



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

DRAFT

**MINORITY CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Minutes – March 11, 2008**

Bill Dodd, Chair
Napa County and Cities

Scott Haggerty, Vice Chair
Alameda County

Tom Ammiano
City and County of San Francisco

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Bob Blanchard
Sonoma County and Cities

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsley
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Amy Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director,
Bay Area Toll Authority

Therese W. McMillan
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Attendance

The meeting was called to order at 3:38 p.m. by Chair James McGhee. Those in attendance were Chair James McGhee and Harvey Louie of San Francisco; Vice Chair Randi Kinman and Dawn Love, Low Income Representatives; Carlos Castellanos of Alameda County; Charles Rivasplata of Marin County; Gerald Rico of Napa County; Michael Lopez of Santa Clara County; William Allen and Carlos Romero of San Mateo County; and Michael Daugelli, Native American Representative. Jacquee Castain and Homira Shafaq of Alameda County, Michael Rubiano and Darnell Turner of Contra Costa County and Raphael Durr of Marin County were excused. Ms. Grove, community liaison officer, announced that Marla Harvey, Solano County, had resigned due to an illness in the family.

MTC employees in attendance were Catalina Alvarado, Pam Grove, Georgia Lambert and Jennifer Yeaman.

Also in attendance were Marisa Cravens, ABAG planner; Bob Planthold, MTC Advisory Council Safety representative; Margaret Okuzumi, MTC Advisory Council Transit User representative; Lindsay Imai from Urban Habitat; Candy Gayles, former MCAC member; and Andrea Banks and Holly Miller from Public Advocates.

Meeting Minutes

The minutes from the February 12, 2008 meeting were approved.

Chair's Report

Chair McGhee announced several recommendations regarding the committee structure. He would like to institute an executive committee comprised of the chair, the two vice chairs and the chairs of each subcommittee, which would meet prior to the monthly meetings, working with staff to determine the content of the agenda. He also would like to assign vice chairs to work with the different subcommittees so there is a flow of information and leadership to those subcommittees. In addition, he recommended MCAC meet for two hours, adding 15 minutes to the meeting time – with a meeting starting time of 3:15 p.m. rather than 3:30 p.m.

Chair McGhee noted the T2035 Equity Analysis Subcommittee met on Feb. 19 and elected Carlos Castellanos as chair and Carlos Romero as vice chair.

– over –

Chair's Report (Continued)

Vice Chair Kinman raised the issue of parking in connection with the proposed two-hour meeting time. Staff indicated that they would determine if MCAC members can park in MTC's employee parking lot under the freeway.

Mr. Allen noted that Chair McGhee's recommendations would need to be voted on/ approved by MCAC prior to being implemented. Chair McGhee concurred and it was agreed this would be on next month's agenda.

Subcommittee Reports

Lifeline/EJ: Ms. Grove reported that the subcommittee met on Feb. 26, and Therese Knudsen, MTC staff member, began the meeting with an overview of the Lifeline Transportation Program. Jennifer Yeamans, MTC staff, then led a discussion on the Lifeline program administrative evaluation. Subcommittee members made several suggestions for gaining more employer support surrounding transportation issues and employment (welfare to work) and also commented that cost-benefit information is important to know whether the programs are getting the most for their dollars. Ms. Yeamans also stated that staff's preliminary recommendation is to continue the Congestion Management Agencies' administration of the program, but add some fine-tuning. Subcommittee members wish to ensure that comments from advocates are heard and considered in the process. Staff is currently receiving input from all stakeholders, including MCAC, and should have a draft report on the evaluation program for MCAC's April meeting. The next subcommittee meeting is at 3 p.m. on March 27. All MCAC members are encouraged to RSVP for subcommittee meetings.

T2035 Equity Analysis: Subcommittee Chair Carlos Castellanos reported that the group met on Feb. 19 and elected a chair and vice chair. He said the subcommittee got an update on two options for the affordability measure that was to go to MTC's Commissioners at their Feb. 27 meeting: (1) To proceed with an affordability assessment under the quantitative evaluation (the cost per low-income household served); (2) Not to pursue the quantitative project evaluation due to its restricted application, and instead consider the equity and affordability implications of RTP investments through the qualitative project assessment and analysis of RTP investment packages. He provided an update, reporting that on Feb. 27, the Commission voted on a blended approach.

Mr. Castellanos also reported that Paul Fassinger, ABAG planner, discussed how data is collected for inclusion in ABAG's Projections, forecasting data which is key in examining affordability and in the T2035 Plan in general. He said that ABAG has been doing its Projections for 40 years – it is a forecast of employment, population, households and land use in the area. The forecast is done every two years; MTC's T2035 Plan will use ABAG's Projections 2007.

The subcommittee began a discussion of the equity analysis, and will focus its next meeting on what key equity indicators should be used for the T2035 equity analysis. The next meeting is scheduled for 2 p.m. on Tuesday, March 18. Ms. Kinman and Mr. Romero emphasized that it is important to attend all of the meetings because issues surrounding equity are complex and require a lot of study.

