,462	San Francisco
37	PACE Solano	Large Bus Type IIIA	R	62965		87	\$71,500	\$63,299	Solano
38	PACE Solano	Large Bus Type IIIA	R	74152		87	\$71,500	\$63,299	Solano
39	PRIDE Industries One	Large Bus Type IIIA	R	09704		87	\$71,500	\$63,299	Sonoma

¹ R = Replacement, SE = Service Expansion, OE = Other Equipment

² VIN = For replacement projects, Vehicle Identification Number (last 5 digits only)

³ Federal Portion is 88.53% of Total Cost; remaining 11.47% is local match requirement.

**FTA SECTION 5310 TRANSPORTATION FOR ELDERLY PERSONS & PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES PROGRAM
FY 2008-09 PROGRAM PRIORITIES FOR SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA REGION**

NO.	APPLICANT	PROJECT	TYPE ¹	VIN ²	QTY	PROJECT SCORE	TOTAL COST	FEDERAL PORTION ³	COUNTY
40	PRIDE Industries One	Large Bus Type IIIA	R	12051		87	\$71,500	\$63,299	Sonoma
41	PRIDE Industries One	Large Bus Type IIIA	R	78403		87	\$71,500	\$63,299	Sonoma
42	PRIDE Industries One	Large Bus Type IIIA	R	88861		87	\$71,500	\$63,299	Sonoma
43	PRIDE Industries One	Large Bus Type IIIA	R	88862		87	\$71,500	\$63,299	Sonoma
44	SamTrans	Medium Bus Type IIA	SE	-		87	\$66,000	\$58,430	San Mateo
45	SamTrans	Medium Bus Type IIA	SE	-		87	\$66,000	\$58,430	San Mateo
46	City of Richmond	Small Bus Type IB	R	24947		86	\$64,000	\$56,659	Contra Costa
47	City of Richmond	Small Bus Type IB	R	23930		86	\$64,000	\$56,659	Contra Costa
48	Center for Elders' Independence	Minivan Type IV	R	59068		86	\$48,000	\$42,494	Alameda
49	Center for Elders' Independence	Minivan Type IV	R	55780		86	\$48,000	\$42,494	Alameda
50	Center for Elders' Independence	Mobile Radio	OE	N/A	7	86	\$3,150	\$2,789	Alameda
51	Lamorinda Spirit Van	Small Bus Type IA	R	45839		85	\$57,000	\$50,462	Contra Costa
52	Contra Costa ARC	Minivan Type IV	SE			85	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
53	Contra Costa ARC	Minivan Type IV	SE			85	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
54	Contra Costa ARC	Minivan Type IV	SE			85	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
55	Contra Costa ARC	Minivan Type IV	SE			85	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
56	Contra Costa ARC	Minivan Type IV	SE			85	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
57	Contra Costa ARC	Minivan Type IV	SE			85	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
58	Center for Elders' Independence	Medium Bus Type IIA	SE	N/A		85	\$66,000	\$58,430	Alameda
59	Center for Elders' Independence	Medium Bus Type IIA	SE	N/A		85	\$66,000	\$58,430	Alameda
60	Center for Elders' Independence	Medium Bus Type IIA CNG	SE	N/A		85	\$89,000	\$78,792	Alameda
61	On Lok	Small Bus Type IA	R	41230	1	84	\$57,000	\$50,462	San Francisco
62	City of Santa Rosa	GPS/AVL MDT's (Mentor Ranger)	OE		3	83	\$8,629	\$7,639	Sonoma
63	Contra Costa ARC	Minivan Type IV	SE			82	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
64	Contra Costa ARC	Minivan Type IV	SE			82	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
65	Contra Costa ARC	Minivan Type IV	SE			82	\$48,000	\$42,494	Contra Costa
66	Whistlestop	Small Bus Type IA	SE			82	\$57,000	\$50,462	Marin
67	Whistlestop	Small Bus Type IA	SE			82	\$57,000	\$50,462	Marin
68	Whistlestop	Medium Bus Type IIA	SE			82	\$66,000	\$58,430	Marin
69	Whistlestop	Medium Bus Type IIA	SE			82	\$66,000	\$58,430	Marin
70	Center for Elders' Independence	Medium Bus Type IIA	R	31639		81	\$66,000	\$58,430	Alameda
71	PRIDE Industries One	Large Bus Type IIIA	SE			79	\$71,500	\$63,299	Sonoma
72	Alzheimer's Services of the East Bay	Small Bus Type IA	R	92348		75	\$57,000	\$50,462	Alameda

¹ R = Replacement, SE = Service Expansion, OE = Other Equipment

² VIN = For replacement projects, Vehicle Identification Number (last 5 digits only)

³ Federal Portion is 88.53% of Total Cost; remaining 11.47% is local match requirement.

**FTA SECTION 5310 TRANSPORTATION FOR ELDERLY PERSONS & PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES PROGRAM
FY 2008-09 PROGRAM PRIORITIES FOR SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA REGION**

NO.	APPLICANT	PROJECT	TYPE ¹	VIN ²	QTY	PROJECT SCORE	TOTAL COST	FEDERAL PORTION ³	COUNTY
73	Edgewood Center for Children and Families	Minivan Type IV	R	129	1	72	\$48,000	\$42,494	San Francisco
74	Edgewood Center for Children and Families	Minivan Type IV	R	44480	1	72	\$48,000	\$42,494	San Francisco
75	Alzheimer's Services of the East Bay	Small Bus Type IA	SE	N/A		65	\$57,000	\$50,462	Alameda
76	LifeLong Medical Care	Small Bus Type IA	SE	N/A		61	\$57,000	\$50,462	Alameda
TOTAL							\$4,171,279	\$3,692,833	

¹ R = Replacement, SE = Service Expansion, OE = Other Equipment

² VIN = For replacement projects, Vehicle Identification Number (last 5 digits only)

³ Federal Portion is 88.53% of Total Cost; remaining 11.47% is local match requirement.