



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

MTC Advisory Council
October 8, 2008
Minutes

Bob Planthold called the meeting to order at 12:37 p.m. In attendance were members John Cockle, Angela Colombo, Raphael Durr, David Grant, Mary Griffin, William Hastings, Richard Hedges, Kathryn Hughes, Cathy Jackson, Sherman Lewis, Xiao-Yun Lu, James McGhee, Eli Naor, Margaret Okuzumi, Michael Pechner, and Don Rothblatt.

Minutes

The minutes were approved unanimously.

Public Comment

Ms. Faye Smothers, Aura Management Consulting, commented on Business Outreach, and expressed her concern with transit agency's practices in terms of how they bid out and administer their programs. She stated that until they start addressing this issue, agencies will continue to get the lack of reaction from the small businesses. She also commented that the transit agencies need to be monitored by the MTC, and tie it to the dollar allocations to be administered properly.

Staff Report

Ms. Therese Knudsen briefly commented on the State Budget and directed the committee to look at details on MTC's website.

She also noted that Rail-Volution, a conference for practitioners that focus on the role of land use and transit as equal partners in creating livable communities will take place in San Francisco from October 26-30, 2008.

The Joint Advisors Workshop will be held on Friday, October 24, 2008, from 10am – noon, MTC's Auditorium.

Lastly, there will be an ethics training that all advisors need to attend to be certified. It can be done online at: <http://localethics.fppc.ca.gov/login.aspx>, or attend an in-person ABAG course on December 17, 2008 from 9am – 11am, MTC's Auditorium.

Mr. Richards Hedges commented on Rail-Volution and noted that two members from one of the Advisory Council's, along with James Corless, will be making a presentation based on accessible Transit-Oriented Development.

Report from the Minority Citizens Advisory Committee (MCAC); Report from the Elderly and Disabled Advisory Committee (EDAC)

Mr. Richard Hedges stated that EDAC had a presentation on the budget, where Mr. Hedges asked for a future report on what the Steinberg bill 395 will do.

Mr. James McGhee stated that MCAC is concentrating on finishing the subcommittee reports for the Commission.

Business Outreach – Follow Up from Sept. Meeting

Ms. Cathy Jackson opened up the discussion to hear more about how the committee can move forward in working with some of the business owners in the region. She stated that the committee needs to communicate with businesses in general on how to better communicate with MTC.

Committee comments include:

- On pollutants – how much do businesses emit and what can they do?
- How can businesses get certified? What is the certification process?
- Outreach does not mean it is effective unless people understand where and how they can benefit from the program or feel they will be heard when they apply
- Support for the North Bay Leadership Council, who is holding an Economic Insight Conference on November 19, 2008 at the Sheraton in Petaluma. It will focus on AB32 implementation. There will be some recommendations for businesses on what they can do, when they have to start, etc.
- New bidders need to be informed of the certification process.
- The proposal structure – need a breakdown of how it looks (i.e. expectations of agency issuing the bid, what needs to be included in submittal materials, etc.)
- “Experienced bidders” – this is a barrier. Proposals get ranked on experience when that is not listed as a criterion
- How can labor help?
- Outreach is not the problem – need to restructure how you put proposals out, especially to get small businesses involved
- Small businesses should have equal parity.

Ms. Jackson noted that there is a Town meeting set up with Congresswoman Barbara Lee on October 30, 2008. She also noted that Senator Boxer approached the small businesses to ask what their needs are as they relate to transportation.

She stated that if the committee needs to start by having a couple of topics, she suggested looking at procurement, climate change, and transportation-related projects and its impact on business.

Transportation 2035 Plan Update

Ms. Ashley Nguyen updated the committee with the latest Transportation 2035 planning activities, and gave a recap on the Commission's decisions in July, and work that's underway

with regards to both the RTP and environmental documents. She also summarized the next steps that will be happening over the next couple of months, and where staff would like to see the committee get involved in the T2035 planning effort.

She stated that there will be a Joint Advisors Workshop on October 24, 2008, which staff will share the results of the T2035 performance analysis, and then discuss what kind of bold and specific steps can the region take to get at closing the gaps - what can be done at the climate front - what can be done on the VMT front – what are some specific things that staff can explore beyond the T2035 Plan.

She also stated that through the month of October and early November, staff will be meeting with the Partnership Board, and Partnership Technical Advisory Committee to solicit their thoughts. The feedback received from them and the Advisory Council will be brought to the Planning Committee in November for their input and insight on the specific strategies that staff can work on.

