



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

DRAFT

**MINORITY CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Minutes – April 8, 2008**

Bill Dodd, Chair
Napa County and Cities

Scott Haggerty, Vice Chair
Alameda County

Tom Ammiano
City and County of San Francisco

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Bob Blanchard
Sonoma County and Cities

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Sperring
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Amy Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director,
Bay Area Toll Authority

Therese W. McMillan
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Attendance

The meeting was called to order at 3:35 p.m. by Chair James McGhee. Those in attendance were Chair James McGhee of San Francisco; Vice Chair Randi Kinman and Dawn Love, Low Income Representatives; Jacquee Castain and Carlos Castellanos of Alameda County; Darnell Turner of Contra Costa County; Raphael Durr and Charles Rivasplata of Marin County; Gerald Rico of Napa County; Eric Shaw of Santa Clara County; William Allen and Carlos Romero of San Mateo County; and Michael D'Augelli, Native American Representative.

Homira Shafaq of Alameda County, Michael Rubiano of Contra Costa County, Harvey Louie of San Francisco, Sheri Lad of San Mateo County and Michael Lopez of Santa Clara County were excused.

MTC employees in attendance were Catalina Alvarado, James Corless, Pam Grove, Therese Knudsen, Georgia Lambert, Denise Rodrigues and Jennifer Yeamans.

Also in attendance were Elizabeth Bent from San Francisco County Transportation Authority, Lindsay Imai from Urban Habitat, and Andrea Banks and Holly Miller from Public Advocates.

Meeting Minutes

The minutes from the March 11, 2008 meeting were approved with a clarification from Carlos Romero. Mr. Romero requested that the section of the minutes under Subcommittee Reports/T2035 Equity Analysis reflect that he pointed out that MCAC's response to the Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis, once it is completed later this year, could be one of approval, disapproval or neutrality.

Chair's Report

Chair McGhee announced that he attended seven meetings last month on behalf of MCAC, including the special MCAC meeting held on March 24 on possible T2035 policy points. The six MCAC policy points created at that meeting were presented at the Joint Advisors Workshop and were integrated into the joint advisor' policy list with, in most cases, the same language. He thanked MCAC for taking the time, effort and commitment to come up with these recommendations to the Commission.

– over –

Committee Structure Recommendations

Chair McGhee stated there remain a few issues before considering the establishment of an MCAC Executive Committee. Because of the full MCAC schedule over the next few months, he agreed with staff that the subject be revisited at a later time, possibly after July. Mr. Allen felt MCAC could make more effective use of its time and might need to delete one of its other subcommittees, since there are a lot of meetings already.

Subcommittee Reports

T2035 Equity Analysis: Subcommittee Chair Carlos Castellanos reported that the subcommittee met on March 18 and April 1. The group is still attempting to get its arms around what the methodology should be and whether there are any recommendations for this equity analysis the subcommittee can make regarding evaluating outcomes. The subcommittee focused on the equity and financial portions, taking the 2030 data and evaluating it in a different way; however, the results were similar, i.e., the analysis showed that communities of concern were not affected substantially more than the overall population. The subcommittee still has concerns that, while inequities are seen and experienced on a daily basis, those inequities don't come out in the model-based analysis. On the equity side, the staff was asked to look at types of jobs that are being categorized to ensure they fit the communities of concern. MTC GIS staff presented a new tool that may be helpful in analyzing data. Mr. Castellanos said the subcommittee will meet again on April 15th and plans to bring an overall recommendation back to the full committee by May.

High School Internship: Ms. Castain reported that the committee will meet in May prior to the regular MCAC meeting. Mr. Allen commented that San Mateo County went from zero to over 100 interested students and 15 applicants, thanks to work by the committee and Ms. Jamila Williams, MTC's college intern who is coordinating the internship program.

Advisory Council: Chair McGhee reported that the Advisory Council also discussed T2035 policy ideas. A separate meeting was scheduled to come up with their top ideas, which were quite similar to MCAC's. Mr. Durr expressed concern about HOT lanes and tying transit funding to toll monies – if there's no toll income, transit would suffer. Mr. Allen commented that HOT lanes could increase single-occupancy vehicles and, therefore, increase pollution. Mr. Romero suggested this issue should be put on a future agenda for further discussion, and Vice Chair Kinman concurred.

DBE Update

Denise Rodrigues reported on the Dec. 12, 2007 Procurement Workshop and Networking event, which was less attended than anticipated. Feedback from the event resulted in updates to the MTC Web site to include information on awarded contracts. A quarterly Contracting Newsletter, including upcoming events and contracting opportunities, local assistance agencies and agency contacts, debuted in March. On April 23, 2008, MTC will host the California Unified Certification Program Public Participation meeting, seeking contractors' and the public's input into the annual DBE availability setting process. Staff also participated in the Cal Mentor Annual Meeting hosted by Caltrans, an event that matches prime contractors with A/E protégés.

