



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Scott Haggerty, Chair
Alameda County

Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair
San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Chris Daly
City and County of San Francisco

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Amy Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director,
Bay Area Toll Authority

Therese W. McMillan
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

COMMISSION MEETING

Wednesday, February 25, 2009

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607

REVISED MINUTES

ATTENDANCE

Chair Dodd called the meeting to order at 10:10 a.m. In addition to Chair Dodd, the following Commissioners were present: Azumbrado, Bates, Chu, Cortese, Daly, Giacopini, Glover, Haggerty, Halsted, Kinsey, Lempert, Rubin, Sartipi, Spering, Tissier, Worth and Yeager.

CHAIR'S REPORT

Chair Dodd presented the Chair's report to the Commission.

Chair Dodd recounted the Ad Hoc nominating Committee's Report presented to the Commission at its January 28th meeting and requested Commission approval of the nomination of Commissioner Haggerty to serve as Commission Chair and Commissioner Tissier to serve as Commission Vice Chair for the next two-year term. The Commission unanimously approved the nominations. New Chair Haggerty then chaired the balance of the meeting.

The Commission unanimously approved the following:

- Resolution No. 3894 – Resolution of Appreciation for Commission Chair Bill Dodd. Commissioner Dodd expressed his gratitude.
- Resolution No. 3895 – Resolution of Appreciation for CTC Commissioner John Barna.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Steve Heminger presented the Executive Director's report to the Commission. Copies of the report are available from the Executive Office or www.mtc.ca.gov.

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Commission unanimously approved the following items on the Consent Calendar:

- Minutes of the Commission meeting of January 28, 2009.

Programming and Allocations Committee

- Resolution No. 3620, Revised – Revision to Delegated Authority Policy to allow changes to RM2 Project-specific conditions and minor scope revisions.
- Resolution No. 3788, Revised – Revisions to the Cycle 1 Lifeline Program of Projects to include the Marin City Transit Hub and Donohue Street ADA improvements project using unprogrammed Lifeline balance.
- Resolution No. 3871, Revised – Revisions to the New Freedom Second Cycle Small Urbanized Area Program of Projects.
- Resolution No. 3875, Revised – 2009 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Amendment 2009-04.
- Resolution No. 3875, Revised – 2009 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Amendment 2009-05.
- Resolution No. 3886 – FY 2009-10 MTC Fund Estimate.

Legislation Committee

- Resolution No. 3516, Revised – Appointments to Advisory Committees.

Draft MTC Standing Committee Minutes

Draft Committee minutes of the following standing committees were presented for information only; they were provided as background information for items that were being taken up by the full Commission.

- Draft Minutes of the Administration Committee Meeting – February 11, 2009.
- Draft Minutes of the Programming & Allocations Committee Meeting – February 11, 2009.
- Draft Minutes of the Planning Committee Meetings – February 13, 2009.
- Draft Minutes of the Legislation Committee Meeting – February 13, 2009.

Draft MTC Advisory Committee Minutes

Draft Advisory Committee minutes were presented for Commission information only.

- Minutes of the Elderly and Disabled Advisory Committee Meeting – February 5, 2009.
- Minutes of the Minority Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting – February 10, 2009.
- Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting – February 11, 2009.

•

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Programming and Allocations Committee - Tissier

- Resolution Nos. 3875, Revised and 3885 and 3888 – American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA): Regional Programming Proposal and Proposed TIP Amendment 2009-07.

The Commission received public comment from the following:

- Larry Reid, City of Oakland Councilmember, 7th District – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Mike Scanlon – Peninsula Corridor Joint Powers Board – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions, except to request reconsideration of recommendations for High Speed Rail (HSR) related priorities.
- Mehdi Morshed, California High Speed Rail Authority – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions, and also requested reconsideration of recommendations for High Speed Rail (HSR) related priorities.
- Stuart Cohen, TransForm – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions, except to oppose BART to Oakland Airport.
- Carli Paine, TransForm – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions, urged focus of local streets and roads to Priority Development Areas.
- Steve Geller, Genesis – spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Kyri McClellan, City of San Francisco Mayor Gavin Newsom’s office – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions, and in favor of the Trans Bay Terminal.
- Margot Smith, Genesis/Gray Panthers – spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Reverend Scott Denman, Genesis - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Ying Lee, Genesis - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Michele Jensen, Genesis - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Carmen Angelandretti, BOSS - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.