Subcommittee Reports (Continued)

T2035 Equity Analysis (continued): MCAC has been grappling with this equity analysis issue for about ten years, Mr. Romero said, and he felt that, in three months, it may not be possible to come up with an all-encompassing, final policy piece. He said the subcommittee will work with what is available now to be applied to the 2035 plan, and should work to ensure that the tools are there to be applied in a more comprehensive fashion in the future. Chair McGhee suggested the subcommittee produce a position paper. Mr. Allen moved that the T2035 Subcommittee continue to work with staff, after the T2035 equity analysis methodology is determined, to evaluate the methodology and determine if any future data is needed and ensure there is adequate time to collect that data. The motion was seconded and approved.

Internship: Subcommittee Vice chair Mr. Daugelli said there had been no meetings since the last report, but there are high school internship applications/information at the registration table. Application deadline is March 28. Flyers have been well-distributed, he said. Ms. Grove said that Jamila Williams has mailed out about 700 application packets to various schools and organizations, such as libraries, churches, nonprofit organizations, grocery stores and chambers of commerce. Staff is also scheduled to attend various high school career fairs and they are researching additional outreach sources. A press release was distributed to various contacts, including minority media lists, on March 4.

Advisory Council: Chair McGhee briefly reported on last month's Advisory Council meeting, which several MCAC members attended. He also spoke about the Joint Advisors Workshop that preceded the MCAC meeting; he said about 35 T2035 project ideas were presented and reviewed. A discussion on those ideas was deferred to later in the meeting when this item is on the agenda

Discussion of Transportation 2035 Joint Advisors Workshop

Ms. Alvarado, MTC Public Information Officer, reiterated that joint advisor workshops on T2035 were held in January, February and today to discuss regional projects for submission to MTC's T2035 Call for Projects. She reviewed the policy points presented at today's workshop as well as some new policy points brought up at the meeting. Following the presentation of the potential policy points, it was decided that further time was needed to study the information, conduct a more detailed discussion and identify the most important policies for MCAC to advocate at the next joint advisors workshop. It was moved and seconded to have a special meeting to discuss the 2035 policies. The motion was approved with one "no" vote and one abstention.

Transit-Oriented Development in Communities of Concern

Marisa Cravens, planner with the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG), discussed issues relating to FOCUS, which is a cooperative effort among regional agencies in the Bay Area to encourage future growth in areas near transit. ABAG seeks feedback from MCAC on one of the major issues for existing neighborhoods in communities of concern – potential displacement as a result of emerging transit-oriented development.

Transit-Oriented Development in Communities of Concern (Continued)

ABAG has launched a program called “Development without Displacement,” aimed at identifying the key concerns associated with displacement (such as gentrification and rising property values in transit areas) and attempting to provide solutions. The program will explore ways to maximize the benefits of new development for existing residents and reduce the loss of affordable homes and workspaces. Two grants will be available this spring to Priority Development Areas (PDA) to engage low-income residents in their planning efforts. ABAG staff seeks MCAC’s input on the structure and scope of the program. Questions for MCAC’s consideration and additional information were provided in the March packet, and Ms. Cravens is available for the members’ further comment.

MCAC member Bill Allen noted that San Mateo County’s coastal community of Half Moon Bay is experiencing displacement. Ms. Cravens said the city did not nominate itself as a Priority Development Area so it is not eligible for this program, but will inform them of other resources.

Carlos Romero stated that he believes the additional scope of this project’s work plan — mapping and analysis of Bay Area communities where there is potential for low-income residents to face displacement as a result of transit investments and new development — is the most important part of this work.

Community Liaison Officer’s Report

Chair McGhee congratulated Ms. Grove on her appointment as Community Liaison Officer (Ms. Alvarado will continue to act as CLO advisor). Ms. Grove discussed MTC’s current Request for Proposal to assist with a series of focus groups on transportation as part of the outreach for the T2035 Plan. Copies have been distributed to community-based organizations, nonprofit organizations and faith-based organizations; advisors are asked to spread the word to organizations with strong ties to communities of color or communities of concern. Deadline for proposals is 4 p.m. on March 24. She also discussed the Caltrans Call for Projects, MTC’s High School Internship recruitment and MTC’s awards program (see March packet for further details).

Other Business/Public Comment

Lindsay Imai of Urban Habitat reported that AC Transit is considering raising its fares and urged MCAC members to provide input as soon as possible. She said Muni is also considering a fare increase. She pointed out that MCAC’s input on policy discussion and selection of items from the project list for the Regional Transportation Plan is extremely important.

Candy Gayles, former MCAC member, urged that MCAC members encourage minority students who may not excel scholastically to still apply for a high school internship position.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:32 p.m. The next meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, April 8, 2008.