



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov  
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

*Bill Dodd, Chair*  
Napa County and Cities

*Scott Haggerty, Vice Chair*  
Alameda County

*Tom Ammiano*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*Dean J. Cbu*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Dave Cortese*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Dorene M. Giacopini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sue Lempert*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Jon Rubin*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Adrienne J. Tissier*  
San Mateo County

*Amy Worth*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Ken Yeager*  
Santa Clara County

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director,  
Bay Area Toll Authority

*Therese W. McMillan*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

**MINORITY CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**  
**Minutes – October 14, 2008**

**Attendance**

The meeting was called to order at 3:35 p.m. Those in attendance were Chair James McGhee of San Francisco County; Vice Chair Darnell Turner and Michael Rubiano of Contra Costa County; Jacquee Castain and Carlos Castellanos of Alameda County; Raphael Durr and Charles Rivasplata of Marin County; Gerald Rico of Napa County; Harvey Louie of San Francisco; William Allen and Carlos Romero of San Mateo County; Dawn Love, Low Income Representative; and Michael D'Augelli, Native American Representative.

Michael Lopez of Santa Clara County and Randi Kinman, Low Income Representative, were excused.

MTC staff in attendance were Jacob Avidon, Pam Grove, Valerie Knepper and Georgia Lambert.

**Meeting Minutes**

The minutes from the September 9, 2008 meeting were approved.

**Chair's Report**

Chair McGhee reported that he attended the San Francisco Lifeline project selection meeting, where he lobbied for funding of Bayview/Hunters Point minority projects. He believes that four applications will be funded at the level requested, and he stressed that MCAC members should make an extra effort to attend meetings in their areas. Regarding the Advisory Council, Chair McGhee said that he and Cathy Jackson, Advisory Council business representative, will be working on DBE together, pursuing stronger outreach for the program. Ms. Jackson has been invited to attend MCAC DBE subcommittee meetings. Chair McGhee stated that pursuant to current legislation, minority firms in California (especially African-American, Latino and Native Alaskan firms) are all doing less than 1 percent business with the State of California. Prior to the legislation, they were doing closer to 25 percent. Professional service contracts also need to be reviewed because everyone is not a contractor, he added.

Other MCAC members who have been asked to participate in the Lifeline project selection for their counties include Bill Allen, Dawn Love and Charles Rivasplata. Mr. Rivasplata said the Marin County meeting is in the process of being scheduled and he will attend.

**Chair's Report** (continued)

Mr. Allen gave the following report on the San Mateo County project selection process: “Four applicants were measured by five evaluators against six scoring criteria (Project Need, Community-Based Transportation, Implementation Plan, Project Budget/Sustainability, Coordination and Program Outreach, Cost-Effectiveness and Performance Indicators). The objective and measurements were clear in better serving those most in need. Most rewarding was making a difference in lowering cost to meet the allowable budget. There was a positive impact to both community and individuals while allocating funds to match where MCAC is acutely aware of greatest need. I debated (and was supported by all team members) funding for Lifeline. This achievement can therefore be shown as a positive task completed in both Lifeline and MCAC's goals.”

Mr. Allen also stated that MCAC should make sure that an MCAC member is attending each project selection meeting. For those counties where MCAC does not have a representative presently, when we do obtain a member, we should advise him/her of what the other counties have accomplished, and show them (or advise them through minutes or a handout) what has happened in that county. In addition, any member who attends a project selection meeting should make a report to the full MCAC.

Ms. Love attended the Alameda County Lifeline project selection meeting. There were 14 applicants, and areas with gaps in service were filled. Everyone agreed on priorities and it was a great turnout. Mr. Romero agreed the goal should be to close the gaps identified in the Community-Based Transportation Plans. Mr. Allen said that cost-effectiveness, community and individual needs were considered first in San Mateo County.

**MCAC Report to the Commission and 2008-09 Work Plan**

Chair McGhee called on subcommittee chairs to give a report of their activities and their proposed Work Plan items.

**High School Internship Subcommittee:** Ms. Castain reported the subcommittee has reviewed the proposed Work Plan and is presenting it for approval. They are working to expand the number of applicants. She, Mr. Louie and Candy Gayles, former MCAC member, were invited by the San Francisco School District to participate in a community partnership celebration. The School District commended MTC's internship program and they were interested in future placement of some of their engineering academy students in the program. They had 147 interns with 62 businesses in partnership with them, and Mr. Louie said the program has built a lot of momentum. There is hope that MTC will become a partner in their program.