- John Glaasen, Genesis - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Robert Beck, Transbay Joint Powers Authority – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Carmen Rivera-Hendrickson, Wheels Accessible Advisory Community - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit and the increase of fares.
- Rebeca Garcia, Grassroots Leadership Network - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Olivia Beltran, Grassroots Leadership Network - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Stephen Kelly, Lake Merritt Ecovillage - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- John Garth, United Seniors of Oakland and Alameda County - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Deborah James - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit also expressed her disagreement of the Van Hool buses.
- Laura Wells, Green Party/Genesis - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit, and concern about AC Transit service provision.
- Karen Smulevitz, USOAC & CARA - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Scott Mace – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Joyce Roy - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Summer Brenner - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Christine Monsen, ACTIA – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Sue Ellen Williams, AC Transit Bus Driver - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit, and concern regarding AC Transit route management.
- Jana Lane, Genesis - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit, and opposed Van Hool buses.
- Gaby Miller, Genesis - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- James Berk – WYSE - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Alufola Sababie & Raul Raya – St. Mary’s Center - and expressed that the MTC Commission ought to have more African American representatives and expressed that the MTC Commission ought to have more African American representatives.
- Michael J. Krueger, spoke in support of HSR and also expressed disagreement in not using money to fund AC Transit.

- Susan Decker, Alameda Transit Advocates – spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Jim Bigelow, Redwood City- San Mateo County Chamber - spoke in *FAVOR* of the above named resolutions.
- Dorothy Dugger, BART – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Wendy Alfsen, California Walks - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Jim Gleich, AC Transit – Urged the Commission to take consideration of AC Transit’s lost revenue.
- Alexandra Slatoff, Genesis - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Carl Anthony, Genesis/Urban Habitat - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Carol Crooks, LIFETIME - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Craig Thomas Yates, Marin County Committee on Disabilities - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Ledie Lamdberg, Genesis - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Beverly Williams, ACORN - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Maria Alcalá, ACORN - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Hale Zucas - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Scott Peterson, Oak Metro Chamber of Commerce – spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Jose Luis Moscovich, San Francisco Transportation Authority – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Bill Charnean, ACORN - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Wendy Jackson, East Oakland Community Project - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Dennis Fay, Alameda County Congestion Management Agency – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Ben Tripousis, City of San Jose Mayor Reed’s office – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions and with emphasis on additional investment on BART to San Jose.
- Manuel Flores, Carpenters Local 22 – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Patricia Rocha, Bay Area PLAN – spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Dan Cope, Local 22 – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Paul Cohen, Northern California Carpenters – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.

- Reverend Charles Lerringo, Genesis - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Lindsay Imai, Urban Habitat - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- James P. Malveaux, Carpenters Local 22 – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Vanessa Sadueste, student - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Noble (Rocky) Brosey - spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Ken Kirkey, ABAG – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions, and investment in Priority Development areas.
- Joseph Cruz, California Alliance for Jobs – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Jerry Grace – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions.
- Razu Engen, Transit Justice Project– spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Bob Allen Sr., Former BART Director – spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Bob Allen Jr. Urban Habitat – spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Mo Dotche, Local 713 – spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Marcia Lovelace, Genesis – spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Len Conley, Friends of BRT – spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Merri Mitchell, Neighborhood Network – spoke in opposition of the above named resolutions and expressed disagreement in not using money to fund public transit.
- Dave Snyder, SPUR – spoke in favor of the above named resolutions, and Trans Bay Terminal.

After receipt of public comment, the Commission approved the following Resolution Nos. 3875, Revised and 3885 and 3888 as presented except to delete Attachment D of Resolution No. 3885 with one no from Commissioner Bates on the BART Oakland Airport Connector as a recipient of funds. Attachment D of Resolution No. 3885 is to return to the Commission for consideration at their March 25, 2009 meeting, with a report on if and how regional priorities should be established for all federal discretionary programs listed in the ARRA.

The Commission unanimously approved the following:

- Resolution Nos. 3667, Revised, 3711, Revised and 3833, Revised – Regional Measure 2 (RM2) and Regional Measure 1 (RM1) Capital Funds: Proposed allocation of approximately \$190 million.

Legislation Committee – Rubin

The Commission unanimously approved the following:

- Federal Transportation Authorization Principles.

Closed Session

The Commission anticipated having a Closed Session; however this was postponed until next Commission meeting scheduled for March 25, 2009.

PUBLIC COMMENT/ADJOURNMENT/NEXT MEETING

There being no further business or public comment, Commission Chair Dodd adjourned the meeting at 1:35 p.m. The next Commission meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, March 25, 2009, in Oakland, California.

Scott Haggerty, Chair