



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov

Bill Dodd, Chair
Napa County and Cities

Scott Haggerty, Vice Chair
Alameda County

Tom Ammiano
City and County of San Francisco

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Bob Blanchard
Sonoma County and Cities

Dean Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Amy Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Andrew Fremier
Deputy Executive Director,
Bay Area Toll Authority

Therese W. McMillan
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

**Programming and Allocations Committee
June 11, 2008
Minutes**

Chairperson Tissier called the meeting to order at 10:34 a.m. Other Commissioners present were Commissioners Ammiano, Bates, Chu, Dodd, Giacomini, Haggerty, Kinsey, Lempert, Rubin, Sartipi, Worth and Yeager.

Consent Calendar

The Committee approved the following consent items:

- *Minutes of May 14, 2008 meeting as submitted.*
- *FY 2008-09 State Transit Assistance (STA) Regional Discretionary Program. MTC Resolution No. 3858.*
- *Allocation of FY 2008-09 Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds to County Auditors and to MTC (\$12.5 million). MTC Resolution No. 3848.*
- *Allocation of \$18.7 million in FY 2007-08 Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds to Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA) for transit operating. MTC Resolution No. 3810, Revised.*
- *2007 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Amendment 2007-25. MTC Resolution No. 3755, Revised.*
- *Proposed allocation of \$12.2 million in RM2 Capital funds. MTC Resolution Nos. 3722, Revised, and 3739, Revised.*

Chair Tissier requested that Item 4d under Regional Programming be heard first, in the interest of time for the commissioners as well as speakers.

Regional Programming

- *Resolution 3434 Strategic Plan*

Alix Bockelman, Programming and Allocations, gave a background on the Resolution 3434, the region's transit expansion program and the direction from the Committee to develop a Strategic Plan. Kenneth Folan, Programming and Allocations, presented the draft 2008 Strategic Plan including staff recommendations. Steve Heminger, Executive Director, provided an additional explanation on the logic behind the projects being placed in 4 tiers.

Speaker Mark Green, Mayor of Union City, voiced his strong opposition of the proposed shift of \$91 million from Dumbarton Rail to the BART to Warm Springs project.

Speaker Jim Bigelow, Redwood City, San Mateo County and Menlo Park Chambers, expressed his support for the Dumbarton Rail and opposition of the shift of \$91 million from Dumbarton Rail to the BART to Warm Springs project.

Speaker Rich Hedges, MTC Advisory Council and EDAC, spoke on his support of the Dumbarton Rail and his frustration with local transportation funds going to BART.

Speaker Paul Shepherd, Cargill Salt, listed his reasons of opposition, including his disappointment at how these funds were being re-allocated.

Speaker Mary King, AC Transit, thanked staff for their support, and recommendation to close the funding gap on the International/Telegraph Avenue BRT project.

Speaker Kathy Mayo, BART, reminded the committee that the BART extension to Warm Springs project has been part of the region's transit vision since 1989, and was very grateful that the staff recommendation closes the funding gap and identifies a strategy to deliver the project.

Speaker Stuart Cohen, TALC, recommended that the strategic plan not be rushed, and instead happen continuously as project needs dictate.

Chair Tissier voiced her concern on the open-ended questions and issues. She indicated she would like to know more about the state of readiness for the Dumbarton Rail project.

Commissioner Lempert expressed her support for the Dumbarton Rail project. She reminded the committee and staff that the RM2 funds being shifted were approved by the voters. She asked that staff delay this decision. She does not support the strategic plan and encouraged other commissioners to not support it.

Commissioner Chu, Cities of Santa Clara County, noted that although the staff recommendation will delay Dumbarton Rail, it is enabling another project, BART to Warm Springs, to be completed. He also noted a Santa Clara County Grand Jury report released last week recommending VTA cease funding the Dumbarton Rail project.

Commissioner Yeager, Santa Clara County, thanked staff for their commitment to delivering projects, and voiced VTA's continued support of the BART to Warm Springs and Silicon Valley project.

Commissioner Bates, Alameda County, described a citizen initiative that could require a vote of the residents before the AC Transit BRT can be implemented in Berkeley.

Commissioner Haggerty, Alameda County, expressed appreciation to staff for undergoing this very difficult process. He pointed out the commitment of the residents of Santa Clara County when implementing a tax to raise money for the BART project.

Commissioner Kinsey, Marin County, asked Steve Heminger to clarify the distinct difference between the BART to Warm Springs and the BART to San Jose projects, and if the Warm Springs BART will be operational while the San Jose BART is being built. Steve answered that there is a possibility that the Warm Springs will be operational before the San Jose is built, but it also could be built concurrently.

