



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Bill Dodd, Chair
Napa County and Cities

Scott Haggerty, Vice Chair
Alameda County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Dean J. Cbu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Amy Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Vacant
City and County of San Francisco

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director,
Bay Area Toll Authority

Therese W. McMillan
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

**MINORITY CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Minutes – December 9, 2008**

Attendance

The meeting was called to order at 3:27 p.m. Those in attendance were Chair James McGhee and Harvey Louie of San Francisco County; Vice Chair Darnell Turner and Michael Rubiano of Contra Costa County; Vice Chair Randi Kinman and Dawn Love, Low Income representatives; Jacquee Castain and Carlos Castellanos of Alameda County; Raphael Durr and Charles Rivasplata of Marin County; Gerald Rico of Napa County; William Allen and Carlos Romero of San Mateo County; Michael Lopez of Santa Clara County; and Michael D'Augelli, Native American Representative.

MTC staff in attendance included James Corless, Alea Gage, Pam Grove, Georgia Lambert, Denise Rodrigues, Ursula Vogler and Jennifer Yeamans. Bob Planthold, Advisory Council Chair, and Lindsay Imai from Urban Habitat were also in attendance.

Meeting Minutes

The Nov. 20, 2008 meeting minutes were approved with two abstentions and with the following addition to the "Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis Initial Results" section, to be added just before the last sentence: "Additionally, per capita income/transportation increases are not in sync with housing cost escalation in the Bay Area."

Chair's Report

Chair McGhee congratulated Vice Chair Darnell Turner, who was elected president of the board of directors of the mental health district in Contra Costa County, and Carlos Romero, who was elected to the East Palo Alto City Council. Chair McGhee explained that he missed the Nov. 20 meeting because he was in Los Angeles at a conference called by the governor, a "professional achievement consumer trust" summit, for all of the boards and commissions appointed by the Governor or the Assembly and Senate. Over 3,500 attended the conference, and there were various workshops and speakers.

Elections for 2009 Officers

Bill Allen inquired about a potential conflict of interest in serving on both MCAC and the San Mateo Distribution of Funds panel. MCAC Liaison Pam Grove stated while MTC's attorney is the arbiter regarding conflict of interest, because MCAC is not the actual decision-making body on financial issues for MTC there is probably no conflict.

- over -

Elections for 2009 Officers (continued)

Carlos Castellanos, Nominating Committee Chair, announced the candidates for Chair and Vice Chair and asked for any further nominations from the floor. There were none. Ballots were distributed with James McGhee and Carlos Romero running for the Chair position and Carlos Castellanos and Darnell Turner running for the two Vice Chair positions. Mr. Romero and Mr. McGhee each gave a brief statement and the ballots were collected. Results were tallied and it was announced that Mr. McGhee was re-elected as Chair and Mr. Castellanos and Mr. Turner were elected as Vice Chairs.

MCAC Member Reports

High School Internship Subcommittee: Subcommittee Vice Chair Michael D'Augelli reported that Ann Macaulay, MTC staff, gave an update on recruitment plans for internship positions for MTC's 2009 high school summer internship program. Letters were sent asking agencies to consider hiring high school students and suggesting they should hire one or more additional students paid from their own funds, which appears to be a good possibility based on feedback. January 19 is the deadline for agencies to request an intern through MTC or add additional internships through their own funding. MCAC members are asked to submit community contacts to MTC staff to include in the database of organizations receiving information on the internship positions. Subcommittee chair Jacquie Castain reiterated that the subcommittee is working to ensure there are students hired in all nine Bay Area counties. Mr. Allen commended the subcommittee and recommended that recruitment information be sent to county one-stops. The subcommittee report was accepted.

Advisory Council: Chair McGhee suggested that since Bob Planthold, Advisory Council chair, was present, perhaps he should comment on the events of the last Advisory Council meeting. Mr. Planthold said that during the November meeting the Advisory Council adopted a Work Plan that was mostly conceptual. After he and the vice chair reviewed it, they looked at the MCAC format and approach, and decided to reformat the Advisory Council Work Plan content similarly (using MCAC's Work Plan as a model) to make it more structured, organized and readable. He complimented MCAC on their Work Plan and thanked the committee for its work. In connection with the Obama plan, Mr. Planthold stated he is one of a small group of people that Caltrans is working with to develop a negotiating position on what the State wants in terms of money and priorities for federal dollars coming from this program. While this will not be discussed in a public meeting, he stated that when he receives the topics and the agenda, he will forward it to MTC staff and MCAC officers for additional comments.

Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis Initial Results

Mr. Castellanos, Transportation 2035 subcommittee chair, summarized the subcommittee's comments on the Equity Analysis results and requested comments and approval from MCAC members so a memo can be finalized and forwarded to the Planning Committee at its December 12 meeting. He reminded the committee that the purpose of the Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis is to evaluate whether the Bay Area's low-income and minority communities of

Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis Initial Results (continued)

concern share equitably in the benefits of the Transportation 2035 Plan without bearing a disproportionate share of the burdens. He then went over the main points of the draft memo included in the committee's packet.