DBE Update (continued)

Ms. Rodrigues mentioned a statewide race-conscious disparity study by Caltrans. Chair McGhee requested a copy of the Executive Summary of the disparity study. Vice Chair Turner mentioned that some minority contractors have financial problems in meeting the bond mechanism required in many contracts; and at other times major contractors might sign up minority subcontractors, but there is no mechanism in place to ensure those firms are actually used. Ms. Rodrigues said there is follow-up to see which firms are used and how much was billed by subcontractors. Concern was expressed by various MCAC members that outreach be improved to ensure all minority contractors who are interested in bidding have the opportunity to do so.

Lifeline Program Evaluation

Jennifer Yeamans, MTC planner, reported that MTC staff's evaluation of the interim three-year cycle of the Lifeline Program is concluding. The MCAC Lifeline Subcommittee has been briefed on the draft evaluation report. The two questions being addressed by the evaluation, as requested by the Commission, are what happened with the implementation of the program and, going forward, should the Congestion Management Agencies (CMAs) continue to administer the program. The evaluation found the administration of the program by the CMAs was satisfactory. Ms. Yeamans reported that recommendations included streamlining fund allocation and delivery; revising program guidelines to make the project eligibility and development process clearer; working with MTC advisors and CMAs to develop regionally consistent project monitoring and evaluation criteria to measure progress toward Lifeline goals; pursuing local mobility management strategies throughout the region; and seeking out new, more flexible funding sources. The draft report was included in the MCAC packet. Comments from stakeholders will be accepted until April 18 and should be directed to Ms. Yeamans.

Vice Chair Darnell Turner reported that the Lifeline Subcommittee found that the draft evaluation was an objective and thorough report. The subcommittee recommends that MCAC express two concerns with the Lifeline Program in general:

1. MTC needs to measure improvements to low-income communities as a result of the Lifeline Program – are the gaps in the transportation network being closed as a result of the program?
2. MTC should take a look at the pros and cons of administering the Lifeline Program at the regional vs. the local level.

MCAC member Eric Shaw commented that Ms. Yeamans handout directly responds to the subcommittee's second concern.

The Lifeline Program background was detailed in a handout, and Mr. Corless responded to inquiries from MCAC members about gaps in fixed route transit and the possibility of updating the 2001 Lifeline report.

Lifeline Program Evaluation (Continued)

Ms. Imai of Urban Habitat discussed a letter she sent to MCAC members, also available as a handout at the meeting. She stated that Urban Habitat's evaluation differed from MTC's in that it focused on outcomes of projects. The differences were discussed, and Ms. Imai indicated that Urban Habitat would like to see the CMAs held accountable to more uniformly fill gaps in service in their counties instead of disbursing funds for projects that aren't the most critical.

Following further discussion, Mr. D'Augelli moved to accept the draft report with the two concerns as expressed by the Lifeline Subcommittee. Mr. Allen seconded, adding a friendly amendment to include the issue of accountability at the county level.

The motion passed, 7 to 2.* The MCAC concerns will be forwarded to the Commission. Mr. Corless urged MCAC members to get involved at the county level with the CMAs.

**Note: At the time this vote was taken, there was not a quorum present in the room.*

Mobility and Access Pricing Study

The committee discussed the late time and asked Elizabeth Bent of the San Francisco County Transportation Authority if she would return to the May committee meeting and make her presentation. Ms. Bent graciously agreed.

Community Liaison Officer's Report

Ms. Grove reported that the May T2035 Joint Advisors Workshop has been cancelled, and MCAC members are instead encouraged to attend the T2035 outreach workshop in their county. The next Joint Advisors Workshop is scheduled for Thursday, June 5 at 12:30 p.m. Ms. Grove went over the various forms of T2035 public outreach planned for the month of May. She also reported there were 144 applicants for the High School Internship Program and reminded the committee that nominations are being accepted for MTC's biennial awards program (nominations due May 9). Ms. Grove also gave details about MTC's new Annual Report, the Draft 2009 TIP and future meeting dates for the committee.

Other Business/Public Comment

There was no further business and no further public comment.

Adjournment

Upon discussion by the committee, it was decided to move the meeting start time up to 3:15 p.m. beginning in May 2008. The meeting was adjourned at 5:46 p.m. The next meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, May 13, 2008, beginning at 3:15 p.m.