



**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL [info@mtc.ca.gov](mailto:info@mtc.ca.gov)  
WEB [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

**MTC Advisory Council  
January 9, 2008  
Minutes**

Margaret Okuzumi called the meeting to order at 12:37 p.m. In attendance were members Wendy Alfsen, John Cockle, Paul Cohen, Angela Columbo, Raphael Durr, David Grant, Mary Griffin, William Hastings, Richard Hedges, Kathryn Hughes, Cathy Jackson, Sherman Lewis, Xiao-Yun Lu, James McGhee, Eli Naor, Bob Planthold, and Don Rothblatt. Commissioner Giacomini also was in attendance.

**Minutes**

Mr. Richard Hedges moved approval, Ms. Mary Griffin seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

**Staff Report**

Ms. Therese Knudsen updated the committee on the Trade Corridor Improvement Fund. She stated that the California Transportation Commission (CTC) met on November 27, 2007, and is now requiring that public funding be tied to public benefit as demonstrated through a public/private benefit analysis. This should address Advisory Council concerns that there be improvements in passenger rail service in exchange for public funding.

She also mentioned that she received nominations for Advisory Council Chair (Bob Planthold) and Vice Chair (Cathy Jackson). She also received a nomination for Eli Naor to be either Chair or Vice Chair. She indicated that if there were additional nominations, they could be made prior to selection.

Ms. Knudsen noted that MTC and ABAG will be hosting several Station Area Planning workshops in late January. The South Bay Workshop will be held in the VTA Auditorium on Tuesday, January 22, 2008 from 1-3pm; The East Bay Workshop will be held in the MTC-ABAG Auditorium on Thursday, January 24, 2008 from 2-4pm; and, the North Bay Workshop will be held on Wednesday, January 30, 2008 from 9:30-11:30am at the Petaluma Community Center.

**Public Comment**

No public comment.

**Advisory Council Work Plan**

Ms. Margaret Okuzumi requested Committee input/changes to the Work Plan.

Committee comments include:

Part One of the Work Plan -

- Transportation Pricing Reform – Include transportation economics

- Regional Rail Planning and Implementation – Break it out to read a) Regional Rail/Passenger Rail (i.e. Caltrain, Capitol Corridor); b) Freight Rail; c) California High Speed Rail
- Would like to see better integration of non-motorized transportation (bicycle and pedestrian) in land use facilities and transit services
- Under Transportation/Land Use – change b to Implement and Evaluate the regional vision

Part Two of the Work Plan –

- #1 – cross out the words “so that” and end the sentence after “projects”
- #1 – add the words “livable communities” to the end of the second sentence.
- #3 – Revise as follows – What are the next steps that MTC might take in regarding a Regional Rail Plan. Delete the remainder of the sentence.

Mr. Rich Hedges moved approval of the Work Plan with the noted committee comments/modifications. Mr. Sherman Lewis seconded. Mr. Craig Yates, EDAC, suggested the committee to work on a plan that address emergency services plan – 511. The motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Margaret Okuzumi asked for committee input on the subcommittee criteria.

Committee comments include:

- Committees should be a minimum of 3 members instead of 4
- Committees can continue with as few as 2 members
- Remove the sentence about teleconferencing - committee meetings can be done by email, and teleconferencing

Mr. Sherman Lewis moved approval of the subcommittee criteria with the noted committee comments. Ms. Mary Griffin seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Bob Planthold moved approval of the following five subcommittees:

1) Sustainable Transportation, Chaired by William Hastings – members: Rich Hedges, Paul Cohen, Wendy Alfsen and Xaio Yun-Lu

2) Transportation Pricing & Economics – members Sherman Lewis, and Raphael Durr

3) Land Use – members Rich Hedges, Don Rothblatt, Kathryn Hughes, Mary Griffin, John Cockle, Bob Planthold and James McGhee

4) Evaluation – members Margaret Okuzumi, Wendy Alfsen, William Hastings, James McGhee, Xaio Yun-Lu,

5) Trade Corridors – Chair – Paul Silvestri - members Raphael Durr, John Cockle, and Paul Cohen.

Mr. Sherman Lewis seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

## **Officer Nominations**

Mr. Bob Planthold was voted in as MTC Advisory Council Chair, and Ms. Cathy Jackson was voted in as MTC Advisory Council Vice-Chair. Their official term begins at the February 13, 2008 meeting.

## **Transportation 2035 (T2035)**

Ms. Ashley Nguyen stated that MTC will be holding joint advisory workshops, comprised of attendees of all three advisory committees – Advisory Council, the Elderly and Disabled Advisory Committee and the Minority Citizens Advisory Committee – to discuss T2035 policies. She noted that staff would like to hold monthly meetings as needed through April. The next workshop will be held on January 17 in MTC's Auditorium.