Mr. Romero commented that while he, Mr. Castellanos and Ms. Grove had worked to come up with some of the language in the draft memo, he felt that the second sentence in the third paragraph of the memo is not correct. He cannot speak for what has happened in past RTPs and feels the sentence should be revised. In addition, he asked if the committee felt it should take a position on the overall findings of the Equity Analysis, whether it is one of support, non-support or neutral. Mr. Castellanos responded that based upon his knowledge, a recommendation one way or the other is not necessarily required, but instead the memo could inform the Planning Committee about the process. He then asked MTC staff if they could give an opinion on the subject. MTC Senior Planner James Corless commented that he felt the spirit of the drafted memo to the Planning Committee is fine, but MCAC might want to refine their comments into bullet-point recommendations on the Equity Analysis report and some specific recommendations for future equity analyses.

MTC planner Jennifer Yeamans reminded MCAC that staff will be forwarding to the Planning Committee five preliminary conclusions of the Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis: 1) there were greater RTP expenditures per low-income households than other households (financial analysis); 2) most indicators show similar or greater benefit accruing to low-income households and communities of concern than the remainder of region (distributional test); 3) communities of concern have greater accessibility overall, but also the "accessibility gap" between auto and transit is narrowing; 4) bigger benefits come from more compact land use (increasing accessibility) and technology (reducing emissions) than just the transportation investments alone; and 5) the affordability measure proved difficult to forecast. Ms. Yeamans stated that if there is input or comments on these five preliminary conclusions that staff will advance to the Planning Committee, MCAC should definitely comment directly on those.

Ms. Castain expressed concern that demographics/income levels used as forecasts in the Equity Analysis are unrealistic and that previous projections of new businesses and higher-end jobs related to transit-oriented development in communities of concern have not materialized. Mr. Castellanos commented that the subcommittee is hoping that different kinds of analyses, such as the snapshot analysis, will give a better and more realistic picture of the communities of concern.

Ms. Kinman stated that the third paragraph should be the primary focus of the memo. At the end of the first paragraph in MCAC's draft memo to the Planning Committee, under Financial Analysis, Mr. Romero recommended adding: "*Without such data, it is difficult for MCAC to accept the finding.*" Ms. Kinman moved to accept the subcommittee's draft memo with three changes: 1) move the third paragraph to the top of the memo; 2) replace the second sentence in that same paragraph with language commending staff for their work and their openness in working with the subcommittee; and 3) add the sentence suggested by Mr. Romero to the end of the Financial Analysis section. The motion was seconded and approved.

Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis Initial Results (continued)

Ms. Imai of Urban Habitat commended MCAC on their work on the Equity Analysis and said that she will be presenting Urban Habitat's position to the Planning Committee on Dec. 12 as well. She mentioned that a lot of their comments are in agreement with MCAC, but they also highlight the lack of any project alternatives being compared for the Equity Analysis. Mr. Allen requested that Urban Habitat's comments be made available for the next subcommittee meeting.

Means-Based Transit Fare Discount Pilot Program Update

Alea Gage and Jennifer Yeamans presented the results of a recent survey of existing fare discount programs in the region and provided a status update on the proposed regional means-based transit fare discount pilot program. Currently for those transit operators that do provide either free or discounted fares, it amounts to about a 3% discount. A draft white paper with more information will be presented to the Lifeline Subcommittee in January. Mr. D'Augelli suggested that one pass for all transit agencies is needed and Ms. Gage said the plan is to integrate any fare discount program with TransLink[®]. Mr. Allen wanted clarification of the number used to define "low-income" for purposes of fare discount programs. In addition there is a growing number of "working poor" who do not use social services, and some thought should be given as to how to distribute fare discounts to those individuals. He also suggested a survey of non-transit riders be done to ascertain why they are not riding transit. Ms. Kinman wanted to ensure that developers (who as part of giveaways in their development of low-income housing are supposed to provide eco passes) do not benefit from any pilot or long-term discount program. She also commented that the missing element for her is the goal of the program (is it to boost ridership, is it to get elderly people who should no longer be driving out of their cars). There could be multiple goals, and she recommends flexibility in deciding what the goals should be.

Staff Report

Ms. Grove went over her staff report in the packet. She mentioned there will be another Joint Advisory Committee workshop (date to be determined) and reminded MCAC members to complete their ethics training via the online course or at the December 17th ABAG training from 9 to 11 a.m. at the MetroCenter Auditorium (additional details were available in the packet).

Other Business/Public Comment

Mr. D'Augelli inquired about stipend reimbursement for outreach activities, and Ms. Grove replied that she would inquire as to what was eligible. Ms. Imai distributed the latest edition of Urban Habitat's publication "Race, Poverty & the Environment," a journal for social and environmental justice, and announced she would have guest passes available for their "State of the Region" event to be held on Dec. 15 if any MCAC members would like to attend.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:15 p.m. Next meeting is January 13, 2009. *(Note: The January 2009 meeting was subsequently canceled; the next meeting of MCAC is February 10, 2009.)*