**Lifeline Subcommittee:** Vice Chair Darnell Turner stated that the Lifeline Subcommittee met to work on goals for the Work Plan. The subcommittee came up with three items: 1) participate in county-level congestion management agency selection process for the Lifeline funds with a measurable objective to select an MCAC representative, if available, to participate in the selection process for each county that has a Lifeline call for projects and to provide feedback for future project selection; 2) become more familiar with the Lifeline program and its projects in order to offer comments and suggestions to MCAC, with the measurable objective of organizing

at least two Lifeline site visits for committee members, similar to the August 5 Bayview/Hunters Point visit; 3) participate in the creation of the Lifeline program evaluation, with the measurable objective of assisting MTC staff in determining if the program is achieving its goals.

**Transportation 2035 Subcommittee:** Mr. Castellanos said the group met in September and came up with three goals for the work plan. One of the objectives is to submit comments and feedback to MTC on the equity analysis. The second goal is to assist MTC in updating contact data for minority media, faith-based organizations, and community groups for future RTP outreach. Mr. Castellanos stated that since the current subcommittee would be ending at the end of the comment period for Transportation 2035 (February 2009), the third item is the formation of a new subcommittee to explore possible improvements to the equity analysis methodology for future RTPs. The new committee (which could include outside participation) would begin now to explore future methodology for long-range analysis, options for short-range “snapshot” analysis, and track future issues related to equity, such as HOT-lane revenues. A status report would be presented to MCAC by July 2009.

**Contracting/DBE Subcommittee:** Chair McGhee reported that since Proposition 209, minority participation in contracts has declined dramatically. The DBE workshop organized by the subcommittee and MTC staff in December 2007 was poorly attended, and a November 2008 workshop is being planned with increased outreach to various agencies. He believes creative thinking within the law is needed to open up additional opportunities for minorities. Mr. Allen requested a change to the language on one DBE Subcommittee work plan item to make it less negative. Upon discussion, the committee approved the language as follows: “Continue to focus on ways to make the bidding process more accessible to minority and small contractors.”

It was moved and seconded to approve the 2008-09 MCAC Work Plan as modified above. The motion carried.

### **TransLink<sup>®</sup> Update**

Jacob Avidon, staff member with MTC’s Traveler Coordination and Information department, provided a TransLink<sup>®</sup> program overview. When fully implemented, Bay Area transit riders will be able to use a single, reloadable TransLink<sup>®</sup> smart card to ride any transit system in the nine-county region. Full deployment is expected by 2012. Mr. Rubiano inquired how the program’s profits would be applied. Mr. Avidon said that the savings produced by TransLink<sup>®</sup> are not expected to be significant, and transit agencies retain sole domain of fare policies. Mr. Castellanos inquired about senior and youth fares. Mr. Avidon said eligible passengers must have specially coded cards showing their birth date. Some form of fraud prevention is needed to verify birth dates and get the cards to youth. Mr. Louie asked if rear boarding will be allowed with the TransLink<sup>®</sup> card, and Mr. Avidon replied proof-of-payment inspectors will check all passengers. Mr. Allen suggested MCAC follow-up on obtaining TransLink<sup>®</sup> cards at a discount for low-income families, students and seniors. It was suggested to Vice Chair Turner that this be included as a future goal for the Lifeline subcommittee. Mr. Romero suggested that MTC promote subsidized fares by transit agencies. Mr. Avidon said that TransLink<sup>®</sup> is a powerful tool for fare-collecting and creates opportunities that were previously unavailable. The transit agencies should explore ways to leverage the technology to make fares less complicated.

**Staff Report**

Ms. Grove went over her staff report in the packet and said that the Transportation 2035 Joint Advisor Workshop will be held on October 24 at 10 a.m. in the MTC auditorium. MCAC members need to participate in ethics training via either an online course or at the ABAG training center in the MetroCenter on December 17 (further information was available in the packet). MCAC members were invited to attend MTC's biennial Excellence in Motion awards ceremony on October 22 at the Oakland Museum. A letter from the attorney general to MTC regarding the Draft Environmental Impact Report for the Transportation 2035 Plan was distributed at the request of Vice Chair Turner.

MTC is currently in a recruitment period for the several advisory committee vacancies. MCAC, EDAC and the Advisory Council each have at least one vacancy, and applications will be taken through November 10.

Because of the Veterans Day holiday on November 11, the next MCAC meeting has been rescheduled for Thursday, November 20 at 3:15. Vice Chair Turner will chair the meeting as Chair McGhee is unable to attend. Nominations for chair and vice chair will be taken at the November meeting, with elections to be held in December.

**Other Business/Public Comment**

Ms. Love announced that handouts regarding Measure VV were available, and she urged MCAC members to attend the *Vote Yes on VV* meeting on October 15.

**Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 5:30 p.m. Next meeting will be November 20, 2008.