Ms. Nguyen also discussed performance targets, which are: Maintenance and Safety – to improve maintenance, and reduce collisions/fatalities; Reliability/Freight – reduce per-capita delay by 20% from today by 2035; Security – the region will continue to improve disaster and security preparedness; Clean Air Climate Protection – reduce emissions; Access Livable Communities – decrease by 10% the combined share of low-income and lower-middle income residents' household income consumed by transportation and housing.

Ms. Nguyen noted that the following three questions: 1) should staff adopt these targets, or 2) should staff adopt less ambitious targets?, and 3) Should staff add targets to the three goals that have no targets, which are maintenance and safety goal, the security goal and the freight goal, were asked at the Commission workshop in November, that three advisory committee's, as well of the Partnership Board. The general consensus that staff received was that staff should adopt these targets, that they should not make them less ambitious – aim high so staff has something to make progress towards, and to also have targets for the other goals.

She stated that staff is proposing to carry forth the five targets that have been tested, keep them as the targets and introduce two new ones to cover the maintenance and safety goal.

She also stated that staff is proposing two sets of performance objectives. One dealing with the maintenance aspect and the other dealing with the safety aspect. Thus far, staff has come up with a maintenance goal for local streets and roads looking at insuring that the pavement condition index is 75 or greater for local streets and roads. Staff is also looking at a performance objective that reduces collisions and fatalities – one that reduces fatalities from motor vehicle collisions by 15% and the other is to reduce bicycle and pedestrian collisions associated with motor vehicle collisions by 25%.

Committee comments include:

- The pavement responsibility needs to fall more on the local property owners than on the street users
- Collisions/Fatalities – staff would have a stronger statistical base is they look at injury accidents and fatalities
- Over the long haul, collisions/fatalities rate is a good indicator
- Reduced delay is better wording then reduced congestion – it targets a narrow segment, however, it doesn't get to multi-modality and doesn't count other trips

- Freight – Why not say goods movement? Delay and capacity measurements could be used. If delay is going to be the measure, it ought to be the delay in the movement of goods and not overall delay in the system
- Methodological concerns: There needs to be prioritization at one point in time and over time – how quickly does desirability deteriorate over time – what is the half-life? How does value decline over time?
- What about non-economic benefits – i.e. quality of neighborhoods?
- Income distribution – should be fully aware of trade-offs if trading off for efficiency
- In terms on quality of neighborhoods – may be able to get some soft outcomes through survey research

Mr. Bob Planthold moved that the Advisory Council requests staff to find some way to include some form of serious injury data in their work on goals and performance objectives. Mr. Sherman Lewis seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Lisa Klein presented an overview of an approach to project evaluation. MTC intends to identify the most cost-effective projects with respect to the Transportation 2035 Performance Objectives, and to compare projects and programs directly and quantitatively.

She stated that the proposed approach is to compare project costs and benefits. As much as possible, benefits would be valued monetarily, based on economic research, and combined in a single benefit cost measure. The combined benefit-cost measure would include the Performance Objectives for reductions of delay, greenhouse gas and particulate matter emissions and fatal collisions.

Alternative measures would be required for the remaining performance objectives to reduce vehicle miles traveled and improve maintenance: 1) Cost per reduction in vehicle miles traveled would be reported separately; and 2) Develop an alternative benefit-cost measure for maintenance. Staff believes the affordability objective can be more meaningfully addressed at a policy level than through the project evaluation and is not currently proposing project performance criteria for this objective.

Lisa Klein will return in February to continue the Performance Measure discussion.

### **State Transit Assistance Distribution Policy Options**

Ms. Theresa Romell commented on the two options that staff developed for distributing funds in four categories: 1) Lifeline, 2) Regional Coordination, 3) Small Operators, and 4) Regional Paratransit. Option 1 was to roll the funding through the existing consolidated formula and Option 2 was to take some of the increment that was provided to the program through SB717 and improve the position of the Regional Paratransit Program and the northern county small operators category. She noted that EDAC was in support of Option 2, and MCAC was split, but the majority of their members supported Option 2 as well.

In closing, she stated that the Programming and Allocations Committee recommended that Option 2 be forwarded to the full commission for approval.

Ms. Wendy Alfsen requested that the Advisory Committee recommend to MTC that Option 2 be adopted. There was a consensus in favor of Option 2.

**Other Business/Public Comment**

There was no other business. The next meeting of the Advisory Council is scheduled for February 13, 2008. The meeting was adjourned at 2:36 p.m.

J:\COMMITTEE\Advisory\2008\2-08\2\_minutes.doc