Lastly, she commented on a letter from the Attorney General's Office, which commented on MTC's Environmental Impact Report. She noted that they sent out a number of letters starting back in early 2007 to a number of cities/counties and MPO's in California honing on the point about the importance of climate change and assessing climate change in the environmental impact assessment. Staff has been thinking about ways to address AB32 and more recently the passage of SB375, and how climate works within the plan and environmental assessment.

Committee comments include:

- There is contradiction between the fairly massive investments in highway expansion projects that are in the committed list, and the commitment to global warming gases. Like to see if MTC is willing to admit that the highway expansions are going to increase vehicle miles traveled and increase emissions.
- How does the performance of the RTP compare to the presentation last fall of the challenges analysis? Response: In terms of each of the performance targets set out - the plan itself does not do enough to close the gap.
- Air quality analysis – road projects never show impact. Look at past projections to see how it measures up with reality
- The recent financial crisis is not reflected in the assumptions – suggest staff to revisit.
- Investing in transit makes better use of the existing infrastructure and helps reduce the overall need for new investment.
- HOV use fees would be better spent on rail transit.
- If MTC sticks to its vision or strategy it may be priced out of the market, and some things may lag behind. Staff may need to revisit.

Goods Movement/Land Use Study Update

Ms. Carolyn Clevenger updated the committee on Goods Movement. She stated that the study focuses on two major corridors: 1) I-880 from Richmond to Fremont, and 2) US 101 from the San Francisco/San Mateo County line to SFO. The first phase identified and mapped key goods movement businesses in the study corridors and identified those currently at risk from land use policies. The second phase analyzed the current and future supply and demand of goods movements businesses and assesses how their displacement due to local land use policies impacts the transportation network.

She stated that the goods movement industries for the purpose of this study are: 1) industries to which goods movement is of high or mid-level importance to their operations and to their location decision; and 2) industries that are industrial land uses with demand for industrial land and building space.

Ms. Clevenger summarized the key findings, which are 1) central area industrial land supply is declining and under increasing market pressures, and 2) shortages of industrial land result in the outward dispersion of industrial activities. She also summarized the impacts, which include displacement of about 87,000 good-paying blue/green collar goods movement-related jobs; increased travel distances and approximately 300,000 more truck miles traveled on regional routes; 8,400 truck trips per day shifted including over 6,100 in I-580; more truck emissions that degrade air quality including a roughly 2 percent increase in PM10 and PM2.5 emissions; and, higher transportation costs to businesses resulting in higher costs of goods estimated at \$1.2 million/day (2008 \$).

In conclusion, she stated that staff and its consultants will be developing specific strategies that could be pursued to address goods movement business displacement.

Committee comments include:

- As staff shares information with CMAs and local jurisdiction regarding the budget – suggest including private industry.
- Suggest going back to rail going into the port and eliminate the trucks to the port. – Not economical to move by rail unless you are travelling 500 -700 miles.
- Will the 87,000 jobs end up in another area of the metropolitan area? Response: these are jobs that will end up outside of the metropolitan area.
- Concerned that the projections are for many more truck miles traveled – suggest that the results of the study be incorporated into the T2035 planning process. The study was done off-model. Will be a supplemental report to the RTP.
- There is conflict with Transit Oriented Development on BART lines
- What do you do with local government – adjacent land-use conflict
- There will be pollution for all of Oakland
- Loop back with Caltrans to get the message out
- Stockton is actively courting business and industry. Could look at what others are doing.

Advisory Council 2009 Work Plan

Mr. Bob Planthold requested committee input on the 2009 Work Plan.

Committee comments include

- The committee needs to get started on the transportation land use, and suggested scheduling a meeting with James Corless or other planning staff. (Subcommittee meeting is already scheduled)
- Business outreach and economic pricing should be a priority.
- Need to integrate Part I and II in an outlined fashion.
- Would like to discuss subsidized parking structures.
- Include AB32 to the list.
- Request the committee to re-evaluate the financial crisis.

- Instead of a Part I and II – suggest having approximately five big items with 2-3 focused projects.
- Part I can reflect the major titles. Part II can reflect the subcommittee work plan.
- Add economics and pricing reform to Part 1.
- Change the plan to a 2 year work plan.
- On Part I combine Transportation/Land Use and Improving transit performance and convenience.

The committee asked staff to combine Part I and II of the workplan for the next meeting.

Other Business/Public Comment

There was no other business. The next meeting of the Advisory Council is scheduled for November 12, 2008. The meeting was adjourned at 2:28 p.m.