Commissioner Kinsey further inquired of staff's intentions for July adoption of the strategic plan to be specifically implemented in the draft RTP. Steve answered that yes, staff is trying to synchronize the strategic plan with the RTP.

Chair Tissier directed staff to provide a more clear state of readiness for the BART to Warm Springs as well as Dumbarton Rail projects if the strategic plan was to return to the July committee meeting.

Commissioner Worth, Contra Costa County Cities, recognized that there is a cash flow issue on regional projects. She pointed out that projects become ready at different times. She does not feel that this recommendation diminishes the commitment to voters. She asked staff to provide more information on how funds in the future can fulfill other projects such as Dumbarton Rail.

Commissioner Lempert would like to see how staff plans on replenishing the funds to the Dumbarton Rail. Relying on the RTIP until 2020 is a long delay. She suggested that staff find another way to fund BART to Warm Springs instead of taking money for Dumbarton Rail.

Commissioner Haggerty also shared his desire to have more information on the state of readiness for all projects, especially Dumbarton Rail.

State Programming

- *Transportation Development Act (TDA) Fund Allocations. MTC Resolution Nos. 3849, 3850 and 3851.*

Bob Bates, Programming and Allocations, presented a recommendation to allocate \$78.8 million in FY 2008-09 Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds, \$4.3 million in State Transit Assistance (STA) funds and \$34.0 million in Assembly Bill (AB) 1107 funds to various claimants in the region.

The Committee approved the staff recommendation to refer MTC Resolution Nos. 3849, 3850 and 3851 to the Commission for approval, with no objection.

Regional Programming

- *Regional Measure 2: Proposed Program and Allocations for FY 2008-09 Operating Assistance. MTC Resolution Nos. 3853, 3674, Revised and 3863.*

Christina Verdin, Programming and Allocations gave a brief overview of the annual Regional Measure 2 (RM2) operating support budget, which provides the framework for RM2 operating allocations during the upcoming fiscal year. Staff proposed \$3.7 million in FY 2008-09 operating allocations.

The Committee approved the staff recommendation to refer MTC Resolution Nos. 3853, 3674, Revised and 3863 to the Commission for approval, with no objection.

- *Programming of FY 2008-09 5% State Unrestricted Funds and 2% Bridge Toll Revenues. MTC Resolution No. 3861.*

Glen Tepke, Programming and Allocations, gave a presentation on the Five Percent State Unrestricted Fund program, which supports the San Francisco Bay Trail project and the operations of the Alameda/Oakland Ferry, Alameda Harbor Bay Ferry, and Vallejo ferry services. The Two Percent Bridge Tolls are dedicated to ferry capital projects.

Speaker Jerry Grace inquired about the ferries, and Commissioner Bates suggested Jerry talk to Glen Tepke after the meeting to get further information.

Commissioner Kinsey, Marin County, pointed out bike and pedestrian projects are also eligible under this program, and yet staff is not recommending the requested minor increase for the Bay Trail planning process.

Kinsey moved the recommendation to give Bay Trail an increase of \$5,000. Commissioner Lempert seconded motion.

- *Station Area Planning Grant Recommendations.*

Doug Johnson, Planning, presented a proposed list of \$7.5 million Station Area Planning projects.

The following speakers noted support of staff's recommendation: 1) Bruce Knopf, City of Concord; 2) Sean Charpentier, City of East Palo Alto; 3) Kerry Ricketts-Ferris, City of Oakland and 4) Bruce Kibby, City of Cloverdale.

Speaker Tilly Chang, SFCTA, sought reconsideration from the Committee for the \$280,000 Bi-County planning grant application, which was deemed by MTC staff as ineligible.

Speaker Jerry Grace had a question on how much money each station area planning grant would be.

Speaker Stuart Cohen, TALC, expressed his strong support of this program.

Commissioner Ammiano, City and County of San Francisco, asked that staff reconsider the grant application that Tilly Chang, SFCTA referred to and come up with a solution.

Steve Heminger suggested forwarding recommendations to the Commission, while staff research the eligibility question and report back to the Committee.

Commissioner Rubin also voiced his desire for staff to reconsider the eligibility of the Brisbane grant application.

- *California Transportation Commission (CTC) Report*

Alix Bockelman, Programming and Allocations, announced that the Governor appointed a new CTC Commissioner, Lucetta Dunn of Orange County, who is the CEO of the Orange County Business Council.

Public Comment

Speaker Jerry Grace had some announcements for the Committee.

Chair Tissier adjourned the meeting at 12:07 p.m.